

University of Groningen

## Rethinking the culture-economy dialectic

Brons, Lajos Ludovic

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*

2005

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Brons, L. L. (2005). *Rethinking the culture-economy dialectic*. s.n.

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

*Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.*

*RETHINKING  
THE CULTURE – ECONOMY  
DIALECTIC*

THE HAGUE  LAJOS BRONS

ISBN 90-9019567-X

Cover art: Irene Kromhout

Figures and lay-out: Lajos Brons

Printing: Febodruk, Enschede

The research in this book was conducted at the Faculty of Spatial Sciences at the University of Groningen.

Contact / information: [lajos@lc.dds.nl](mailto:lajos@lc.dds.nl)

Copyright © Lajos Brons, 2005. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

*Rethinking the culture - economy dialectic*

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de  
Ruimtelijke Wetenschappen  
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen  
op gezag van de  
Rector Magnificus, dr. F. Zwarts,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen op  
maandag 27 juni 2005  
om 16.15 uur

door

**Lajos Ludovic Brons**

geboren op 12 september 1972  
te Nijmegen

Promotores: Prof. dr. P.H. Pellenbarg  
Prof. dr. R.W. Boomkens

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. dr. G.J. Ashworth  
Prof. dr. T.A.F. Kuipers  
Prof. dr. H. Voogd

# CONTENTS

## 1 / introduction

1 / 1 / the culture - economy dialectic .....	15
1 / 2 / the research project.....	17
1 / conceptual contestation and confusion .....	18
2 / language, culture and social science .....	19
1 / 3 / reading this book .....	21
1 / a note on reference.....	22
2 / symbols, formalisations and abbreviations .....	23

## 2 / on concepts and conceptual analysis

2 / 1 / introduction .....	27
1 / language, culture and reality .....	28
2 / on words and concepts.....	31
3 / this chapter.....	34
2 / 2 / conceptual analysis in philosophy .....	35
1 / a short history of conceptual analysis .....	35
2 / concepts and meaning outside analytic philosophy .....	41
3 / meaning, definition and reference.....	45
4 / summary and conclusions .....	50
2 / 3 / applied conceptual analysis .....	52
1 / terminology and CA in social and political science.....	53
2 / CA in nursing.....	56
3 / formal methods of / in CA .....	57
4 / summary and conclusions .....	59
2 / 4 / concepts, ideas and fashions.....	60
1 / history of concepts and ideas .....	60
2 / management fashions.....	63
3 / summary and conclusions .....	65
2 / 5 / polarity, dialectics and deconstruction .....	66
1 / polarity and the origins of dialectical thought .....	67
2 / dialectics and deconstruction .....	69
3 / summary, conclusions and the origins of the CED .....	70
2 / 6 / language and ontology.....	72
1 / metaphysics and ontology.....	72
2 / formal analysis of conceptual structures.....	75
3 / summary and conclusions.....	76

2 / 7 / a synthetic model and its application.....	77
1 / a general model of concepts for CA .....	77
2 / application of the model .....	82
3 / the analysis of the CED .....	86

### **3 / conceptual history of culture and economy**

3 / 1 / introduction .....	87
3 / 2 / reason, passion and civilisation .....	89
1 / reason, habit and passion .....	90
2 / social science, Enlightenment and "civilisation" .....	93
3 / summary .....	98
3 / 3 / conceptual history of "culture" .....	98
1 / the semasiology of "culture" .....	99
2 / the onomasiology of "culture" .....	102
3 / summary .....	104
3 / 4 / culture, civilisation and economy .....	104
1 / culture versus civilisation .....	105
2 / culture and civilisation in evolutionary anthropology .....	111
3 / the semasiology of "economy" .....	113
4 / summary .....	116
3 / 5 / entrepreneurship and dimensions of culture .....	116
1 / culture and entrepreneurship .....	116
2 / dimensions of culture .....	118
3 / summary .....	119
3 / 6 / culture, nature and geography .....	119
1 / the two histories of geography .....	120
2 / the CED in modern geography .....	125
3 / summary .....	127

### **4 / intensional mapping**

4 / 1 / introduction .....	129
4 / 2 / "culture": definitions and interpretations .....	130
4 / 3 / aspects of "culture" .....	136
1 / culture is human .....	136
2 / culture is socially learned .....	137
3 / culture and behaviour .....	138
4 / meaning, ideas, products of the mind .....	140
5 / less common aspects .....	141
6 / classification and meta-classification .....	142

4 / 4 / mapping "culture" .....	143
1 / cluster analysis .....	144
2 / formal concept analysis .....	146
4 / 5 / civilisation, economy, <i>anti-culture</i> .....	148
4 / 6 / notes towards conceptual reconstruction .....	150
<b>5 / conceptual reconstruction</b>	
5 / 1 / introduction .....	155
1 / social and representational ontologies of the CED .....	156
2 / this chapter .....	157
5 / 2 / "culture", "economy" and social ontology .....	158
1 / behaviour, meta-behaviour and aspects of "culture" .....	159
2 / primitives, symbols and meta-behavioural entities .....	163
3 / on the ontological status of meta-behaviour .....	167
4 / "culture" and "economy" as ontological categories .....	168
5 / 3 / the ontology of C-E relationships .....	170
5 / 4 / summary .....	172
<b>6 / operationalisation and measurement</b>	
6 / 1 / introduction .....	175
6 / 2 / meta-behavioural measures .....	176
1 / cross-cultural psychology and national culture .....	177
2 / indirect measurement of regional culture .....	183
3 / comparing meta-behavioural measures .....	212
6 / 3 / measuring the economy .....	214
1 / measures of wealth and growth .....	214
2 / measures of entrepreneurship .....	217
6 / 4 / concluding theoretical considerations .....	219
<b>7 / on theories and tests</b>	
7 / 1 / introduction .....	221
1 / testing for causality .....	222
2 / this chapter .....	225
7 / 2 / the first grand theory .....	226
1 / historical materialism .....	226
2 / stages and modernisation .....	232
3 / summary .....	237



7 / 3 / the second grand theory.....	238
1 / religion and entrepreneurship .....	240
2 / values and entrepreneurship.....	242
3 / summary .....	246
7 / 4 / a review of empirical tests .....	247
1 / wealth and cultural change .....	247
2 / cultural and other influences on entrepreneurship .....	249
3 / entrepreneurship and economic growth .....	253
4 / summary and conclusions.....	256
7 / 5 / <i>minor</i> theories of the CED .....	257
1 / embeddedness.....	257
2 / cultural conditions for economic growth .....	259
3 / culture, institutions and development .....	261
4 / the culture of consumption .....	264
5 / geographies of economic growth.....	265
6 / summary and conclusions.....	266
7 / 6 / further testing of the CED .....	267
1 / national culture and causal graphs .....	267
2 / regional culture and economy.....	272
3 summary and conclusions.....	277
7 / 7 / conclusions, results, and what remains untested.....	277
1 / a summary of conclusions.....	278
2 / what remains untested.....	279

## **8 / considerations and implications**

8 / 1 / introduction .....	281
8 / 2 / a review of theories, confirmations and refutations.....	282
1 / historical materialism.....	282
2 / the entrepreneurial spirit .....	285
8 / 3 / towards a synthetic theory of the CED .....	287
1 / meta-theoretical issues.....	287
2 / further thoughts on behaviour and meta-behaviour .....	289
3 / summary, synthesis.....	293
8 / 4 / science, society and the CED .....	293
1 / reinventing geography .....	294
2 / social science as empirical conceptual analysis.....	296
3 / culture, entrepreneurship and regional policy.....	298
4 / summary .....	299

8 / 5 / boundaries, anarchism and free choice .....	299
1 / against all boundaries: a plea for anarchism .....	300
2 / the myth of free choice .....	304
3 / against culture: summary and conclusion .....	305
8 / 6 / dissolution .....	306
1 / the <i>trialectic</i> .....	306
2 / confirmation and falsification .....	309
3 / science and meta .....	310
4 / coda .....	312
<b>epilogue</b> .....	317
<b>appendix</b> : municipality scores on cultural dimensions .....	321
<b>summary</b> .....	331
<b>samenvatting</b> (Dutch summary) .....	341
<b>references</b> .....	351

**figures**

1.1 "culture" or "cultural" in book titles in WorldCat database  
by year of publication..... 16

1.2 the structure of the book..... 21

2.1 Ogden & Richard's meaning triangle ..... 44

2.2 Sartori's (left) and Dahlberg's (right) meaning triangle ..... 54

2.3 definitions as intensional Venn-Euler diagrams ..... 55

2.4 series of binary oppositions ..... 70

2.5 concept lattice based on table 2.2 (example)..... 76

3.1 a triangle of combined dialectics ..... 124

4.1 levels of formalisation of meta-behaviour ..... 140

4.2 intensional clusters: dendrogram ..... 145

4.3 computer generated FCA lattice based on all attributes ..... 146

4.4 FCA lattice based on a subset of attributes..... 147

4.5 FCA lattice of "economy" ..... 149

4.6 FCA lattice of "culture" and "economy" ..... 150

5.1 a model of (individual) behaviour ..... 159

5.2 a model of social behaviour..... 161

5.3 a formal taxonomy of meta-behavioural entities ..... 164

7.1 correlation of causally related x and y at varying points  
of measurement (t) of x ..... 223

7.2 Burbelka's system of HM theories..... 229

7.3 causal graph of wealth (GDP) and cultural dimensions ..... 268

7.4 causal graph of wealth (GDP), institutions and competitiveness ..... 269

7.5 causal graph of wealth, culture and institutions: trends..... 270

8.1 a taxonomy of the first grand theory ..... 284

8.2 a taxonomy of the second grand theory and minor theories ..... 286

8.3 Venn-Euler diagrams of T8.5(a) and T8.6(a)..... 291

8.4 boundaries and choice ..... 305

8.5 the trialectic ..... 307

**maps**

4.1 mapping culture, literally..... 144

6.1 national cultures measured by Hofstede..... 179

6.2 Hofstede's dimensions (Europe, ca. 1970)..... 180

6.3 regional culture (Netherlands, 1997-1999)..... 184

6.4 factor 1: post-materialism (PMA; Netherlands, 1997-2003)..... 201

6.5	degree of urbanisation (U.durb; Netherlands, 2003) .....	202
6.6	residual of factor 1 (PMA-R; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	203
6.7	factor 2: Protestant conservatism (PRC; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	205
6.8	factor 3: individualism (IND; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	207
6.9	residual of factor 3 (IND-R; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	208
6.10	factor 4: egalitarian anti-conservatism (EAC; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	210
6.11	factor 5: dissatisfaction (DST; Netherlands, 1997-2003) .....	211
6.12	standardised average household income (Netherlands, 1998-2000) .....	216
6.13	entrepreneurship (Netherlands, 2001-2002) .....	218

## tables

1.1	"culture" and "economy" in titles and on the internet (June 2004) .....	16
1.2	symbols used throughout the book .....	23
2.1	percentage of articles on / in conceptual analysis by scientific field .....	52
2.2	formal context (example) .....	75
2.3	conceptual analysis as the specification of conceptual elements .....	84
2.4	the mapping stage .....	84
3.1	connotations of the male and female (examples) .....	88
4.1	concepts and aspects of "economy" .....	149
4.2	data matrix for intensional mapping of "culture" .....	151
5.1	relationships of varying strengths .....	171
5.2	possible combinations of strengths and directions .....	171
6.1	correlations between dimensions of culture .....	182
6.2	a comparison of dimensions .....	185
6.3	list of variables .....	186
6.4	weights for weighted average election variables in table 6.3 .....	189
6.5	demographic indicators of culture: birth and death .....	192
6.6	demographic indicators of culture: marriage and households .....	193
6.7	political indicators of culture .....	195
6.8	religious indicators of culture .....	196
6.9	other indicators of culture .....	196
6.10	correlations between dimensions .....	197
6.11	variance explained .....	198
6.12	factor correlation matrix .....	198
6.13a	factor 1: loadings (>0.5) and indicators .....	199
6.13b	factor 1: selected correlations (>0.4) to excluded and secondary variables .....	200
6.14	regression of PMA on U.durb, L.lfhe, and E.lti .....	200
6.15a	factor 2: loadings (>0.5) and indicators .....	204

6.15b	factor 2: correlations (>0.4) to excluded variables .....	204
6.16a	factor 3: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	206
6.16b	factor 3: correlations (>0.4) to secondary variables .....	206
6.17	regression of IND on E.ainc and L.lfhe.....	206
6.18	factor 4: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	209
6.19	factor 5: loadings (>0.5) and indicators.....	209
6.20	a comparison of measurements and dimensions.....	212
6.21	dimensions of regional culture: summary.....	213
7.1	concepts of "culture" and "economy" in the first grand theory .....	238
7.2	a typology of motivations and entrepreneurs.....	250
7.3	studies on start-ups and job creation.....	255
7.4	highest correlations between values, institutions, wealth and growth .....	271
7.5	correlations between regional culture and income in the Netherlands .....	273
7.6	regression models of new firm formation in the Netherlands (E.strt) .....	275
7.7	increase in R <sup>2</sup> by inclusion of cultural variables.....	276
7.8	general and specific theories .....	279
8.1	basic theories, relationships and disciplines .....	310

## boxes

2.1	formal definitions of eliminability and non-creativity.....	50
4.1	culture is socially learned .....	137
4.2a	culture is behaviour .....	138
4.2b	culture is meta-behaviour .....	138
4.3a	patterns (ways of doing things: customs, habits, practices, etc.).....	139
4.3b	rules (incl. values, norms, attitudes, roles, structures etc.) .....	139
4.3c	institutions (formalised / codified rules, patterns and structures) .....	139
4.4a	categories (language, concepts, meaning, etc.).....	140
4.4b	beliefs (knowledge, ideas, theories, convictions, etc.).....	140
4.5a	tools and skills .....	140
4.5b	artefacts (objects, texts, the arts etc.).....	141
4.6	spiritual and intellectual aspects of culture.....	141
4.7	culture as the transformation and domination of nature .....	141
5.1	behavioural and meta-behavioural entities: formal symbols .....	165
5.2	most important interpretations of "culture" and "economy".....	173
6.1	excluded variables.....	197
8.1	an example of a T8.5a-like argument .....	291

*RETHINKING  
THE CULTURE – ECONOMY  
DIALECTIC*

