

University of Groningen

## Symptom network models in depression research

van Borkulo, Claudia Debora

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*

2018

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

van Borkulo, C. D. (2018). *Symptom network models in depression research: From methodological exploration to clinical application*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen.

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.


The studies presented in this thesis were funded by GGZ Friesland.

Publication of this dissertation was partially supported by the University Medical Center Groningen, the University of Groningen, and the Graduate School SHARE of the University Medical Center Groningen.

**ISBN:** 978-94-034-0379-3 (printed version)

**ISBN:** 978-94-034-0378-6 (digital version)

**On the cover:** Tijmen Stuijt — illustrated by Famke Stuijt

**Cover design, layout design and printed by:**  Lovebird Design.  
[www.lovebird-design.com](http://www.lovebird-design.com)

**Paranymphs:** Angélique O. J. Cramer and Laura F Bringmann

©2017, Claudia D. van Borkulo

No parts of this thesis may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission of the author.





university of  
 groningen



UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

# **Symptom network models in depression research**

From methodological exploration to clinical application

**PhD thesis**

to obtain the degree of PhD at the  
University of Groningen  
on the authority of the  
Rector Magnificus Prof. dr. E. Sterken  
and in accordance with  
the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Wednesday, January 17 2018 at 12.45 hours

by

**Claudia Debora van Borkulo**

born on March 16 1971  
in Amsterdam

## **Supervisors**

Prof. R.A. Schoevers

Prof. D. Borsboom

## **Co-supervisors**

Dr. L. Boschloo

Dr. L. J. Waldorp

## **Assessment committee**

Prof. I.M. Engelhard

Prof. A.J. Oldehinkel

Prof. M.E. Timmerman

*Voor Famke en Tijmen*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The network perspective on psychopathology . . . . .	2
1.2 This thesis . . . . .	2
1.2.1 A theoretical deepening of the network perspective on psychopathology . . . . .	3
1.2.2 Methodological challenges for group-level analyses: net- work estimation and comparison . . . . .	4
1.2.3 Clinical studies relating vulnerability to local and global connectivity of group-level networks . . . . .	4
1.2.4 Methodological challenges at the level of the individual: using network models to predict clinical course in patients with depression . . . . .	5
1.2.5 Conclusions . . . . .	5
<b>2 The network approach</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1 Mental disorders as complex dynamical systems . . . . .	8
2.2 Constructing Networks . . . . .	11
2.2.1 Graphical models . . . . .	11
2.2.2 Gaussian data . . . . .	14
2.2.3 Binary data . . . . .	22
2.2.4 An oracle algorithm to identify connections . . . . .	25
2.2.5 Longitudinal data . . . . .	27
2.3 Network Analysis . . . . .	32
2.3.1 Centrality measures . . . . .	32



2.3.2	Predicting dynamics over time . . . . .	35
2.3.3	Network comparison . . . . .	36
2.4	Current state-of-the-art . . . . .	38
2.4.1	Comorbidity . . . . .	39
2.4.2	Early-warning signals . . . . .	40
2.4.3	Higher connectivity, more problems . . . . .	43
2.5	Discussion . . . . .	44
<b>3</b>	<b>Major depressive disorder as a Complex Dynamic System</b>	<b>49</b>
3.1	Introduction . . . . .	50
3.1.1	What is MDD as a complex dynamic system? . . . . .	51
3.1.2	Aim of this paper . . . . .	52
3.1.3	Vulnerability in the MDD dynamic system . . . . .	52
3.2	Simulation I: Investigating the vulnerability hypothesis . . . . .	54
3.2.1	Methods . . . . .	56
3.2.2	Results and discussion . . . . .	59
3.3	Simulation II: Investigating the influence of external stress . . . . .	61
3.3.1	Methods . . . . .	65
3.3.2	Results and discussion of Simulation II . . . . .	67
3.4	Discussion . . . . .	71
<b>4</b>	<b>A new method for constructing networks from binary data</b>	<b>75</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	76
4.2	Methods . . . . .	80
4.2.1	eLasso . . . . .	80
4.2.2	Validation study . . . . .	83
4.2.3	Data description . . . . .	84
4.3	Results . . . . .	85
4.3.1	Validation study . . . . .	85
4.3.2	Application to real data . . . . .	88
4.4	Discussion . . . . .	91
<b>5</b>	<b>Comparing network structures on three aspects: A permutation test</b>	<b>97</b>
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	98
5.2	Network Comparison Test . . . . .	100
5.2.1	Network estimation . . . . .	100

5.2.2	Test statistics . . . . .	102
5.2.3	Procedure . . . . .	103
5.2.4	Power of NCT . . . . .	104
5.3	Simulation study . . . . .	106
5.3.1	Setup of simulation study . . . . .	106
5.3.2	Results . . . . .	108
5.3.3	Application to real data . . . . .	111
5.3.4	Real data . . . . .	112
5.3.5	Results . . . . .	112
5.4	Discussion . . . . .	113
<b>6</b>	<b>Association of symptom network structure with the course of depression</b>	<b>117</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	119
6.2	Methods . . . . .	121
6.2.1	Study Sample . . . . .	121
6.2.2	Persistence of MDD at Follow-up . . . . .	121
6.2.3	Baseline <i>DSM-IV</i> Symptoms of MDD . . . . .	122
6.2.4	Statistical Analysis . . . . .	122
6.3	Results . . . . .	125
6.3.1	General Differences . . . . .	125
6.3.2	Differences in Overall Connectivity . . . . .	126
6.3.3	Differences in Local Connectivity . . . . .	126
6.4	Discussion . . . . .	128
<b>7</b>	<b>Between- versus within-subjects analysis</b>	<b>131</b>
7.1	Summary of comment . . . . .	132
7.2	Reply . . . . .	132
<b>8</b>	<b>A prospective study on how symptoms in a network predict the onset of depression</b>	<b>135</b>
8.1	The network approach . . . . .	136
8.2	Aim of this study . . . . .	136
8.3	Results . . . . .	137
8.4	Conclusion . . . . .	137

<b>9</b>	<b>The contact process as a model for predicting network dynamics of psychopathology</b>	<b>141</b>
9.1	Introduction . . . . .	142
9.2	Model specification . . . . .	147
9.3	Estimation procedures . . . . .	150
9.3.1	Percolation Indicator estimation . . . . .	151
9.3.2	Network estimation . . . . .	153
9.4	Validation study . . . . .	154
9.4.1	Design . . . . .	154
9.4.2	Results validation study . . . . .	156
9.5	Application of method to real data . . . . .	158
9.5.1	Discrepancy between model and real data . . . . .	158
9.5.2	Description of real data . . . . .	159
9.5.3	Results of application to real data . . . . .	159
9.6	Discussion . . . . .	163
<b>10</b>	<b>Mental disorders as networks of problems: A review of recent insights</b>	<b>169</b>
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	170
10.2	Comorbidity . . . . .	172
10.2.1	Comorbidity from a network perspective . . . . .	172
10.2.2	Comorbidity in empirical data . . . . .	172
10.3	Prediction . . . . .	175
10.3.1	Early warning signals . . . . .	175
10.3.2	Prediction via network characteristics . . . . .	177
10.4	Clinical intervention . . . . .	178
10.4.1	The concept of centrality . . . . .	178
10.4.2	What are good symptoms for clinical intervention? . . . . .	179
10.5	Future directions . . . . .	181
10.5.1	Clinical research . . . . .	181
10.5.2	Methodological research . . . . .	183
10.6	Summary . . . . .	184
<b>11</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>187</b>
11.1	This thesis . . . . .	187

11.1.1	A theoretical deepening of the network perspective on psychopathology . . . . .	187
11.1.2	Methodological challenges for group-level analyses: network estimation and comparison . . . . .	188
11.1.3	Empirical studies relating local and global connectivity to vulnerability . . . . .	189
11.1.4	Methodological challenge for individuals: predicting future course of patients . . . . .	189
11.1.5	Conclusions . . . . .	190
11.2	Research agenda for the future . . . . .	190
11.2.1	Validity of the network theory . . . . .	190
11.2.2	Understanding and predicting psychopathology . . . . .	192
11.2.3	Networks in clinical practice . . . . .	193
11.2.4	Methodological development . . . . .	195
<b>A</b>	<b>Supplementary Information to Chapter 3</b>	<b>201</b>
A.1	Supplementary Methods . . . . .	202
A.2	Supplementary Results . . . . .	208
<b>B</b>	<b>Supplementary information to chapter 6</b>	<b>213</b>
B.1	The influence of $\gamma$ on network estimation . . . . .	214
B.2	Is severity a confound with respect to network connectivity? . . . . .	216
B.3	Analyses of conceivable confounds in network connectivity . . . . .	217
B.4	Quantifying importance of symptoms . . . . .	217
B.5	Stability analysis of centrality measures . . . . .	221
B.6	Network structures based on ordinary analyses . . . . .	222
B.7	Additional indicators for weighted network density . . . . .	223
<b>C</b>	<b>Supplementary Information to Chapter 9</b>	<b>225</b>
C.1	Derivations . . . . .	226
C.1.1	Transition probabilities . . . . .	226
C.2	Validation study graphicalVAR . . . . .	227
C.2.1	Design . . . . .	227
C.2.2	Results . . . . .	227
C.3	R code for the simulation process . . . . .	229
C.4	Variance . . . . .	231

C.4.1	Fisher information variance . . . . .	231
C.4.2	Sample variance . . . . .	232
C.4.3	Comparing variance estimates . . . . .	232
C.5	Violin plot of estimates of $\rho$ not shown in Chapter 9 . . . . .	234
C.6	Plots of sample variances not shown in Chapter 9 . . . . .	235
C.7	Statistical testing . . . . .	236
C.7.1	Quality of test statistic . . . . .	236
<b>D</b>	<b>A tutorial on R package IsingFit</b>	<b>239</b>
D.1	Introduction . . . . .	240
D.2	Arguments . . . . .	241
D.3	Output . . . . .	245
<b>E</b>	<b>A tutorial on R package NetworkComparisonTest</b>	<b>249</b>
E.1	Introduction . . . . .	250
E.1.1	Real data to illustrate NCT . . . . .	251
E.2	Arguments . . . . .	252
E.3	Output . . . . .	254
E.4	Plotting of NCT results . . . . .	256
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>259</b>
	<b>Nederlandse samenvatting</b>	<b>289</b>
	<b>Curriculum Vitae</b>	<b>293</b>
	<b>List of publications</b>	<b>295</b>
	PEER-REVIEWED PUBLICATIONS . . . . .	295
	NON PEER-REVIEWED PUBLICATIONS . . . . .	298
	MEDIA . . . . .	298
	<b>Dankwoord (acknowledgements)</b>	<b>303</b>