

University of Groningen

**Review of Ingram, Kevin (ed.). The Conversos and Moriscos in Late Medieval Spain and Beyond. Volume Four: Resistance and Reform (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 225), Leiden/Boston 2021, Brill**

Colominas Aparicio, Mònica

*Published in:*  
Zeitschrift für Historische Forschung

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*  
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*  
2022

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Colominas Aparicio, M. (2022). Review of Ingram, Kevin (ed.). The Conversos and Moriscos in Late Medieval Spain and Beyond. Volume Four: Resistance and Reform (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 225), Leiden/Boston 2021, Brill. *Zeitschrift für Historische Forschung*, 49(2), 265–266.

#### **Copyright**

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

#### **Take-down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

*Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.*

Handlungsform wie auch als gegenseitige Erwartungshaltung zu analysieren – vielleicht dann auch im Vergleich mit anderen Territorien.

Georg Eckert, Freiburg i. Br. / Wuppertal

*Ingram, Kevin* (Hrsg.), *The Conversos and Moriscos in Late Medieval Spain and Beyond*, Bd. 4: Resistance and Reform (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 225; Converso and Morisco Studies, 4), Leiden / Boston 2021, Brill, VI u. 284 S. / Abb., € 129,00.

Resistance and reform are the central issues in the fourth volume in this series edited by Ingram. The series, which began in 2009, offers comparative studies of Conversos and Moriscos. The essays of this volume outline the activities of these groups in the face of accusations of social taint, or “mancha”, levelled against them by Old Christians. The aim is to correct a historiography that has failed to move sufficiently in the direction initiated by Castro, whereby New Christians are more than the Inquisition’s passive subjects. Instead, that historiography often places them on the margins of culture and thought currents in Spain. The engaging essays collected here demonstrate that such participation did indeed take place; considered as a whole, they are more suggestive than conclusive, but they do an excellent job of disclosing how Converso and Morisco voices intermingled with and echoed those of Old Christians. Contributions on Conversos offer examples of individuals who helped elaborate the complex networks of

<https://elibrary.duncker-humblot.com/issue/6693/vol-49-2022-issue-2>

Only because Perea Siller makes a parallel case for the Moriscos, however. He discusses the spiritual borrowings and the Moriscos’ participation in brotherhoods which were imbued (as cannot be entirely ruled out) with Christian spirituality. The latter claim requires more research, the author notes, but the evidence at hand already seems to complicate a binary categorization between covert adherence to Islam and sincere conversion. It also suggests forms of devotion that straddle Catholicism and a reformed spirituality. This salient aspect of the Moriscos’ life experiences is not sufficiently addressed in the introduction. The introduction primarily focuses on the Conversos but the contributions provide enough material to address and problematize the question of the Moriscos’ share of the Christian frameworks of thought. In particular, Ingram would have needed to elaborate more on the notions of resistance and reform and the relationship between these in order to bridge the gap with the discussion of Conversos, and to truly accommodate the heterogeneous Morisco voices, not just those of resistance.

The essays seem to be arranged to reveal two distinct blocks (Conversos/Moriscos) in a timeframe that extends from the first half of the 15th century to the Morisco expulsions. Two essays on Conversos look at the reform of Christianity: one on Doctor Constantino’s “Doctrina Cristiana” (1548) (Boeglin) and one on John of Malara’s “Philosophia vulgar” (1568) (Ingram). These works advocated change and spiritual regeneration, and envisioned a unified and inclusive Christianity, centred on the scriptures rather than the Church. Malara, for example, emphasized a Judaism based on prayer. Perea Siller’s essay presents a renewed Christianity that promotes vernacular translations of the vulgate and Jewish traditions, and takes a particular approach to the Hebrew Bible. This aligns with the volume’s argument that some perspectives would have been unique to Conversos. They would have regarded the historical moment as providential, seeing themselves as the chosen people called to reform the faith. Underpinning these assumptions is the notion that nobility is asserted on personal merit

rather than lineage, and “limpieza de sangre” (purity of blood) is reread as a purification of the Church.

The Conversos’ agency is also felt in the drafting of the Basel’s decree (1434). This, Gilly argues, was undertaken at the behest of a group of Spaniards with Converso affiliations moved by the desire to facilitate the conversion of the Jews, and to give them rights equal to those of the Old Christians. The decree fell into oblivion in the late 15th century, regaining strength towards the middle of the 16th century, but the reasons for this change are not discussed. Jennings takes another case of Converso activities: patronage within the circle of Pablo de Santa María, particularly of monasteries. Patronage was part of the “curriculum of the nobility” (50) and was used accordingly by the Conversos to create an image of nobility that would help them heighten their visibility and ascend the social ladder. And it is visibility – or rather, manoeuvring for its control – that is the focus of one of the most refreshing essays on Conversos. Soria Mesa outlines the contours of a very specific social group, the “linajudos”, or professional lineage tracers, who extorted money from Conversos in exchange for keeping their origins secret. The next Morisco section is connected to the previous one with two contributions on the interpretation of the past. Ingram looks at a historiography of Converso or filo-Converso origin that aims to integrate the Jewish past; Saadan provides a new interpretation of the work by Mateo Alemán, perhaps a Converso, that sees the uses of the Muslim past as a veiled condemnation of the persecution of the Moriscos, especially after the revolt of the Alpujarras (1568–1571).

From the eighth chapter onwards, the volume places its focus on the Moriscos and mainly on resistance, thereby producing a somewhat unbalanced view of the agency of their groups. Childers analyses what he calls their “double resistance” in an attempt to integrate their strategies of rejection and collaboration under one conceptual umbrella. This is an interesting approach in itself and is much indebted to Fuchs’ notion of “Moorish habitus”, but the discussion here does not fully support the overly general conclusion that the expression of modern Spanish identity would have largely been the result of the Morisco promotion of Mudejar symbolic capital. Worth mentioning, in addition to the fine essay by Bernabé Pons, is the very interesting case study by O’Banion on the garden of Deza. This garden, acquired by Duke Juan for his son, was the refuge of a nucleus of Moriscos whose activities there helped to promote Islamic knowledge. From there, the knowledge was disseminated to a mixed audience, spreading outside the walls through networks of (crypto)-Muslims. Inquisitorial reports give an account of these Dezan networks and the meetings that the Christian overlords seem to have tacitly consented to. The contribution convincingly suggests that the local element that explains why Islam retained its appeal there for so long could also explain the same phenomenon in places other than Deza. Cavanaugh’s final essay deals with the expulsions of the Moriscos in the early 17th century, and their (often) unsuccessful strategies to avoid expulsion.

This volume offers valuable readings to a specialized audience and to an audience interested in the communities of converted Jews and Muslims. It provides important insights into the intricacies of how Conversos and Moriscos contributed to and participated in the currents of the Reformation, while also taking advantage of them to forge their identities, from a comparative perspective that has rarely been taken systematically. This comparison and some of the stimulating findings remain somewhat in the background here. Future studies will hopefully explore these more deeply.

Mònica Colominas Aparicio, Groningen