

University of Groningen

Rethinking the culture-economy dialectic

Brons, Lajos Ludovic

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2005

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Brons, L. L. (2005). *Rethinking the culture-economy dialectic*. s.n.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

*RETHINKING
THE CULTURE – ECONOMY
DIALECTIC*

THE HAGUE  LAJOS BRONS

ISBN 90-9019567-X

Cover art: Irene Kromhout

Figures and lay-out: Lajos Brons

Printing: Febodruk, Enschede

The research in this book was conducted at the Faculty of Spatial Sciences at the University of Groningen.

Contact / information: lajos@lc.dds.nl

Copyright © Lajos Brons, 2005. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

Rethinking the culture - economy dialectic

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de
Ruimtelijke Wetenschappen
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
Rector Magnificus, dr. F. Zwarts,
in het openbaar te verdedigen op
maandag 27 juni 2005
om 16.15 uur

door

Lajos Ludovic Brons

geboren op 12 september 1972
te Nijmegen

Promotores: Prof. dr. P.H. Pellenbarg
Prof. dr. R.W. Boomkens

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. dr. G.J. Ashworth
Prof. dr. T.A.F. Kuipers
Prof. dr. H. Voogd

CONTENTS

1 / introduction

1 / 1 / the culture - economy dialectic	15
1 / 2 / the research project.....	17
1 / conceptual contestation and confusion	18
2 / language, culture and social science	19
1 / 3 / reading this book	21
1 / a note on reference.....	22
2 / symbols, formalisations and abbreviations	23

2 / on concepts and conceptual analysis

2 / 1 / introduction	27
1 / language, culture and reality	28
2 / on words and concepts.....	31
3 / this chapter.....	34
2 / 2 / conceptual analysis in philosophy	35
1 / a short history of conceptual analysis	35
2 / concepts and meaning outside analytic philosophy	41
3 / meaning, definition and reference.....	45
4 / summary and conclusions	50
2 / 3 / applied conceptual analysis	52
1 / terminology and CA in social and political science.....	53
2 / CA in nursing.....	56
3 / formal methods of / in CA	57
4 / summary and conclusions	59
2 / 4 / concepts, ideas and fashions.....	60
1 / history of concepts and ideas	60
2 / management fashions.....	63
3 / summary and conclusions	65
2 / 5 / polarity, dialectics and deconstruction	66
1 / polarity and the origins of dialectical thought	67
2 / dialectics and deconstruction	69
3 / summary, conclusions and the origins of the CED	70
2 / 6 / language and ontology.....	72
1 / metaphysics and ontology.....	72
2 / formal analysis of conceptual structures.....	75
3 / summary and conclusions.....	76

2 / 7 / a synthetic model and its application.....	77
1 / a general model of concepts for CA	77
2 / application of the model	82
3 / the analysis of the CED	86

3 / conceptual history of culture and economy

3 / 1 / introduction	87
3 / 2 / reason, passion and civilisation	89
1 / reason, habit and passion	90
2 / social science, Enlightenment and "civilisation"	93
3 / summary	98
3 / 3 / conceptual history of "culture"	98
1 / the semasiology of "culture"	99
2 / the onomasiology of "culture"	102
3 / summary	104
3 / 4 / culture, civilisation and economy	104
1 / culture versus civilisation	105
2 / culture and civilisation in evolutionary anthropology	111
3 / the semasiology of "economy"	113
4 / summary	116
3 / 5 / entrepreneurship and dimensions of culture	116
1 / culture and entrepreneurship	116
2 / dimensions of culture	118
3 / summary	119
3 / 6 / culture, nature and geography	119
1 / the two histories of geography	120
2 / the CED in modern geography	125
3 / summary	127

4 / intensional mapping

4 / 1 / introduction	129
4 / 2 / "culture": definitions and interpretations	130
4 / 3 / aspects of "culture"	136
1 / culture is human	136
2 / culture is socially learned	137
3 / culture and behaviour	138
4 / meaning, ideas, products of the mind	140
5 / less common aspects	141
6 / classification and meta-classification	142

4 / 4 / mapping "culture"	143
1 / cluster analysis	144
2 / formal concept analysis	146
4 / 5 / civilisation, economy, <i>anti-culture</i>	148
4 / 6 / notes towards conceptual reconstruction	150
5 / conceptual reconstruction	
5 / 1 / introduction	155
1 / social and representational ontologies of the CED	156
2 / this chapter	157
5 / 2 / "culture", "economy" and social ontology	158
1 / behaviour, meta-behaviour and aspects of "culture"	159
2 / primitives, symbols and meta-behavioural entities	163
3 / on the ontological status of meta-behaviour	167
4 / "culture" and "economy" as ontological categories	168
5 / 3 / the ontology of C-E relationships	170
5 / 4 / summary	172
6 / operationalisation and measurement	
6 / 1 / introduction	175
6 / 2 / meta-behavioural measures	176
1 / cross-cultural psychology and national culture	177
2 / indirect measurement of regional culture	183
3 / comparing meta-behavioural measures	212
6 / 3 / measuring the economy	214
1 / measures of wealth and growth	214
2 / measures of entrepreneurship	217
6 / 4 / concluding theoretical considerations	219
7 / on theories and tests	
7 / 1 / introduction	221
1 / testing for causality	222
2 / this chapter	225
7 / 2 / the first grand theory	226
1 / historical materialism	226
2 / stages and modernisation	232
3 / summary	237

7 / 3 / the second grand theory.....	238
1 / religion and entrepreneurship	240
2 / values and entrepreneurship.....	242
3 / summary	246
7 / 4 / a review of empirical tests	247
1 / wealth and cultural change	247
2 / cultural and other influences on entrepreneurship	249
3 / entrepreneurship and economic growth	253
4 / summary and conclusions.....	256
7 / 5 / <i>minor</i> theories of the CED	257
1 / embeddedness.....	257
2 / cultural conditions for economic growth	259
3 / culture, institutions and development	261
4 / the culture of consumption	264
5 / geographies of economic growth.....	265
6 / summary and conclusions.....	266
7 / 6 / further testing of the CED	267
1 / national culture and causal graphs	267
2 / regional culture and economy.....	272
3 summary and conclusions.....	277
7 / 7 / conclusions, results, and what remains untested.....	277
1 / a summary of conclusions.....	278
2 / what remains untested.....	279

8 / considerations and implications

8 / 1 / introduction	281
8 / 2 / a review of theories, confirmations and refutations.....	282
1 / historical materialism.....	282
2 / the entrepreneurial spirit	285
8 / 3 / towards a synthetic theory of the CED	287
1 / meta-theoretical issues.....	287
2 / further thoughts on behaviour and meta-behaviour	289
3 / summary, synthesis.....	293
8 / 4 / science, society and the CED	293
1 / reinventing geography	294
2 / social science as empirical conceptual analysis.....	296
3 / culture, entrepreneurship and regional policy.....	298
4 / summary	299

8 / 5 / boundaries, anarchism and free choice	299
1 / against all boundaries: a plea for anarchism	300
2 / the myth of free choice	304
3 / against culture: summary and conclusion	305
8 / 6 / dissolution	306
1 / the <i>trialectic</i>	306
2 / confirmation and falsification	309
3 / science and meta	310
4 / coda	312
epilogue	317
appendix : municipality scores on cultural dimensions	321
summary	331
samenvatting (Dutch summary)	341
references	351

figures

1.1 "culture" or "cultural" in book titles in WorldCat database
by year of publication..... 16

1.2 the structure of the book..... 21

2.1 Ogden & Richard's meaning triangle 44

2.2 Sartori's (left) and Dahlberg's (right) meaning triangle 54

2.3 definitions as intensional Venn-Euler diagrams 55

2.4 series of binary oppositions 70

2.5 concept lattice based on table 2.2 (example)..... 76

3.1 a triangle of combined dialectics 124

4.1 levels of formalisation of meta-behaviour 140

4.2 intensional clusters: dendrogram 145

4.3 computer generated FCA lattice based on all attributes 146

4.4 FCA lattice based on a subset of attributes..... 147

4.5 FCA lattice of "economy" 149

4.6 FCA lattice of "culture" and "economy" 150

5.1 a model of (individual) behaviour 159

5.2 a model of social behaviour..... 161

5.3 a formal taxonomy of meta-behavioural entities 164

7.1 correlation of causally related x and y at varying points
of measurement (t) of x 223

7.2 Burbelka's system of HM theories..... 229

7.3 causal graph of wealth (GDP) and cultural dimensions 268

7.4 causal graph of wealth (GDP), institutions and competitiveness 269

7.5 causal graph of wealth, culture and institutions: trends..... 270

8.1 a taxonomy of the first grand theory 284

8.2 a taxonomy of the second grand theory and minor theories 286

8.3 Venn-Euler diagrams of T8.5(a) and T8.6(a)..... 291

8.4 boundaries and choice 305

8.5 the trialectic 307

maps

4.1 mapping culture, literally..... 144

6.1 national cultures measured by Hofstede..... 179

6.2 Hofstede's dimensions (Europe, ca. 1970)..... 180

6.3 regional culture (Netherlands, 1997-1999)..... 184

6.4 factor 1: post-materialism (PMA; Netherlands, 1997-2003)..... 201

6.5	degree of urbanisation (U.durb; Netherlands, 2003)	202
6.6	residual of factor 1 (PMA-R; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	203
6.7	factor 2: Protestant conservatism (PRC; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	205
6.8	factor 3: individualism (IND; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	207
6.9	residual of factor 3 (IND-R; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	208
6.10	factor 4: egalitarian anti-conservatism (EAC; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	210
6.11	factor 5: dissatisfaction (DST; Netherlands, 1997-2003)	211
6.12	standardised average household income (Netherlands, 1998-2000)	216
6.13	entrepreneurship (Netherlands, 2001-2002)	218

tables

1.1	"culture" and "economy" in titles and on the internet (June 2004)	16
1.2	symbols used throughout the book	23
2.1	percentage of articles on / in conceptual analysis by scientific field	52
2.2	formal context (example)	75
2.3	conceptual analysis as the specification of conceptual elements	84
2.4	the mapping stage	84
3.1	connotations of the male and female (examples)	88
4.1	concepts and aspects of "economy"	149
4.2	data matrix for intensional mapping of "culture"	151
5.1	relationships of varying strengths	171
5.2	possible combinations of strengths and directions	171
6.1	correlations between dimensions of culture	182
6.2	a comparison of dimensions	185
6.3	list of variables	186
6.4	weights for weighted average election variables in table 6.3	189
6.5	demographic indicators of culture: birth and death	192
6.6	demographic indicators of culture: marriage and households	193
6.7	political indicators of culture	195
6.8	religious indicators of culture	196
6.9	other indicators of culture	196
6.10	correlations between dimensions	197
6.11	variance explained	198
6.12	factor correlation matrix	198
6.13a	factor 1: loadings (>0.5) and indicators	199
6.13b	factor 1: selected correlations (>0.4) to excluded and secondary variables	200
6.14	regression of PMA on U.durb, L.lfhe, and E.lti	200
6.15a	factor 2: loadings (>0.5) and indicators	204

6.15b	factor 2: correlations (>0.4) to excluded variables	204
6.16a	factor 3: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	206
6.16b	factor 3: correlations (>0.4) to secondary variables	206
6.17	regression of IND on E.ainc and L.lfhe.....	206
6.18	factor 4: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	209
6.19	factor 5: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	209
6.20	a comparison of measurements and dimensions.....	212
6.21	dimensions of regional culture: summary.....	213
7.1	concepts of "culture" and "economy" in the first grand theory	238
7.2	a typology of motivations and entrepreneurs.....	250
7.3	studies on start-ups and job creation.....	255
7.4	highest correlations between values, institutions, wealth and growth	271
7.5	correlations between regional culture and income in the Netherlands	273
7.6	regression models of new firm formation in the Netherlands (E.strt)	275
7.7	increase in R ² by inclusion of cultural variables.....	276
7.8	general and specific theories	279
8.1	basic theories, relationships and disciplines	310

boxes

2.1	formal definitions of eliminability and non-creativity.....	50
4.1	culture is socially learned	137
4.2a	culture is behaviour	138
4.2b	culture is meta-behaviour	138
4.3a	patterns (ways of doing things: customs, habits, practices, etc.).....	139
4.3b	rules (incl. values, norms, attitudes, roles, structures etc.)	139
4.3c	institutions (formalised / codified rules, patterns and structures)	139
4.4a	categories (language, concepts, meaning, etc.).....	140
4.4b	beliefs (knowledge, ideas, theories, convictions, etc.).....	140
4.5a	tools and skills	140
4.5b	artefacts (objects, texts, the arts etc.).....	141
4.6	spiritual and intellectual aspects of culture.....	141
4.7	culture as the transformation and domination of nature	141
5.1	behavioural and meta-behavioural entities: formal symbols	165
5.2	most important interpretations of "culture" and "economy".....	173
6.1	excluded variables.....	197
8.1	an example of a T8.5a-like argument	291

*RETHINKING
THE CULTURE – ECONOMY
DIALECTIC*

