

University of Groningen

## Numerical methods for studying transition probabilities in stochastic ocean-climate models

Baars, Sven

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*

2019

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Baars, S. (2019). *Numerical methods for studying transition probabilities in stochastic ocean-climate models*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. Rijksuniversiteit Groningen.

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

# PUBLICATIONS AND PREPRINTS

- S. Baars, J. Viebahn, T. Mulder, C. Kuehn, F. Wubs, and H. Dijkstra. Continuation of Probability Density Functions Using a Generalized Lyapunov Approach. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 336:627–643, May 2017. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2017.02.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2017.02.021).
- S. Baars, D. Castellana, F. Wubs, and H. A. Dijkstra. Application of Adaptive Multilevel Splitting to High-Dimensional Dynamical Systems. *preprint*, 2019a.
- S. Baars, M. van der Klok, W. Song, J. Thies, A. Veldman, and F. Wubs. Performance of the HYMLS Multilevel ILU Preconditioner on 3D Flow Equations. *submitted to Computers & Mathematics with Applications*, 2019b.
- S. Baars, M. van der Klok, J. Thies, and F. Wubs. SMILU: a Staggered-Grid Multi-Level ILU for Steady Coupled Fluid-Transport Equations. *preprint*, 2019c.
- B. Carpentieri, J. Liao, M. Sosonkina, A. Bonfiglioli, and S. Baars. Using the VBARMS Method in Parallel Computing. *Parallel Computing*, 57:197–211, Sep 2016. doi: [10.1016/j.parco.2016.01.005](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.parco.2016.01.005).
- H. A. Dijkstra, A. Tantet, J. Viebahn, E. Mulder, M. Hebbink, D. Castellana, H. van den Pol, J. Frank, S. Baars, F. Wubs, M. Chekroun, and C. Kuehn. A Numerical Framework To Understand Transitions in High-Dimensional Stochastic Dynamical Systems. *Dynamics and Statistics of the Climate System*, 1(1), 2016. doi: [10.1093/climsys/dzw003](https://doi.org/10.1093/climsys/dzw003).

- T. E. Mulder, S. Baars, F. W. Wubs, and H. A. Dijkstra. Stochastic Marine Ice Sheet Variability. *Journal of Fluid Mechanics*, 843:748–777, Mar 2018. doi: [10.1017/jfm.2018.148](https://doi.org/10.1017/jfm.2018.148).
- W. Song, F. Wubs, J. Thies, and S. Baars. Numerical Bifurcation Analysis of a 3D Turing-Type Reaction–Diffusion Model. *Communications in Nonlinear Science and Numerical Simulation*, 60:145–164, Jul 2018. doi: [10.1016/j.cnsns.2018.01.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cnsns.2018.01.003).

# SOFTWARE

This chapter contains a list of software that has been developed, or has been contributed to, as part of this work.

**FVM** A finite volume package which contains implementations of a lid-driven cavity, a differentially heated cavity, Rayleigh-Bénard convection, and convection in a differentially heated rotating cavity. <https://bitbucket.org/hymls/hymls/src/master/fvm>

**HYMLS** A Hybrid direct/iterative solver for the Jacobian of the incompressible Navier-Stokes equations on structured grids. The implementation of the preconditioner and the domain decomposition are described in this thesis. <https://github.com/nlesc-smcm/hymls>

**I-EMIC** An Implicit Earth System Model of Intermediate Complexity. The I-EMIC contains a number of implicit submodels coupled through a modular framework. At the center of the coupled model is the implicit primitive equation ocean model THCM that has been used in the past to study bifurcations in the thermohaline circulation. This package interfaces to parallel C++ versions of RAILS and the methods for computing transition probabilities that were discussed in this thesis. <https://github.com/nlesc-smcm/i-emic>

**JDQZ++** A templated C++ implementation of the JDQZ generalized eigenvalue problem solver. <https://github.com/erik808/jdqzpp>

**MOxUnit** A lightweight unit test framework for Matlab and GNU Octave. <https://github.com/MOxUnit/MOxUnit>

- OpenBLAS** An optimized BLAS library based on GotoBLAS2 1.13, BSD version. <http://www.openblas.net>
- PHIST** A Pipelined Hybrid Parallel Iterative Solver Toolkit. PHIST provides implementations of and interfaces to block iterative solvers for sparse linear and eigenvalue problems. <https://bitbucket.org/essex/phist>
- RAILS** An implementation of the Residual Approximation-based Iterative Lyapunov Solver as described in this thesis in Matlab and a parallel implementation in C++. <https://github.com/Sbte/RAILS>
- Transitions** A Matlab implementation of the methods for computing transition probabilities as described in this thesis. <https://github.com/Sbte/transitions>
- Trilinos** The Trilinos Project is an effort to develop algorithms and enabling technologies within an object-oriented software framework for the solution of large-scale, complex multi-physics engineering and scientific problems. A unique design feature of Trilinos is its focus on packages. <https://trilinos.org>

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

- J. I. Aliaga, M. Bollhöfer, A. F. Martín, and E. S. Quintana-Ortí. Design, Tuning and Evaluation of Parallel Multilevel ILU Preconditioners. In *High Performance Computing for Computational Science VECPAR 2008*, pages 314–327. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2008. doi: [10.1007/978-3-540-92859-1\\_28](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-92859-1_28).
- K. Atkinson. *An Introduction To Numerical Analysis*. Wiley, New York, 1988. ISBN 9780471624899
- S. Baars, J. Viebahn, T. Mulder, C. Kuehn, F. Wubs, and H. Dijkstra. Continuation of Probability Density Functions Using a Generalized Lyapunov Approach. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 336:627–643, May 2017. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2017.02.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2017.02.021).
- S. Baars, D. Castellana, F. Wubs, and H. A. Dijkstra. Application of Adaptive Multilevel Splitting to High-Dimensional Dynamical Systems. *preprint*, 2019a.
- S. Baars, M. van der Klok, W. Song, J. Thies, A. Veldman, and F. Wubs. Performance of the HYMLS Multilevel ILU Preconditioner on 3D Flow Equations. *submitted to Computers & Mathematics with Applications*, 2019b.
- S. Baars, M. van der Klok, J. Thies, and F. Wubs. SMILU: a Staggered-Grid Multi-Level ILU for Steady Coupled Fluid-Transport Equations. *preprint*, 2019c.
- R. H. Bartels and G. W. Stewart. Solution of the Matrix Equation  $AX + XB = C$  [f4]. *Communications of the ACM*, 15(9):820–826, Sep 1972. doi: [10.1145/361573.361582](https://doi.org/10.1145/361573.361582).

- G. K. Batchelor. *An Introduction to Fluid Dynamics*. Cambridge University Press, 2000. ISBN 9780511800955. doi: [10.1017/cbo9780511800955](https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511800955).
- E. Bavier, M. Hoemmen, S. Rajamanickam, and H. Thornquist. Amesos2 and Belos: Direct and Iterative Solvers for Large Sparse Linear Systems. *Scientific Programming*, 20(3):241–255, 2012. doi: [10.1155/2012/243875](https://doi.org/10.1155/2012/243875).
- P. Benner, V. Mehrmann, V. Sima, S. V. Huffel, and A. Varga. SLICOT-A Subroutine Library in Systems and Control Theory. *Applied and Computational Control, Signals, and Circuits*, pages 499–539, 1999. doi: [10.1007/978-1-4612-0571-5\\_10](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4612-0571-5_10).
- P. Benner, P. Kürschner, and J. Saak. Self-Generating and Efficient Shift Parameters in ADI Methods for Large Lyapunov and Sylvester Equations. *Electron. Trans. Numer. Anal.*, 43:142–162, 2014. doi: [10.17617/2.2071065](https://doi.org/10.17617/2.2071065).
- M. Benzi and M. A. Olshanskii. An Augmented Lagrangian-Based Approach To the Oseen Problem. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 28(6):2095–2113, Jan 2006. doi: [10.1137/050646421](https://doi.org/10.1137/050646421).
- M. Benzi, G. H. Golub, and J. Liesen. Numerical Solution of Saddle Point Problems. *Acta Numerica*, 14:1–137, May 2005. doi: [10.1017/s0962492904000212](https://doi.org/10.1017/s0962492904000212).
- R. H. Bisseling. *Parallel Scientific Computation*. Oxford University Press, Mar 2004. ISBN 9780198529392. doi: [10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198529392.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198529392.001.0001).
- M. Bollhöfer and Y. Saad. Multilevel Preconditioners Constructed From Inverse-Based ILUs. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 27(5):1627–1650, Jan 2006. doi: [10.1137/040608374](https://doi.org/10.1137/040608374).
- E. F. F. Botta and F. W. Wubs. Matrix Renumbering ILU: an Effective Algebraic Multilevel ILU Preconditioner for Sparse Matrices. *SIAM Journal on Matrix Analysis and Applications*, 20(4):1007–1026, Jan 1999. doi: [10.1137/s0895479897319301](https://doi.org/10.1137/s0895479897319301).
- F. Bouchet and J. Reygner. Generalisation of the Eyring–Kramers Transition Rate Formula To Irreversible Diffusion Processes. *Annales Henri Poincaré*, 17(12):3499–3532, Jun 2016. doi: [10.1007/s00023-016-0507-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00023-016-0507-4).
- F. Bouchet, J. Laurie, and O. Zaboronski. Langevin Dynamics, Large Deviations and Instantons for the Quasi-Geostrophic Model and Two-Dimensional Euler Equations. *Journal of Statistical Physics*, 156(6):1066–1092, Jul 2014. doi: [10.1007/s10955-014-1052-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10955-014-1052-5).
- C.-E. Bréhier, M. Gazeau, L. Goudenège, T. Lelièvre, and M. Rousset. Unbiasedness of Some Generalized Adaptive Multilevel Splitting Algorithms. *The Annals of Applied Probability*, 26(6):3559–3601, Dec 2016. doi: [10.1214/16-aap1185](https://doi.org/10.1214/16-aap1185).

- G. Carey and R. Krishnan. Convergence of Iterative Methods in Penalty Finite Element Approximation of the Navier-Stokes Equations. *Computer Methods in Applied Mechanics and Engineering*, 60(1):1–29, Jan 1987. doi: [10.1016/0045-7825\(87\)90127-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0045-7825(87)90127-7).
- F. Cérou and A. Guyader. Adaptive Multilevel Splitting for Rare Event Analysis. *Stochastic Analysis and Applications*, 25(2):417–443, Feb 2007. doi: [10.1080/07362990601139628](https://doi.org/10.1080/07362990601139628).
- F. Cérou, A. Guyader, T. Lelièvre, and D. Pommier. A Multiple Replica Approach To Simulate Reactive Trajectories. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 134(5):054108, Feb 2011. doi: [10.1063/1.3518708](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.3518708).
- P. Cessi. A Simple Box Model of Stochastically Forced Thermohaline Flow. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 24(9):1911–1920, Sep 1994. doi: [10.1175/1520-0485\(1994\)024<1911:asbmos>2.0.co;2](https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0485(1994)024<1911:asbmos>2.0.co;2).
- M. D. Chekroun, H. Liu, and S. Wang. *Stochastic Parameterizing Manifolds and Non-Markovian Reduced Equations*. Springer International Publishing, 2015. ISBN 9783319125206. doi: [10.1007/978-3-319-12520-6](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-12520-6).
- G. Cowan. *Statistical Data Analysis*. Clarendon Press, 1998. ISBN 0198501552.
- M. A. Crisfield. *Nonlinear Finite Element Analysis of Solids and Structures, Vol 1: Basic Concepts*, chapter 1. Wiley, 1991.
- B. Cushman-Roisin and J.-M. Beckers. *Introduction To Geophysical Fluid Dynamics - Physical and Numerical Aspects*. Elsevier, 2011. ISBN 9780120887590
- E. C. Cyr, J. N. Shadid, and R. S. Tuminaro. Stabilization and Scalable Block Preconditioning for the Navier–Stokes Equations. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 231(2):345–363, Jan 2012. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2011.09.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2011.09.001).
- T. Damm. Direct Methods and ADI-Preconditioned Krylov Subspace Methods for Generalized Lyapunov Equations. *Numerical Linear Algebra with Applications*, 15(9):853–871, Nov 2008. doi: [10.1002/nla.603](https://doi.org/10.1002/nla.603).
- A. DasGupta, T. T. Cai, and L. D. Brown. Interval Estimation for a Binomial Proportion. *Statistical Science*, 16(2):101–133, May 2001. doi: [10.1214/ss/1009213286](https://doi.org/10.1214/ss/1009213286).
- T. A. Davis and E. P. Natarajan. Algorithm 907. *ACM Transactions on Mathematical Software*, 37(3):1–17, Sep 2010. doi: [10.1145/1824801.1824814](https://doi.org/10.1145/1824801.1824814).
- H. A. Dijkstra. *Nonlinear Physical Oceanography*. Springer Netherlands, 2005. ISBN 9781402022623. doi: [10.1007/1-4020-2263-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/1-4020-2263-8).
- H. A. Dijkstra. *Nonlinear Climate Dynamics*. Cambridge University Press, 2013. ISBN 9781139034135. doi: [10.1017/cbo9781139034135](https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9781139034135).



- H. A. Dijkstra, L. M. Frankcombe, and A. S. von der Heydt. A Stochastic Dynamical Systems View of the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences*, 366(1875):2543–2558, Jul 2008. doi: [10.1098/rsta.2008.0031](https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2008.0031).
- H. A. Dijkstra, F. W. Wubs, A. K. Cliffe, E. Doedel, I. F. Dragomirescu, B. Eckhardt, A. Y. Gelfgat, A. L. Hazel, V. Lucarini, A. G. Salinger, E. T. Phipps, J. Sanchez-Umbria, H. Schuttelaars, L. S. Tuckerman, and U. Thiele. Numerical Bifurcation Methods and Their Application To Fluid Dynamics: Analysis Beyond Simulation. *Communications in Computational Physics*, 15(01): 1–45, Jan 2014. doi: [10.4208/cicp.240912.180613a](https://doi.org/10.4208/cicp.240912.180613a).
- H. A. Dijkstra, A. Tantet, J. Viebahn, E. Mulder, M. Hebbink, D. Castellana, H. van den Pol, J. Frank, S. Baars, F. Wubs, M. Chekroun, and C. Kuehn. A Numerical Framework To Understand Transitions in High-Dimensional Stochastic Dynamical Systems. *Dynamics and Statistics of the Climate System*, 1(1), 2016. doi: [10.1093/climsys/dzw003](https://doi.org/10.1093/climsys/dzw003).
- P. D. Ditlevsen and S. J. Johnsen. Tipping Points: Early Warning and Wishful Thinking. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37(19):n/a–n/a, Oct 2010. doi: [10.1029/2010gl1044486](https://doi.org/10.1029/2010gl1044486).
- V. Druskin and V. Simoncini. Adaptive Rational Krylov Subspaces for Large-Scale Dynamical Systems. *Systems & Control Letters*, 60(8):546–560, Aug 2011. doi: [10.1016/j.sysconle.2011.04.013](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sysconle.2011.04.013).
- V. Druskin, V. Simoncini, and M. Zaslavsky. Adaptive Tangential Interpolation in Rational Krylov Subspaces for MIMO Dynamical Systems. *SIAM Journal on Matrix Analysis and Applications*, 35(2):476–498, Jan 2014. doi: [10.1137/120898784](https://doi.org/10.1137/120898784).
- W. E, W. Ren, and E. Vanden-Eijnden. String Method for the Study of Rare Events. *Physical Review B*, 66(5), Aug 2002. doi: [10.1103/physrevb.66.052301](https://doi.org/10.1103/physrevb.66.052301).
- W. E, W. Ren, and E. Vanden-Eijnden. Minimum Action Method for the Study of Rare Events. *Communications on Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 57(5):637–656, 2004. doi: [10.1002/cpa.20005](https://doi.org/10.1002/cpa.20005).
- W. E, W. Ren, and E. Vanden-Eijnden. Simplified and Improved String Method for Computing the Minimum Energy Paths in Barrier-Crossing Events. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 126(16):164103, Apr 2007. doi: [10.1063/1.2720838](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.2720838).
- H. Elman, V. Howle, J. Shadid, R. Shuttleworth, and R. Tuminaro. A Taxonomy and Comparison of Parallel Block Multi-Level Preconditioners for the Incompressible Navier–Stokes Equations. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 227(3):1790–1808, Jan 2008. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2007.09.026](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2007.09.026).

- H. Elman, D. Silvester, and A. Wathen. *Finite Elements and Fast Iterative Solvers*. Oxford University Press, Jun 2014. ISBN 9780199678792. doi: [10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199678792.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199678792.001.0001).
- H. C. Elman, D. J. Silvester, and A. J. Wathen. Performance and Analysis of Saddle Point Preconditioners for the Discrete Steady-State Navier–Stokes Equations. *Numerische Mathematik*, 90(4):665–688, Feb 2002. doi: [10.1007/s002110100300](https://doi.org/10.1007/s002110100300).
- H. Eyring. The Activated Complex in Chemical Reactions. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 3(2):107–115, 1935. doi: [10.1063/1.1749604](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1749604).
- Y. Feldman and A. Y. Gelfgat. Oscillatory Instability of a Three-Dimensional Lid-Driven Flow in a Cube. *Physics of Fluids*, 22(9):093602, Sep 2010. doi: [10.1063/1.3487476](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.3487476).
- M. I. Freidlin and A. D. Wentzell. *Random Perturbations of Dynamical Systems*. Springer-Verlag, New York,, 1998. doi: [10.1007/978-1-4612-0611-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4612-0611-8).
- F. Freitas, J. Rommes, and N. Martins. Gramian-Based Reduction Method Applied To Large Sparse Power System Descriptor Models. *IEEE Transactions on Power Systems*, 23(3):1258–1270, Aug 2008. doi: [10.1109/tpwrs.2008.926693](https://doi.org/10.1109/tpwrs.2008.926693).
- C. W. Gardiner. *Handbook of Stochastic Methods for Physics, Chemistry and the Natural Sciences*. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 1985. ISBN 9783662024522. doi: [10.1007/978-3-662-02452-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-662-02452-2).
- P. W. Glynn and W. Whitt. The Asymptotic Efficiency of Simulation Estimators. *Operations Research*, 40(3):505–520, Jun 1992. doi: [10.1287/opre.40.3.505](https://doi.org/10.1287/opre.40.3.505).
- G. H. Golub and C. F. Van Loan. *Matrix Computations*. Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996. ISBN 9781421407944
- T. Grafke, T. Schäfer, and E. Vanden-Eijnden. *Long Term Effects of Small Random Perturbations on Dynamical Systems: Theoretical and Computational Tools*, pages 17–55. Springer New York, 2017. ISBN 9781493969692. doi: [10.1007/978-1-4939-6969-2\\_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4939-6969-2_2).
- S. M. Griffies. *Fundamentals of Ocean Climate Models*. Princeton University Press, 2004. ISBN 0691187126. doi: [10.2307/j.ctv301gzg](https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv301gzg).
- P. Hänggi, P. Talkner, and M. Borkovec. Reaction-Rate Theory: Fifty Years After Kramers. *Reviews of Modern Physics*, 62(2):251–341, Apr 1990. doi: [10.1103/revmodphys.62.251](https://doi.org/10.1103/revmodphys.62.251).

- X. He, C. Vuik, and C. M. Klaij. Combining the Augmented Lagrangian Preconditioner With the Simple Schur Complement Approximation. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 40(3):A1362–A1385, Jan 2018. doi: [10.1137/17m1144775](https://doi.org/10.1137/17m1144775).
- G. Henkelman and H. Jónsson. Improved Tangent Estimate in the Nudged Elastic Band Method for Finding Minimum Energy Paths and Saddle Points. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 113(22):9978–9985, Dec 2000. doi: [10.1063/1.1323224](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1323224).
- G. Henkelman, B. P. Uberuaga, and H. Jónsson. A Climbing Image Nudged Elastic Band Method for Finding Saddle Points and Minimum Energy Paths. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 113(22):9901–9904, Dec 2000. doi: [10.1063/1.1329672](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1329672).
- M. A. Heroux, E. T. Phipps, A. G. Salinger, H. K. Thornquist, R. S. Tuminaro, J. M. Willenbring, A. Williams, K. S. Stanley, R. A. Bartlett, V. E. Howle, R. J. Hoekstra, J. J. Hu, T. G. Kolda, R. B. Lehoucq, K. R. Long, and R. P. Pawlowski. An Overview of the Trilinos Project. *ACM Transactions on Mathematical Software*, 31(3):397–423, Sep 2005. doi: [10.1145/1089014.1089021](https://doi.org/10.1145/1089014.1089021).
- D. J. Higham. Mean-Square and Asymptotic Stability of the Stochastic Theta Method. *SIAM Journal on Numerical Analysis*, 38(3):753–769, Jan 2000. doi: [10.1137/s003614299834736x](https://doi.org/10.1137/s003614299834736x).
- D. J. Higham. An Algorithmic Introduction To Numerical Simulation of Stochastic Differential Equations. *SIAM Review*, 43(3):525–546, Jan 2001. doi: [10.1137/s0036144500378302](https://doi.org/10.1137/s0036144500378302).
- H. Kahn and T. E. Harris. Estimation of Particle Transmission By Random Sampling. *National Bureau of Standards applied mathematics series*, 12:27–30, 1951.
- G. Karypis and V. Kumar. A Fast and High Quality Multilevel Scheme for Partitioning Irregular Graphs. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 20(1):359–392, Jan 1998. doi: [10.1137/s1064827595287997](https://doi.org/10.1137/s1064827595287997).
- D. Kay, D. Loghin, and A. Wathen. A Preconditioner for the Steady-State Navier–Stokes Equations. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 24(1):237–256, Jan 2002. doi: [10.1137/s106482759935808x](https://doi.org/10.1137/s106482759935808x).
- H. B. Keller. Numerical Solution of Bifurcation and Nonlinear Eigenvalue Problems. In P. H. Rabinowitz, editor, *Applications of Bifurcation Theory*, pages 359–384. Academic Press, New York, U.S.A., 1977.
- C. M. Klaij and C. Vuik. SIMPLE-Type Preconditioners for Cell-Centered, Colocated Finite Volume Discretization of Incompressible Reynolds-Averaged Navier–Stokes Equations. *International Journal for Numerical Methods in Fluids*, 71(7):830–849, May 2012. doi: [10.1002/flid.3686](https://doi.org/10.1002/flid.3686).

- D. Kleinman. On an Iterative Technique for Riccati Equation Computations. *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, 13(1):114–115, Feb 1968. doi: [10.1109/tac.1968.1098829](https://doi.org/10.1109/tac.1968.1098829).
- P. E. Kloeden and E. Platen. *Numerical Solution of Stochastic Differential Equations*. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 1992. ISBN 9783662126165. doi: [10.1007/978-3-662-12616-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-662-12616-5).
- M. van der Klok. *Skew Partitioning for the Hybrid Multilevel Solver*. Bachelor's thesis, University of Groningen, Jul 2017.
- H. Kramers. Brownian Motion in a Field of Force and the Diffusion Model of Chemical Reactions. *Physica*, 7(4):284–304, Apr 1940. doi: [10.1016/s0031-8914\(40\)90098-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0031-8914(40)90098-2).
- C. Kuehn. A Mathematical Framework for Critical Transitions: Bifurcations, Fast-Slow Systems and Stochastic Dynamics. *Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena*, 240(12):1020–1035, Jun 2011. doi: [10.1016/j.physd.2011.02.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physd.2011.02.012).
- C. Kuehn. Deterministic Continuation of Stochastic Metastable Equilibria Via Lyapunov Equations and Ellipsoids. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 34(3):A1635–A1658, Jan 2012. doi: [10.1137/110839874](https://doi.org/10.1137/110839874).
- C. Kuehn. Numerical Continuation and SPDE Stability for the 2D Cubic-Quintic Allen–Cahn Equation. *SIAM/ASA Journal on Uncertainty Quantification*, 3(1):762–789, Jan 2015. doi: [10.1137/140993685](https://doi.org/10.1137/140993685).
- C. Lanczos. An Iteration Method for the Solution of the Eigenvalue Problem of Linear Differential and Integral Operators. *Journal of Research of the National Bureau of Standards*, 45(4):255, Oct 1950. doi: [10.6028/jres.045.026](https://doi.org/10.6028/jres.045.026).
- L. Landau and E. Lifshitz. *Fluid Mechanics*. Elsevier, 1959. ISBN 9780080291420
- J. Laurie and F. Bouchet. Computation of Rare Transitions in the Barotropic Quasi-Geostrophic Equations. *New Journal of Physics*, 17(1):015009, Jan 2015. doi: [10.1088/1367-2630/17/1/015009](https://doi.org/10.1088/1367-2630/17/1/015009).
- T. M. Lenton. Early Warning of Climate Tipping Points. *Nature Climate Change*, 1(4):201–209, Jun 2011. doi: [10.1038/nclimate1143](https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1143).
- T. M. Lenton, H. Held, E. Kriegler, J. W. Hall, W. Lucht, S. Rahmstorf, and H. J. Schellnhuber. Tipping Elements in the Earth's Climate System. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 105(6):1786–1793, Feb 2008. doi: [10.1073/pnas.0705414105](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0705414105).
- T. Lestang, F. Ragone, C.-E. Bréhier, C. Herbert, and F. Bouchet. Computing Return Times Or Return Periods With Rare Event Algorithms. *Journal of Statistical Mechanics: Theory and Experiment*, 2018(4):043213, Apr 2018. doi: [10.1088/1742-5468/aab856](https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-5468/aab856).

- Y. Liu, M. Jacquelin, P. Ghysels, and X. S. Li. Highly Scalable Distributed-Memory Sparse Triangular Solution Algorithms. *2018 Proceedings of the Seventh SIAM Workshop on Combinatorial Scientific Computing*, pages 87–96, Jan 2018. doi: [10.1137/1.9781611975215.9](https://doi.org/10.1137/1.9781611975215.9).
- R. März. Canonical Projectors for Linear Differential Algebraic Equations. *Computers & Mathematics with Applications*, 31(4-5):121–135, Feb 1996. doi: [10.1016/0898-1221\(95\)00224-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/0898-1221(95)00224-3).
- M. van der Mheen, H. A. Dijkstra, A. Gozolchiani, M. den Toom, Q. Feng, J. Kurths, and E. Hernandez-Garcia. Interaction Network Based Early Warning Indicators for the Atlantic MOC Collapse. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 40(11):2714–2719, Jun 2013. doi: [10.1002/grl.50515](https://doi.org/10.1002/grl.50515).
- A. H. Monahan, J. Alexander, and A. J. Weaver. Stochastic Models of the Meridional Overturning Circulation: Time Scales and Patterns of Variability. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences*, 366(1875):2525–2542, Jul 2008. doi: [10.1098/rsta.2008.0045](https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2008.0045).
- P. D. Moral. *Mean Field Simulation for Monte Carlo Integration*. Chapman and Hall/CRC, May 2013. ISBN 9781466504172. doi: [10.1201/b14924](https://doi.org/10.1201/b14924).
- P. D. Moral and J. Garnier. Genealogical Particle Analysis of Rare Events. *The Annals of Applied Probability*, 15(4):2496–2534, Nov 2005. doi: [10.1214/105051605000000566](https://doi.org/10.1214/105051605000000566).
- T. E. Mulder. *Design and Bifurcation Analysis of Implicit Earth System Models*. PhD thesis, Utrecht University, Jun 2019.
- T. E. Mulder, S. Baars, F. W. Wubs, and H. A. Dijkstra. Stochastic Marine Ice Sheet Variability. *Journal of Fluid Mechanics*, 843:748–777, Mar 2018. doi: [10.1017/jfm.2018.148](https://doi.org/10.1017/jfm.2018.148).
- A. Navarra and V. Simoncini. *A Guide to Empirical Orthogonal Functions for Climate Data Analysis*. Springer Netherlands, 2010. ISBN 9789048137022. doi: [10.1007/978-90-481-3702-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-481-3702-2).
- A. de Niet, F. Wubs, A. T. van Scheltinga, and H. A. Dijkstra. A Tailored Solver for Bifurcation Analysis of Ocean-Climate Models. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 227(1):654–679, Nov 2007. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2007.08.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2007.08.006).
- A. C. de Niet and F. W. Wubs. Numerically Stable LDLT-Factorization of F-Type Saddle Point Matrices. *IMA Journal of Numerical Analysis*, 29(1):208–234, Feb 2008. doi: [10.1093/imanum/drn005](https://doi.org/10.1093/imanum/drn005).

- T. Penzl. A Cyclic Low-Rank Smith Method for Large Sparse Lyapunov Equations. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 21(4):1401–1418, Jan 1999. doi: [10.1137/s1064827598347666](https://doi.org/10.1137/s1064827598347666).
- S. Rahmstorf. The Thermohaline Ocean Circulation: a System With Dangerous Thresholds? *Climatic Change*, 46(3):247–256, Aug 2000. doi: [10.1023/a:1005648404783](https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1005648404783).
- J. Rolland and E. Simonnet. Statistical Behaviour of Adaptive Multilevel Splitting Algorithms in Simple Models. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 283: 541–558, Feb 2015. doi: [10.1016/j.jcp.2014.12.009](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcp.2014.12.009).
- J. Rolland, F. Bouchet, and E. Simonnet. Computing Transition Rates for the 1-D Stochastic Ginzburg–Landau–Allen–Cahn Equation for Finite-Amplitude Noise With a Rare Event Algorithm. *Journal of Statistical Physics*, 162(2):277–311, Nov 2015. doi: [10.1007/s10955-015-1417-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10955-015-1417-4).
- M. N. Rosenbluth and A. W. Rosenbluth. Monte Carlo Calculation of the Average Extension of Molecular Chains. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 23(2): 356–359, Feb 1955. doi: [10.1063/1.1741967](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1741967).
- G. Rubino and B. Tuffin. *Rare Event Simulation using Monte Carlo Methods*. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Mar 2009. ISBN 9780470772690. doi: [10.1002/9780470745403](https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470745403).
- Y. Saad. Numerical Solution of Large Lyapunov Equations. In *Signal Processing, Scattering and Operator Theory, and Numerical Methods, Proc. MTNS-89*, pages 503–511. Birkhauser, 1990.
- Y. Saad and M. H. Schultz. GMRES: a Generalized Minimal Residual Algorithm for Solving Nonsymmetric Linear Systems. *SIAM Journal on Scientific and Statistical Computing*, 7(3):856–869, Jul 1986. doi: [10.1137/0907058](https://doi.org/10.1137/0907058).
- J. Saak, M. Köhler, and P. Benner. M-M.E.S.S.-1.0.1 - the Matrix Equation Sparse Solver Library, Apr. 2016. doi: [10.5281/zenodo.50575](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.50575).
- M. Sala and M. A. Heroux. Robust algebraic preconditioners using IFPACK 3.0. Technical report, Sandia National Laboratories, Jan 2005.
- M. Sala, K. S. Stanley, and M. A. Heroux. On the Design of Interfaces To Sparse Direct Solvers. *ACM Transactions on Mathematical Software*, 34(2):1–22, Mar 2008. doi: [10.1145/1326548.1326551](https://doi.org/10.1145/1326548.1326551).
- T. P. Sapsis and P. F. Lermusiaux. Dynamically Orthogonal Field Equations for Continuous Stochastic Dynamical Systems. *Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena*, 238(23-24):2347–2360, Dec 2009. doi: [10.1016/j.physd.2009.09.017](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physd.2009.09.017).

- P. D. Sardeshmukh and P. Sura. Reconciling Non-Gaussian Climate Statistics With Linear Dynamics. *Journal of Climate*, 22(5):1193–1207, Mar 2009. doi: [10.1175/2008jcli2358.1](https://doi.org/10.1175/2008jcli2358.1).
- M. J. Schmeits and H. A. Dijkstra. Bimodal Behavior of the Kuroshio and the Gulf Stream. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 31(12):3435–3456, Dec 2001. doi: [10.1175/1520-0485\(2001\)031<3435:bbotka>2.0.co;2](https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0485(2001)031<3435:bbotka>2.0.co;2).
- A. Segal, M. ur Rehman, and C. Vuik. Preconditioners for Incompressible Navier-Stokes Solvers. *Numerical Mathematics: Theory, Methods and Applications*, 2010. doi: [10.4208/nmtma.2010.33.1](https://doi.org/10.4208/nmtma.2010.33.1).
- S. D. Shank, V. Simoncini, and D. B. Szyld. Efficient Low-Rank Solution of Generalized Lyapunov Equations. *Numerische Mathematik*, 134(2):327–342, Nov 2015. doi: [10.1007/s00211-015-0777-7](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00211-015-0777-7).
- W. P. Sijp, J. D. Zika, M. d’Orgeville, and M. H. England. Revisiting Meridional Overturing Bistability Using a Minimal Set of State Variables: Stochastic Theory. *Climate Dynamics*, 43(5-6):1661–1676, Nov 2013. doi: [10.1007/s00382-013-1992-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-013-1992-5).
- V. Simoncini. A New Iterative Method for Solving Large-Scale Lyapunov Matrix Equations. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 29(3):1268–1288, Jan 2007. doi: [10.1137/06066120x](https://doi.org/10.1137/06066120x).
- V. Simoncini. Available Software, 2016. URL <http://www.dm.unibo.it/~simoncin/software.html>.
- E. Simonnet. Combinatorial Analysis of the Adaptive Last Particle Method. *Statistics and Computing*, 26(1-2):211–230, Jul 2014. doi: [10.1007/s11222-014-9489-6](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11222-014-9489-6).
- G. L. G. Sleijpen and F. W. Wubs. Exploiting Multilevel Preconditioning Techniques in Eigenvalue Computations. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 25(4):1249–1272, Jan 2004. doi: [10.1137/s1064827599361059](https://doi.org/10.1137/s1064827599361059).
- J. Slingo and T. Palmer. Uncertainty in Weather and Climate Prediction. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences*, 369(1956):4751–4767, Oct 2011. doi: [10.1098/rsta.2011.0161](https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2011.0161).
- H. Stommel. Thermohaline Convection With Two Stable Regimes of Flow. *Tellus B*, 13(2), May 1961. doi: [10.3402/tellusb.v13i2.12985](https://doi.org/10.3402/tellusb.v13i2.12985).
- T. Stykel and V. Simoncini. Krylov Subspace Methods for Projected Lyapunov Equations. *Applied Numerical Mathematics*, 62(1):35–50, Jan 2012. doi: [10.1016/j.apnum.2011.09.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apnum.2011.09.007).

- P. Sura and S. T. Gille. Stochastic Dynamics of Sea Surface Height Variability. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 40(7):1582–1596, Jul 2010. doi: [10.1175/2010jpo4331.1](https://doi.org/10.1175/2010jpo4331.1).
- J. Thies and F. Wubs. Design of a Parallel Hybrid Direct/Iterative Solver for CFD Problems. *2011 IEEE Seventh International Conference on eScience*, Dec 2011. doi: [10.1109/escience.2011.60](https://doi.org/10.1109/escience.2011.60).
- J. Thies, F. Wubs, and H. A. Dijkstra. Bifurcation Analysis of 3D Ocean Flows Using a Parallel Fully-Implicit Ocean Model. *Ocean Modelling*, 30(4):287–297, Jan 2009. doi: [10.1016/j.ocemod.2009.07.005](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2009.07.005).
- A. Timmermann and G. Lohmann. Noise-Induced Transitions in a Simplified Model of the Thermohaline Circulation. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 30(8):1891–1900, Aug 2000. doi: [10.1175/1520-0485\(2000\)030\(1891:nitias\)2.0.co;2](https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0485(2000)030(1891:nitias)2.0.co;2).
- M. den Toom, H. A. Dijkstra, and F. W. Wubs. Spurious Multiple Equilibria Introduced By Convective Adjustment. *Ocean Modelling*, 38(1-2):126–137, Jan 2011. doi: [10.1016/j.ocemod.2011.02.009](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2011.02.009).
- U. Trottenberg, C. W. Oosterlee, and A. Schüller. *Multigrid*. Academic Press, Nov 2000. ISBN 9780127010700
- M. Tuma. A Note on the LDLT Decomposition of Matrices From Saddle-Point Problems. *SIAM Journal on Matrix Analysis and Applications*, 23(4):903–915, Jan 2002. doi: [10.1137/s0895479897321088](https://doi.org/10.1137/s0895479897321088).
- E. Vanden-Eijnden and M. Heymann. The Geometric Minimum Action Method for Computing Minimum Energy Paths. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 128(6):061103, Feb 2008. doi: [10.1063/1.2833040](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.2833040).
- M. Vellinga and R. A. Wood. Global Climatic Impacts of a Collapse of the Atlantic Thermohaline Circulation. *Climatic change*, 54(3):251–267, 2002. doi: [10.1023/a:1016168827653](https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1016168827653).
- R. Verstappen and M. Dröge. A Symmetry-Preserving Cartesian Grid Method for Computing a Viscous Flow Past a Circular Cylinder. *Comptes Rendus Mécanique*, 333(1):51–57, Jan 2005. doi: [10.1016/j.crme.2004.09.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.crme.2004.09.021).
- R. Verstappen and A. Veldman. Symmetry-Preserving Discretization of Turbulent Flow. *Journal of Computational Physics*, 187(1):343–368, May 2003. doi: [10.1016/s0021-9991\(03\)00126-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0021-9991(03)00126-8).
- H. A. van der Vorst. *Iterative Krylov Methods for Large Linear Systems*. Cambridge University Press, 2003. ISBN 9780511615115. doi: [10.1017/cbo9780511615115](https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511615115).



- G. Walin. The Thermohaline Circulation and the Control of Ice Ages. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 50(1):323–332, Jan 1985. doi: [10.1016/s0031-0182\(85\)80020-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0031-0182(85)80020-1).
- A. J. Wathen. Preconditioning. *Acta Numerica*, 24:329–376, Apr 2015. doi: [10.1017/s0962492915000021](https://doi.org/10.1017/s0962492915000021).
- W. Weijer and H. A. Dijkstra. A Bifurcation Study of the Three-Dimensional Thermohaline Ocean Circulation: the Double Hemispheric Case. *Journal of Marine Research*, 59(4):599–631, Jul 2001. doi: [10.1357/002224001762842208](https://doi.org/10.1357/002224001762842208).
- J. Wouters and F. Bouchet. Rare Event Computation in Deterministic Chaotic Systems Using Genealogical Particle Analysis. *Journal of Physics A: Mathematical and Theoretical*, 49(37):374002, Aug 2016. doi: [10.1088/1751-8113/49/37/374002](https://doi.org/10.1088/1751-8113/49/37/374002).
- F. W. Wubs and J. Thies. A Robust Two-Level Incomplete Factorization for (Navier–)Stokes Saddle Point Matrices. *SIAM Journal on Matrix Analysis and Applications*, 32(4):1475–1499, Oct 2011. doi: [10.1137/100789439](https://doi.org/10.1137/100789439).
- X. Zhou, W. Ren, and W. E. Adaptive Minimum Action Method for the Study of Rare Events. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 128(10):104111, Mar 2008. doi: [10.1063/1.2830717](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.2830717).

## SUMMARY

There is a strong variability in the everyday weather related to the development of high- and low-pressure fields. These developments do not have anything to do with the external solar forcing, but are due to the internal variability of the atmospheric flow. The time scale of this variability of 3-7 days is determined by the nonlinear processes in the atmosphere itself. Similar processes happen in every part of the climate system on varying time scales. A high-frequency process is the weather as described above; a low-frequency process is the change in land-ice distribution. In the ocean, internal variability causes formation of ocean eddies and the meandering of ocean currents such as the Gulf Stream. Interaction between all the different processes on different time scales may result in internal variability on other time scales that is not present in decoupled systems. This makes such processes very challenging to study, and difficult to understand. Therefore it is often a good idea to take a step back, and look at a more simplified model to make sure one is at least able to understand the results, and then apply this newly acquired knowledge to the fully coupled system.

We work with such a simplified model of the Meridional Overturning Circulation (MOC). The MOC consists of a global 'conveyor belt' of ocean currents, which are driven by wind stress forces and fluxes of heat and freshwater at the surface. In the Atlantic ocean, it consists of surface currents that transport relatively light water toward high latitudes, deep water currents going in the opposite direction, and sinking and upwelling processes that connect these two. The circulation system contains two overturning cells: one in the north with North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW) and one in the south with Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW).

Since the first model proposed by Stommel, many model studies have

shown that the MOC may be sensitive to variability in the freshwater forcing. In a global coupled climate model by Vellinga and Wood the NADW circulation collapses and recovers after 120 years. This is because weakening the MOC by introducing more freshwater in the North Atlantic (melting of the Greenland ice sheet) leads to a reduced northward saltwater transport, which in turn amplifies the freshwater perturbation.

A state of the MOC with a strongly reduced heat transport may have large consequences for the global climate. Cooling of a few degrees may be observed in Europe, which in turn may lead to growing glaciers and then global cooling. Therefore, an estimate of the probability of MOC transitions is crucial for prediction of a collapse of the MOC and with that a rapid climate change.

This collapse may occur due to the existence of a tipping point associated with the salt-advection feedback. Tipping points exist due to the presence of multiple stable steady states for the same parameter values. Due to unresolved small-scale variability, however, transitions may even be observed before a tipping point is reached. This unresolved variability is often represented as noise. We aimed to develop methods which can be used for studying transition behavior in the MOC.

To be able to observe these transitions between stable steady states, we first need to be able to compute the steady states themselves. They can be computed by using time integration, which is often expensive, especially if steady states have to be computed for multiple parameter values. Instead one can apply a method called (pseudo-arclength) continuation, which can compute the steady states directly by applying Newton's method. This can speed up the computation of steady states considerably. Pseudo-arclength continuation is especially useful for computing unstable steady states, i.e. steady states for which a small disturbance causes the state to converge to a different steady state. Time integration methods are usually incapable of computing these unstable steady states.

During the application of Newton's method, many linear systems of equations have to be solved. For the MOC, these are specifically equations that include the Navier–Stokes equations discretized on a staggered grid. Direct (sparse) solvers are not practical since a typical ocean model involves millions of unknowns leading to a huge memory requirement for storing the factorization and an enormous amount of time to compute it. For such problems, iterative methods are preferred, e.g. Krylov subspace methods with suitable preconditioning to ensure robustness, fast convergence and accuracy of the final approximate solution.

Preconditioners that are often advocated include standard additive Schwarz domain-decomposition, multigrid with aggressive coarsening and strong smoothers (e.g. ILU), and 'block preconditioners' that use an approximate block LU factorization and some approximation of the Schur complement associated with the pressure unknowns, e.g. SIMPLEC, LSC, and PCD.

Another class of Schur complement methods is obtained when eliminat-

ing the interior of geometric partitions (or subdomains) and constructing a suitable approximation of the reduced system on the separator. In this class of methods, we presented a multilevel preconditioner for the Navier–Stokes equations discretized on a staggered grid. The resulting operator acts in the divergence-free space, which allows the method to handle the saddle-point structure of the system in a natural way.

After computing steady states of the MOC, we are interested in its sensitivity to noise. The sensitivity around a steady state can be determined from the probability density function. It is well known that this probability density function can be computed from the solution of a generalized Lyapunov equation. Direct methods for solving a generalized Lyapunov equation such as Bartels–Stewart algorithm are based on dense matrix solvers and hence inapplicable for large systems. Other existing methods which use low-rank approximations might also become expensive for high-dimensional problems, particularly when trying to use previous initial guesses along a continuation branch. We, therefore, presented a novel method for computing the solution of generalized Lyapunov equations that is particularly well suited for our ocean problem in a continuation context. The method works by applying a Galerkin type projection with the space built from the eigenvectors belonging to the largest eigenvalues of the residual at every iteration of the method. Most important is that the method can be restarted, which allows for less memory usage, faster iterations, and recycling of previous solutions. We showed that for an idealized 2D MOC model, our method is the most efficient method in terms of both memory usage and time.

A shortcoming to this above approach is that it only describes the sensitivity to noise around a steady state. To study the more global phenomenon of transitions between steady states, stochastic time integration is required. Applying a standard Monte Carlo method, however, is way too expensive, especially for high-dimensional systems and when the probability of a transition is small. Multiple methods exist to work around this problem by applying some form of resampling. To improve on these methods, we came up with a projected time stepping method, which reduces the memory usage for our idealized 2D MOC model with 96%, and the time consumption by 30%. We showed that the probability of a transition increases drastically when getting closer to a bifurcation point, and that the projected method is able to obtain the same results as standard methods.

Since we only looked at an idealized 2D MOC model, we can not really say anything about the transition probabilities of the MOC in the actual Atlantic ocean, but we did provide methods with which this becomes feasible.



# SAMENVATTING

Ontwikkelingen van hoge- en lagedrukgebieden zorgen voor een sterke variabiliteit van het weer. Deze ontwikkelingen worden niet veroorzaakt door stralingsenergie afkomstig van de zon, maar zijn te wijten aan de interne variabiliteit van de atmosferische stroming. De tijdschaal van 3 tot 7 dagen van deze variabiliteit wordt bepaald door niet-lineaire processen in de atmosfeer zelf. Soortgelijke processen vinden op verschillende tijdschalen plaats in elk deel van het klimaatsysteem. Een hoogfrequent proces is het weer zoals hierboven beschreven; een laagfrequent proces is de verandering in de dekkingsgraad van ijs op land. In de oceaan veroorzaakt interne variabiliteit vorming van wervels en het meanderen van oceaanstromingen zoals de Golfstroom. Interactie tussen alle verschillende processen op verschillende tijdschalen kan leiden tot interne variabiliteit op andere tijdschalen die niet aanwezig is in de afzonderlijke systemen. Dit maakt dergelijke processen zeer lastig om te bestuderen en moeilijk om te begrijpen. Daarom is het vaak een goed idee om een stap terug te doen en te kijken naar een eenvoudiger model om er zeker van te zijn dat men in ieder geval in staat is om de resultaten te begrijpen, en om deze nieuw verworven kennis vervolgens toe te kunnen passen op het volledig gekoppelde systeem.

We werken met een dergelijk vereenvoudigd model van de meridionale omwentelingscirculatie (MOC). De MOC bestaat uit een mondiale 'transportband' van zeestromingen, die wordt aangedreven door windspanningskrachten en fluxen van warmte en zoet water aan het oppervlak. In de Atlantische oceaan bestaat het uit oppervlaktestromen die relatief licht water naar hoge breedtegraden transporteren, diepe waterstromen die in de tegenovergestelde richting gaan en zink- en opwellingprocessen die deze twee verbinden. Het circulatiesysteem bevat twee omwentelingscellen: één in het noorden met

Noord-Atlantisch diep water (NADW) en één in het zuiden met Antarctisch bodemwater (AABW).

Sinds het eerste door Stommel voorgestelde model hebben veel modelstudies aangetoond dat de MOC gevoelig kan zijn voor variabiliteit in de zoetwaterforcering. In een gekoppeld klimaatmodel van Vellinga en Wood stort de NADW-circulatie in en herstelt zich na 120 jaar. De verzwakking van de MOC door de introductie van meer zoet water in de Noord-Atlantische oceaan (het smelten van de Groenlandse ijskap) leidt namelijk tot een verminderd zoutwatertransport naar het noorden, wat op zijn beurt de zoetwaterverstoring versterkt.

Een toestand van de MOC met een sterk gereduceerd warmtetransport kan grote gevolgen hebben voor het mondiale klimaat. In Europa kan een afkoeling van enkele graden worden waargenomen, die op haar beurt kan leiden tot groeiende gletsjers en vervolgens tot wereldwijde afkoeling. Daarom is een schatting van de kans op MOC-transities cruciaal voor het voorspellen van een ineenstorting van de MOC en daarmee een snelle klimaatverandering.

Deze ineenstorting kan optreden vanwege het bestaan van een kantelpunt die gerelateerd is aan de zout-advectierugkoppeling. Kantelpunten bestaan vanwege de aanwezigheid van meerdere stabiele evenwichtstoestanden voor dezelfde parameterwaarden. Vanwege kleinschalige variabiliteit die niet in het model wordt gevangen kunnen echter transitie worden waargenomen zelfs voordat een kantelpunt wordt bereikt. Deze kleinschalige variabiliteit wordt vaak beschreven door middel van ruis. Ons doel was om methoden te ontwikkelen die kunnen worden gebruikt voor het bestuderen van transitiegedrag in de MOC.

Om deze overgangen tussen stabiele evenwichtstoestanden te kunnen waarnemen, moeten we eerst de evenwichtstoestanden zelf kunnen berekenen. Ze kunnen worden berekend met behulp van tijdsintegratie, wat vaak duur is, vooral als evenwichtstoestanden berekend moeten worden voor meerdere parameterwaarden. In plaats daarvan kan men een methode toepassen genaamd (pseudo-arclength) continuatie, die de evenwichtstoestanden rechtstreeks kan berekenen door de methode van Newton toe te passen. Dit kan de berekening van evenwichtstoestanden aanzienlijk versnellen. Pseudo-arclength continuatie is vooral nuttig voor het berekenen van onstabiele evenwichtstoestanden, d.w.z. evenwichtstoestanden waarbij een kleine verstoring ervoor zorgt dat de toestand convergeert naar een andere evenwichtstoestand. Tijdsintegratiemethoden zijn meestal niet in staat om deze onstabiele evenwichtstoestanden te berekenen.

Bij de toepassing van de methode van Newton moeten veel lineaire stelsels van vergelijkingen worden opgelost. Voor de MOC zijn dit specifiek vergelijkingen die de Navier-Stokes-vergelijkingen omvatten, gediscretiseerd op een versprongen rooster. Directe (ijle) oplossingsmethoden zijn niet praktisch, omdat een typisch oceaanmodel miljoenen onbekenden omvat, wat leidt tot

een grote geheugenvereiste voor het opslaan van de factorisatie en een enorme hoeveelheid tijd die nodig is om deze te berekenen. Voor dergelijke problemen wordt de voorkeur gegeven aan iteratieve methoden, bijvoorbeeld de Krylov-deelruimtemethoden met geschikte preconditionering om de robuustheid, snelle convergentie en nauwkeurigheid van de uiteindelijk benaderende oplossing te garanderen.

Preconditioneersders die vaak worden bepleit zijn standaard additieve Schwarz domein-decompositie, multigrid met agressieve verruwing en sterke gladstrijkers (bijv. ILU), en 'blok-preconditioneersders' die een benaderende blok-LU-factorisatie en een benadering van het Schur-complement geassocieerd met de druk-onbekenden gebruiken, bijvoorbeeld SIMPLEX, LSC en PCD.

Een andere klasse van Schur-complementmethoden wordt verkregen wanneer het interieur van geometrische partities (of subdomeinen) wordt geëlimineerd en een geschikte benadering van het gereduceerde systeem op de separator wordt geconstrueerd. In deze klasse van methoden stelden we een meerlaagse preconditioneerder voor de Navier–Stokes-vergelijkingen die gediscretiseerd zijn op een versprongen rooster. De resulterende operator werkt in de divergentievrije ruimte, waardoor de methode de zadelpuntstructuur van het systeem op een natuurlijke manier kan behandelen.

Na het berekenen van evenwichtstoestanden van de MOC zijn we geïnteresseerd in de gevoeligheid voor ruis. De gevoeligheid rond een evenwichtstoestand kan worden bepaald aan de hand van de kansdichtheid. Het is algemeen bekend dat deze kansdichtheid kan worden berekend uit de oplossing van een gegeneraliseerde Lyapunov-vergelijking. Directe methoden voor het oplossen van een gegeneraliseerde Lyapunov-vergelijking zoals het Bartels–Stewart-algoritme zijn gebaseerd op solvers voor volle matrices en zijn daarom niet toepasbaar voor grote systemen. Bestaande methoden die gebruik maken van benaderingen met een lage rang kunnen ook duur worden voor hoogdimensionale problemen, met name bij het gebruik van eerdere initiële schattingen langs een continuatietak. We ontwikkelden daarom een nieuwe methode voor het berekenen van de oplossing van gegeneraliseerde Lyapunov-vergelijkingen die bijzonder goed geschikt is voor ons oceaanprobleem in een continuatiecontext. De methode werkt door een Galerkin-type projectie toe te passen met de ruimte die is opgebouwd uit de eigenvectoren die behoren tot de grootste eigenwaarden van het residu in elke iteratie van de methode. Het belangrijkste is dat de methode kan worden herstart, wat zorgt voor minder geheugengebruik, snellere iteraties, en wat hergebruik van eerdere oplossingen toestaat. We hebben laten zien dat voor een geïdealiseerd 2D MOC-model onze methode de meest efficiënte methode is in termen van zowel geheugengebruik als tijd.

Een tekortkoming van deze aanpak is dat deze alleen de gevoeligheid voor ruis rond een evenwichtstoestand beschrijft. Om het meer globale fenomeen van transities tussen evenwichtstoestanden te bestuderen, is een stochastische



tijdsintegratie nodig. Het toepassen van een standaard Monte Carlo methode is echter veel te duur, vooral voor hoogdimensionale systemen en wanneer de kans op een transitie klein is. Er bestaan meerdere methoden om dit probleem te omzeilen door een of andere vorm van resampling toe te passen. Om deze methoden te verbeteren, hebben we een geprojecteerde tijdstapmethode bedacht, die het geheugengebruik voor ons geïdealiseerde 2D MOC-model met 96% en het tijdsverbruik met 30% vermindert. We toonden aan dat de kans op een transitie drastisch toeneemt wanneer we dichterbij een bifurcatiepunt komen, en dat de geprojecteerde methode in staat is dezelfde resultaten te verkrijgen als standaardmethoden.

Omdat we alleen naar een geïdealiseerd 2D MOC-model hebben gekeken, kunnen we niet echt iets zeggen over de transitieskansen van de MOC in de werkelijke Atlantische oceaan, maar we hebben wel methoden ontwikkeld waarmee dit haalbaar wordt.

# SOAMENVATTING

Klaainschoalege veranderlekhaid ien t klimoat kin grode effecten hebben op mondiaole oceoancirculoatsie. Veurbeelden van zukke klaainschoalege veranderns binnen schommelingen ien houveulhaid zuit wotter deur t smelten van t ies op Gruinlaand. Dizze schommelingen kinnen aanlaaiden wezen tot n òfnoame van haile globoale oceoancirculoatsie, wat op zien beurt òfkouln van n poar groad kin geven ien Uropoa. Om der achter te kommen houveul kaans wie moaken op zo'n klimoatomslag, mouten der berekens doan wòrren mit grootschoalege oceoanmodèllen. Jammer genog binnen bestoande reken-technieken nait vlug genog en doarom mouten der nije technieken bedòcht wòrren. Ien dit proufschrift stellen wie drij veur. Eerste is n methode om grode systemen van vergeliekens op te lössen, twijde n methode om gevuileghaid veur schommelingen wied genog vot van t omslaggebied te bepoalen, en leste methode berekent waarkelke kaans op n klimoatomslag ien grootschoalege modèllen. Wie loaten zain hou dizze methoden waarken op n idealiseerd twijdimensionaal oceoancirculoatsiemodèl. Ien toukomst kinnen dizze methoden bruukt wòrren om echte omslagkaansen ien realistische drijdimensionoale klimoatmodèllen mit n hoge rezeluutsie te bereken. Veur n oetgebraaidere soamenvatting verwiezen wie joe gern deur noar Nederlandse soamenvatting.



# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Welcome to the acknowledgments, which is very likely to be one of the very few parts of my thesis that you will ever read, maybe together with the summary. I do not mind this at all, since I am also guilty of this habit, especially when receiving a thesis that is unrelated to my field of research. For this reason, I also provide the summary not only in Dutch, as seems to be common, but also in English and Gronings.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor Fred Wubs. I do not think that any PhD student could ever wish for a better supervisor. You gave me full freedom to pursue my own interests, even if they did not fully overlap with your initial plans for this project, and were always interested in the progress that I made. And whenever I had any questions, you were there in your office, ready to answer them. I also enjoyed the travels we made together to conferences and to Jonas in Cologne, especially the cycling trip we made to Bonn and back.

I would also like to thank Henk Dijkstra, who acted as my second supervisor, for always being enthusiastic and for providing us with a vision, which ultimately led me to the topics that were discussed in this thesis. I look forward to the continuation of working together with both of you, Fred and Henk, in the coming years.

Furthermore, my thanks goes to my promotor, Roel Verstappen, and the assessment committee, consisting of Rob Bisseling, Daan Crommelin and Arjan van der Schaft, for their thorough reading of my thesis and their helpful comments.

Now I get to the two people I spent most time with during the past few years, even before we started with our PhDs, which are Ronald and Erik. We have been sharing an office on and off for the past six years or so, and it has

been a pleasure. Thanks especially for not being too annoyed when I distract you for no particular reason other than to talk to you.

Thanks to Erik for providing me with the finest details on the subjects of mechanical keyboards(!), modular synthesizers, coffee grinding, growing edible mushrooms and baking bread. Thanks to Ronald for your love for seals, powder, Beijum and bananas. Thanks to Daniele, Christian and Jonas for our pleasant long distance collaborations during the past few years. Thanks to Mark for being such an excellent student and for coming up with the rotated parallelepiped, which solved all of our problems. Thanks to David for the lengthy discussions over a cup of coffee (thanks also for the coffee). Ahmad, Cristóbal, Donglin, Henk, Hugo, Jeremías, Jigar, Larissa, Luca, Maurits, Nico, Paolo, Peter, Reza, Sourabh, Weiyan, thanks for the nice conversations we had often during, but not limited to, the lunch breaks.

Thanks to Paulus, Sjieuwe, Peter, Lanting and Jan, for being my friends since secondary school, but also while studying together with me at this university with the exception of Jan, who went to Delft. Thanks to the *mooie gekken* at T.F.V. 'Professor Francken' for taking klaverjassen to a next level and for the countless hours of fun we had together. Thanks to the Marks of the s[ck]rip(t|t?c)ie for the random acts of programming under the supervision of Kathinka. Thanks to Roel for teaching me how to perform a scout rush.

Finally, thanks to my parents, for still keeping up with me after so long. Thanks for all of the Christmas dinners. Thanks for never having forced me to do anything, and for always being supportive. Thanks for always being interested in what I do, even if you do not fully understand it. The same holds for my sister, who in turn I often do not fully understand either, but who is also very dear to me. Also thanks to Bono and Waldo for respectively warming and eating my feet. I am happy to have such a wonderful family.

# CURRICULUM VITAE

Sven Baars was born on August 15, 1990 in Eenrum, The Netherlands. After completing his primary education in Eenrum, he attended secondary education at the Praedinius Gymnasium in Groningen. From 2008 to 2014 he was a student at the University of Groningen, where he obtained his bachelor's and master's degree (cum laude) in the field of numerical mathematics. During this time, he also did an internship at the German Aerospace Center in Cologne.

From 2015 to 2019, Sven was a PhD student at the university of Groningen in the group of prof. dr. ir. R.W.C.P. Verstappen under the supervision of dr. ir. F.W. Wubs. The topic of his research was numerical methods for studying transition probabilities in stochastic ocean-climate models.