

## University of Groningen

### Customer loyalty & face concerns

Zhang, Sha

**IMPORTANT NOTE:** You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

*Document Version*  
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*  
2015

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Zhang, S. (2015). *Customer loyalty & face concerns: Differences between Eastern (Chinese) and Western (Dutch) consumers*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen, SOM research school.

#### **Copyright**

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

#### **Take-down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Customer Loyalty & Face Concerns:  
Differences between Eastern (Chinese) and  
Western (Dutch) Consumers

Sha Zhang

Customer Loyalty & Face Concerns: Differences between Eastern (Chinese) and Western (Dutch) Consumers

Publisher: University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

Printing: Ipskamp Drukkers, Enschede

ISBN: 978-90-367-8043-8

ISBN (e-book): 978-90-367-8042-1

© Sha Zhang

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any way without prior permission of the author.



**university of  
 groningen**

# **Customer Loyalty & Face Concerns**

Differences between Eastern (Chinese) and Western (Dutch) Consumers

## **PhD thesis**

to obtain the degree of PhD at the  
University of Groningen  
on the authority of the  
Rector Magnificus Prof. E. Sterken  
and in accordance with  
the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Thursday 10 September 2015 at 12.45 hours

by

**Sha Zhang**

born on 15 December 1982  
in Sichuan, China

**Supervisor**

Prof. P.S.H. Leeflang

**Co-supervisor**

Dr. J. van Doorn

**Assessment Committee**

Prof. K. van Ittersum

Prof. H. van Herk

Prof. H. Zhao

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Seven years ago, on a sunny, beautiful, September morning, I started my adventure as a double PhD degree candidate at the University of Chinese Academy of Sciences (UCAS) and University of Groningen (RuG), with dual feelings of excitement and uncertainty, ambition and doubts. The adventure has been challenging, but because of you, here I am at its conclusion.

To start, I thank my supervisor and co-supervisor: Prof. Peter S.H. Leeftang and Dr. Jenny van Doorn, who accompanied me all along this adventure.

Peter: I have learned enormously from you over the years. The most impressive two aspects are your rigorousness in research and your caring for people. When I cast my mind back to seven years ago, I still remember the first day I entered your office. You gave me a big, warm hug to reduce my nervousness, and you arranged a welcome dinner at your house, where I had authentic Western food made by Hanneke. I was thinking to myself how incredibly fortunate I was to have become your student. Yet soon I also realized that being your student was not at all easy! You pushed me to take courses and exams, wrote me countless emails, sent me piles of handwritten comments, and shipped me half of the books in your office. Thank you for being so nice and so strict, which is both your wisdom and your personal charm.

Jenny: You also have two impressive aspects, in my mind, namely, sharp comments and hearty laughter. In the beginning, I was afraid of your comments, because they meant extra work. Later though, I became so fond of them that I enjoyed the process of incorporating your comments. Throughout the difficult revision process, I have learned how to write a paper with sound reasoning and theory. Such experience is truly a gift, and it has been worth more than any qualification I ever earned.

I know that my debt to both of you is beyond measure!

I also owe my deepest thanks to my Chinese supervisor, Prof. Hong Zhao, and my co-author on Chapter 4, Dr. Jia Liu.

Hong: Had I not met you, I probably would never have attempted this double PhD track or pursued a academic career at UCAS. The many nice words you said about me publicly on different occasions remain in my ears. Thank you for your firm faith in me and for offering unyielding support over many turning points in my life.

Jia: Thank you for investing so much time in Chapter 4 and encouraging me to believe in myself. To me, you are not only my CB mentor but one of my best friends for life. The delicious dishes you made, the girl chats we had, and the Chinese television shows we watched—those I will never forget.

Next, I thank my reading committee members, Prof. Hester van Herk (VU University Amsterdam), Prof. Koert van Ittersum (RuG), and Prof. Hong Zhao (UCAS). Thank you for devoting such time and effort to read my dissertation. I am very grateful for your insightful comments and thoughtful suggestions. I also owe thanks to the reading committee for my internal defense: Prof. Peter C. Verhoef, Prof. Bob M. Fennis, Prof. Koert van Ittersum, and Dr. Jia Liu, all of whom provided valuable, constructive feedback.

Although my time at the marketing department of RuG lasted only two years and four months, I really enjoyed being a member of this big marketing family, and I am profoundly grateful to all my former colleagues. Special thanks go to Prof. Jaap E. Wieringa, Prof. Peter C. Verhoef, and Prof. Tammo B.A. Bijmolt, whose courses provided me with the best education during the first year of my PhD. I am sure that, in the rest of my life, I will continue benefit from this education. I also thank Janny C. Hoekstra for the big smiles, which brought me more warmth and strength than you could possibly know. Another positive surprise during this adventure has been the friends I made, whose value is truly above the price of rubies. I owe many thanks to Eline de Vries, Yi-Chun Ou, and Titah Yudhistira.

Eline: I had never thought I could be so close with a “foreign” friend, the type of friend with whom I feel comfortable sharing a room, disclosing my secrets, and turning to in times of trouble. I am confident that our friendship cannot fade with time or distance. Thank you for every nice thing you have done for me, such as helping me with the Dutch summary to this thesis and flying all the way from Spain to be my paronymph!

Yi-Chun: I still remember the temperature of the breeze as we biked home every Wednesday evening after swim class in Alco. From you, I learned the virtue of perseverance and an optimistic attitude.

Titah: Thank you for being so nice and helpful. I was so lucky to share an office with you.

In addition, let me express my sincere thanks to Qijun Zhang, Auke Hunneman, Matilda Dorotic, Peter van Eck, Daniela Naydenova, Lisette de Vries, Stefanie Salmon, Hans Risselada, Ernst Osinga, Jelle T. Bouma, Jacob Wiebenga, Sander Beckers, and Niels Holtrop for the great times we spent together during coffee breaks, ladies’ nights, PhD outings, department gatherings, Sintekerst celebrations, EMAC conferences, and other cooking activities. I will always carry these good memories in the years to come.

Special thanks go to Rina, Ellen, and Arthur from the SOM office. Rina initiated the double PhD degree program, which has undoubtedly changed the lives of many Chinese PhD students, including me. Ellen was unfailingly nice and warm-hearted to me. Arthur provided invaluable help, writing dozens of invitation letters. I also thank Hanneke, Frederika, Lianne, and Annicka from the secretary office of the marketing department for their help, especially with sending so many boxes of books to China. And Elisabeth, thank you for proofreading my thesis.

Part of my dissertation was finished at UCAS, with enormous help from many colleagues and friends. I am especially grateful to Prof. Shouyang Wang, Prof. Jichang Dong, Prof. Benfu Lv, Prof. Yong Shi, and Prof. Xianhua Wei for agreeing to allow me to pursue my academic career at UCAS and giving me the opportunity, as well as flexibility, to finish my dissertation. I also thank my colleagues, such as Ping Lv, Qian Wang, Lingling Zhang, Jian Xu, Wei Liang, and many others, for their warm welcome and support. You make UCAS a nice place to work.

Completing a PhD is not always a fun adventure, and so I owe sincere thanks to—Wen Zhang and Li Zhu—because after every dinner with you, I left with a totally refreshed and happy mind. My gratitude also extends to many other friends I made in the Netherlands and China, especially Rujie Qu, Yanping Zhao, Xin Fan, Xiao Wang, Feng Hu, Pengyue Lv, Chenming Peng, Huan Liu,

Ying Gao, Kelly Liu, Lisa Gong, Kaiyuan Deng, Chunxiao Liu, and Jian Ye, for their help in different ways.

I am grateful for financial support from the research school SOM and the National Natural Science Foundation for Chinese Young Scholars (Grant No.71302126).

I thank my parents. To make me feel less lonely in the Netherlands, my father got up every winter midnight, to overcome the distance and chat with me online. To let me concentrate on my studies, they disguised their own health concerns. My father had a big surgery this year, when I tasted true fear. I pray in my heart that I will be able to sacrifice everything I have, in exchange for your health, as you have done for me.

Last but not least, I would not have gotten here without the strongest support from my husband. Yagang, thank you for your patience and tolerance. After all the academic and family challenges we have faced, I truly realize the strength of our relationship, even in the face of adversity. It's so nice to spend my life with you.

Sha (Sandy)

July 2015





# CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
<b>1.1 Introduction</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>1.2 Customer Loyalty</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1.3 Face Concerns</b>	<b>5</b>
1.3.1 <i>Face and Culture</i>	5
1.3.2 <i>Face and Price</i>	6
1.3.3 <i>Face and Cross-Cultural Marketing</i>	7
<b>1.4 Structure of the Dissertation</b>	<b>8</b>
1.4.1 <i>Chapter 2: Review of China's Marketing Mix</i>	9
1.4.2 <i>Chapter 3: Cross-Cultural Differences in Customer Loyalty Drivers</i>	10
1.4.3 <i>Chapter 4: Marketing Mix–Face Relations</i>	10
CHAPTER 2: CHANGING CONSUMER MARKETS AND MARKETING IN CHINA	13
<b>2.1 Introduction: Rise of Chinese Consumer Markets</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>2.2 Characteristics of Emerging Markets</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>2.3 Characteristics of Chinese Consumer Behavior</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>2.4 Review of the “Macro Marketing Mix”</b>	<b>18</b>
2.4.1 <i>Product/Brand Decisions</i>	18
2.4.2 <i>Price Sensitivity</i>	21
2.4.3 <i>Distribution Channels</i>	22
2.4.4 <i>Advertising Persuasiveness</i>	23
2.4.5 <i>Sales Promotion Effectiveness</i>	25
2.4.6 <i>Future Research Directions</i>	26
<b>2.5 Conclusion and Limitations</b>	<b>26</b>
CHAPTER 3: CROSS-CULTURAL DIFFERENCES IN CUSTOMER LOYALTY DRIVERS	33
<b>3.1 Introduction</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>3.2 Theoretical Background</b>	<b>35</b>
3.2.1 <i>Cultural-Driven Differences in Chinese Consumer Behaviour</i>	35
3.2.2 <i>Conceptual Framework</i>	37
<b>3.3 Hypotheses Development</b>	<b>38</b>
3.3.1 <i>Value Equity and Culture</i>	38
3.3.2 <i>Brand Equity and Culture</i>	38
3.3.3 <i>Relationship Equity and Culture</i>	39
<b>3.4 Research Method</b>	<b>40</b>
3.4.1 <i>Survey Design</i>	40
3.4.2 <i>Sampling and Data Collection</i>	40
3.4.3 <i>Measures</i>	42
3.4.4 <i>Measurement Invariance Test</i>	42
3.4.5 <i>Common Method Bias</i>	45
3.4.6 <i>Method</i>	45
<b>3.5 Results and General Discussion</b>	<b>46</b>
3.5.1 <i>Results</i>	46
3.5.2 <i>General Discussion</i>	48
<b>3.6 Conclusions and Implications</b>	<b>50</b>

CHAPTER 4: FACE CONCERNS AND PURCHASE INTENTIONS: A CROSS-CULTURAL PERSPECTIVE	53
<b>4.1 Introduction</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>4.2 Theoretical Development</b>	<b>56</b>
4.2.1 <i>The Concept of Face</i>	56
4.2.2 <i>Face and Culture</i>	57
4.2.3 <i>The Price–Face Link</i>	59
4.2.4 <i>The Brand–, Distribution–, and Promotion–Face Links</i>	61
4.2.5 <i>Comparing Face, Social Status, and Status Consumption</i>	62
<b>4.3 Study 1a: Product Visibility as a Moderator</b>	<b>63</b>
4.3.1 <i>Method</i>	63
4.3.2 <i>Results</i>	65
4.3.3 <i>Conclusions and Discussion</i>	67
<b>4.4 Study 1b: Product Tangibility as a Moderator</b>	<b>69</b>
4.4.1 <i>Method</i>	70
4.4.2 <i>Results</i>	70
4.4.3 <i>Hypotheses Test Results</i>	71
4.4.4 <i>Conclusions and Discussion</i>	72
<b>4.5 Study 2: Social Presence as a Moderator</b>	<b>75</b>
4.5.1 <i>Method</i>	77
4.5.2 <i>Results</i>	79
4.5.3 <i>Conclusions and Discussion</i>	86
<b>4.6 Additional Analyses</b>	<b>88</b>
4.6.1 <i>Using Individual Differences in CFF Scores</i>	88
4.6.2 <i>Moderated Mediation Analysis</i>	88
4.6.3 <i>Posttests</i>	93
<b>4.7 Conclusion and General Discussion</b>	<b>94</b>
4.7.1 <i>Why Almost All Main Effects Are Significant?</i>	94
4.7.2 <i>Why Almost No Moderating Effects Are Significant?</i>	95
4.7.3 <i>Implications, Limitations, and Future Research</i>	97
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS, AND FUTURE RESEARCH	99
<b>5.1 Main Findings</b>	<b>100</b>
5.1.1 <i>Chapter 2: Literature Review of China’s Marketing Mix</i>	100
5.1.2 <i>Chapter 3: Cross-Cultural Differences in Customer Loyalty</i>	101
5.1.3 <i>Chapter 4: Marketing Mix–Face Relations</i>	101
<b>5.2. Discussion of the Results</b>	<b>103</b>
5.2.1 <i>Chinese Consumers’ Loyalty Intentions Is Higher Than Dutch Consumers’</i>	103
5.2.2 <i>Marketing Mix–Face Relations</i>	103
<b>5.3 Contributions and Implications</b>	<b>104</b>
5.3.1 <i>Theoretical Contributions</i>	104
5.3.2 <i>Managerial Implications</i>	105
<b>5.4 Limitations and Future Research</b>	<b>106</b>
<b>5.5 Final Thoughts</b>	<b>106</b>
REFERENCES	109

APPENDICES	123
<b>Appendix A1. Measures for Study 1a</b>	124
<b>Appendix A2. Measures for Study 1b</b>	125
<b>Appendix A3. Measures for Study 2</b>	126
<b>Appendix B. Glossary of Terms</b>	127
<b>Appendix C. Scales Used to Test the Two Assumptions</b>	128
<b>Appendix D. Sample PROCESS Macro for SPSS</b>	130
<b>Appendix E. Moderated Mediation Results of Study 1a: Mediating Role of the Price–Face Link</b>	131
<b>Appendix F. Moderated Mediation Results of Study 2a: Mediating Role of the Price–Face Link</b>	132
<b>Appendix G. Moderated Mediation Results of Study 2b: Mediating Role of the Distribution–Face Link</b>	133
<b>Appendix H. Moderated Mediation Results of Study 2c: Mediating Role of the Brand–Face Link</b>	134
<b>Appendix I. Moderated Mediation Results of Study 2d: Mediating Role of the Promotion–Face Link</b>	135
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	137
<b>Introduction</b>	138
<b>Cross-Cultural Differences in Customer Loyalty Drivers</b>	138
<b>Cross-Cultural Differences in Face Concerns</b>	139
NEDERLANDSTALIGE SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)	142
<b>Inleiding</b>	143
<b>Cross-culturele verschillen in oorzaken van klantloyaliteit</b>	143
<b>Cross-culturele verschillen in face concern</b>	144

