

RIJKSUNIVERSITEIT GRONINGEN

**THE LEGAL STATUS AND SOCIAL PRACTICE OF
TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN THE NETHERLANDS**

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de
Rechtsgeleerdheid
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
Rector Magnificus, dr. F. Zwarts,
in het openbaar te verdedigen op
maandag 28 november 2005
om 13.15 uur

door

Cristiano Vezzoni
geboren op 12 februari 1972
te Casalmaggiore (Italië)

Promotor: Prof. J. Griffiths

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. M.P. Battin
Prof. D. Mieth
Prof. M.J. Trappenburg

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was made possible by a grant of Alzheimer Nederland, which funded the first year of my Ph.D, and by the generous support of the Faculty of Law of the University of Groningen, which provided financial support for the remaining period.

The research could have not been carried out without the collaboration of notaries, nursing home doctors and family doctors, who patiently accepted to be interviewed despite their pressing professional duties. The same is true for the several persons who directly contributed to important research tasks: the three student assistants, Christa Wiggers, Maartje Bijl and Francisca De Jong, who carried out the telephone interviews; Hans Konst, director of the nursing home De Batting, who offered me his knowledge and experience to improve my survey on nursing home doctors, Wijbrandt van Schuur, who helped me to set up the telephone interviews in an efficient computer format.

During my Ph.D., the Department of Legal Theory, with its secretaries, Yt, Elvira and Marije, and nice colleagues like Tobias, Jeanne and Jellienke, became a sort of second home and offered me a favourable professional and human environment to do at best my work. Moreover, the research group that went under the difficult acronym of MBPSL, represented a major point of reference. There I found intellectual inspiration, open-handed help and a lot of fruitful discussion. From Heleen, with her vast and precise knowledge about literature, from Albert, with his tireless passion in discussion; from Nicolle, Donald, Rob, Triny, Dick, Sofia, Graciela and Hannah; from Winnie, always ready to help, with a cheerful touch, when I was lost in a mess of references; and from Kim, with whom I overcame hours of discouragement but also shared hours of fun and inspiration.

My experience was enriched by the possibility to meet many colleagues from different countries and background at international conferences. These visits were mostly founded by the CRBS, whose members Joop Houtman and Barbara Hallebeek were always supportive.

A special thanks goes to Kris Kruze of the Administrative Office of the Faculty of Law. His friendly approach and his attitude to make as simple as possible boring and complicated bureaucratic procedures always surprised me.

In these years in Groningen, many people gave me the feeling of being at home. First, the people at the RKZ: Sanne, Alexandra, André, Anna, Otto, Eric, Roos and Esther, who made me part of their very special community. Then the ‘famiglia di frutti’, which is too broad to be fully listed; only few representatives then, but the other ones are not forgotten: Joyce, Sonja, Lenny, Branislava and Paolo. Next to them, all the people with whom I went through long, exhausting bike trips in the province of Groningen. Among them, Cornelia has a special place: with her I shared so many kilometres, *pittige* discussions and one of the most adventurous vacation I ever had. And finally Chau, whose grace and kindness was always a positive note; Faezeh, who, at the beginning, when I did not know anyone in Groningen, was the first person to come and wait for me at the station; and Eleonora, who was next to me all the times I was completely lost in a jungle of tasks, and patiently took me by the hand and helped me.

John Griffiths, my supervisor, deserves a special mention. His dedication and sharp thought still amaze me. I was very lucky to have found such a person, always ready to listen to my ideas, to support me in the difficult moments, and so extremely patient and careful to revise my work (and my shaky English). Without him, I am sure my research would have been of much less quality. I hope to be able to repay him, at least partly, in pumpkin seeds, which he likes growing so much.

Finally a special thanks to my family. Senza la loro comprensione e disponibilità disinteressata, non sarei mai riuscito a concludere con successo questa impresa non facile. A loro, mamma, papa, Monia e Marcella, zia Luigina, la mia gratitudine.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I

AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS AND ADVANCE DIRECTIVES

1. INTRODUCTION	11
2. DEFINITIONS	12
3. THE ETHICAL PERSPECTIVE: AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS	16

CHAPTER II

THE LEGAL STATUS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: AN INTERNATIONAL SURVEY

1. RESPECT FOR AUTONOMY AND INFORMED CONSENT IN THE MEDICAL SPHERE	21
2. INFORMED CONSENT IN SEVERAL COUNTRIES	24
3. AUTONOMY FOR INCOMPETENT PATIENTS: THE LEGAL STATUS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	26
4. SUMMARY	34

CHAPTER III

THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: ANALYSIS OF THE EMPIRICAL LITERATURE AND DEVELOPMENT OF A SYSTEMATIC ANALYTIC FRAMEWORK

1. THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE DEBATE ON TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	35
2. DEMAND FOR TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	39
3. FACTORS INFLUENCING THE COMPLETION OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	53
4. DRAFTING A TREATMENT DIRECTIVE	56
5. AVAILABILITY OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES: THE LATENCY PHASE	58
6. EFFECTS OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES ON CARE AT THE END-OF-LIFE	59
7. GENERAL SOCIAL EFFECTS OF THE USE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	62
8. SUMMARY	63

CHAPTER IV
TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN THE NETHERLANDS

1. TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN DUTCH LAW	69
2. OTHER KINDS OF ADVANCE DIRECTIVES UNDER DUTCH LAW	73
3. THE EXISTING EMPIRICAL DATA FOR THE NETHERLANDS	75

CHAPTER V
**EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF THE SOCIAL PRACTICE
OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES**

1. INTRODUCTION	79
2. THE MAIN ACTORS	81
3. A SHORT DESCRIPTION OF THE SOCIAL STRUCTURES AND RELATIONSHIPS INVOLVED IN THE PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES	84
4. THE RESEARCH CHOICES	85
5. THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS	88
6. DISCUSSION OF THE QUESTIONS	90
7. ORGANIZATION OF THE EMPIRICAL PART	95

CHAPTER VI
**THE ROLE OF NOTARIES IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE
OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES**

1. INTRODUCTION	97
2. THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS	99
3. METHODS	100
4. RESULTS	101
5. DISCUSSION	111

CHAPTER VII
**THE ROLE OF NURSING HOME DOCTORS IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE
OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES**

1. METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS	116
2. THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES IN DUTCH NURSING HOMES	123
3. DISCUSSION	136

CHAPTER VIII
**THE ROLE OF FAMILY DOCTORS IN THE SOCIAL PRACTICE
OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES**

1. METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS	141
2. THE SOCIAL PRACTICE OF TREATMENT DIRECTIVES AMONG DUTCH FAMILY DOCTORS	147
3. DISCUSSION	165

CONCLUSION

1. THE SETTING OF THE RESEARCH	169
2. RESULTS	173
3. REFLECTIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS	181

<u>REFERENCES</u>	185
--------------------------	-----

<u>SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)</u>	193
--	-----

