

University of Groningen

Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Efriandi, Tri

DOI:
[10.33612/diss.155466640](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2021

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Efriandi, T. (2021). *Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia: Four case studies on public service provision and democratization in Papua and West Papua*. University of Groningen. <https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Appendices

Appendix A: List of policy documents

Chapter 2:

No	Document Name	Type of documents	Year
1	Regional autonomy	Law No. 5	1974
2	Regional autonomy	Law No. 22	1999
3	Special Autonomy for Papua Province	Law No. 21	2001
4	Regional Autonomy	Law No. 32	2004
5	Teacher and Lecturer	Law No. 14	2005
6	Regional Autonomy	Law No. 23	2014
7	Professional Allowance for Teacher and Lecturer, Special Allowance for Teacher and Lecturer, and Honorary Allowance for Professor	Government Regulation No. 41	2009
8	Local Government Work Unit Structure	Government Regulation No. 18	2016
9	Minimum Service Standard	Government Regulation No. 2	2018
10	Sub-District	Government Regulation No. 17	2018
11	Additional Allowance for Civil Service Teachers	Presidential Decree No. 52	2009
12	Minimum Service Standard for Primary Education	Minister of Education Decree No. 15	2010
13	Minimum Service Standard for Primary Education	Minister of Education Decree No. 23	2013
14	Technical Guidance of School Operational Assistance	Minister of Education Decree No. 8	2017
15	Technical Guidance of School Operational Assistance	Minister of Education Decree No. 1	2018
16	Educational Management	Papua Provincial Regulation No. 2	2013
17	Regional Education Report	Annual Report 2017	2018

Chapter 3:

No	Document Name	Type of documents	Year
1	National spatial planning	Government Regulation No. 26	2008
2	Code and Data of Government Territorial Administration	Minister of Home Affairs Decree No. 137	2017
3	Community health center	Minister of Health Decree No. 75	2014
4	Minimum Service Standard of Health sector	Minister of Health Decree No. 43	2016
5	Spatial planning of Papua province	Papua Provincial Regulation No. 23	2013
6	Spatial planning of Asmat district	Asmat District Regulation No.6	2012

Chapter 4:

No	Document Name	Type of documents	Year
1	Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia 1945	Constitutional Law 4 th Amendment	1945
2	Regional autonomy	Law No. 22	1999
3	Proliferation of Central Irian Jaya Province, West Irian Jaya Province, Paniai district, Mimika district, Puncak Jaya district and Sorong city	Law No. 45	1999
4	Special Autonomy for Papua Province	Law No. 21	2001
5	Water resources	Law No. 7	2004
6	Regional autonomy	Law No. 32	2004
7	Regional autonomy	Law No. 23	2014
8	Water resources	Law No. 17	2019
9	Change of name of West Irian Jaya province to West Papua province	Government Regulation No.24	2007
10	Drinking water service system	Government Regulation No.122	2015
11	Local government-owned utility	Government Regulation No. 54	2017
10	Judicial review of Law No.7/2004	Constitutional Court Decision No. 85/PUU-XI/2013	2013
11	National committee for COVID-19 and Economic recovery	Presidential Regulation No. 82	2020
12	Implementation of Law No.45/1999	Presidential Instruction No. 1	2003
13	Drinking water rates	Minister of Home Affairs Decree No. 71	2016
14	Revision of Minister of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration decree No. 11/2019 on the priority of Village budget implementation in 2020	Minister of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration decree No. 6	2020
15	PDAM of Manokwari	Local government regulation No. 5	1993

Chapter 5:

No	Document Name	Type of documents	Year
1	Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia 1945	Constitutional Law 4 th Amendment	1945
2	Regional autonomy	Law No. 22	1999
3	Regional autonomy	Law No. 32	2004
4	Regional autonomy	Law No. 23	2014
5	Local executive elections	Law No. 10	2016
6	General elections	Law No. 7	2017
7	Decision on the dispute over national and local parliament election results in 2009.	Constitutional Court Decision No. 47-81/PHPU.A-VII/2009	2009
8	Technical guidance for the use of the <i>noken</i> bag to replace ballot boxes.	Papua Election Commission Decision No. 01/Kpts/KPU Prov.030/2013	2013

Appendix B: List of interviewees

Chapter 2:

No	Position	Organization	Interview Date	Location
1	Director of Regional Autonomy	Ministry of National Development Planning / National Development Planning Agency	7/02/2018	Jakarta
2	Head of Sub-Directorate of Papua and West Papua Province	Ministry of Home Affairs	8/02/2018	Jakarta
3	Director & Policy Trainer	Center for Capacity Building and Networking, Faculty of Social and Politics, Gadjah Mada University	15/2/2018	Yogyakarta
4	Head of Planning Section	Local Education Department of Jayawijaya District	12/03/2018	Wamena
5	Chairman	Christian Education Foundation	7/03/2018	Jayapura
6	Chairman	Islamic Education Foundation of Jayawijaya	12/03/2018	Wamena
7	Chairman	Christian Education Foundation of Jayawijaya	13/03/2018	Wamena
8	Trustee	Social Foundation for Remote Community	12/03/2018	Wamena
9	Trustee	Wamena Christian Foundation	14/03/2018	Wamena
10	Teacher & Foundation Trustee	Catholic Education and School Foundation of Jayawijaya	12/03/2018	Wamena
11	Teacher	Wamena Christian Foundation	14/03/2018	Wamena
12	Teacher	Social Foundation for Remote Community	12/03/2018	Wamena

Chapter 4:

No	Position	Organization	Interview Date	Location
1	Head of Department	Department of Local Development Planning, District of Manokwari	08/01/2019	Manokwari
2	Head of Division	Division of Local Governance, District of Manokwari	10/01/2019	Manokwari
3	Staff, Financial Department	PDAM of Manokwari	07/01/2019	Manokwari
4	Head of Technical Division	PDAM of Manokwari	07/01/2019	Manokwari
5	Director	PDAM of Manokwari	09/01/2019	Manokwari
6	Head of Section Regional II, Sub-Directorate of Local Government-owned Water Utility, Waste and Sanitation.	Directorate General of Regional Finance, Ministry of Home Affairs	12/12/2018	Jakarta
7	Director of Local Government Revenue	Directorate General of Regional Finance, Ministry of Home Affairs	11/12/2018	Jakarta
8	Staff, Sub-Directorate Regional IV	Directorate General of Regional Development, Ministry of Home Affairs	17/12/2018	Jakarta
9	Head of Sub-Directorate Regional II	Directorate General of Regional Development, Ministry of Home Affairs	18/12/2018	Jakarta
10	Head of Sub Directorate of Drinking Water	Directorate of Urban Development, Housing and Settlement Areas, Ministry of Planning	02/01/2019	Jakarta
11	Expert Staff Member 1, Papua and West Papua Development Acceleration Team	Ministry of Planning	02/01/2019	Jakarta

No	Position	Organization	Interview Date	Location
12	Expert Staff Member 2, Papua and West Papua Development Acceleration Team	Ministry of Planning	02/01/2019	Jakarta
13	Head of Division	Directorate of Health Care Facilities, Ministry of Health	01/02/2019	Jakarta
14	Head of Technical Support Department	The Supporting Agency for Drinking Water Supply System Development (BPPSPAM), Ministry of Public Works	04/01/2019	Jakarta

Chapter 5:

No	Position	Organization	Interview Date	Location
1	Commissioner	National election commission	19/02/2018	Jakarta
2	Government officer	Ministry of Home Affairs	08/02/2018	Jakarta
3	Government officer	National election supervisory agency	15/02/2018	Jakarta
4	Government officer	District government of Jayawijaya	12/03/2018	Wamena
5	Government officer	District government of Jayawijaya	12/03/2018	Wamena

Events attended:

No	Name and Description	Date	Location
1	Inter-ministerial meeting: “Monitoring and evaluation of special autonomy implementation in the provinces of Papua and West Papua” organized by the Ministry of Home Affairs.	15/02/2018	Jakarta
2	Seminar & book launching “ <i>Tambal sulam sistem Noken: Laporan lanjutan pilkada serentak di Papua</i> (Patchworking the <i>Noken</i> system: A follow-up report of simultaneous local executive elections in Papua) organized by <i>Perkumpulan untuk Pemilihan umum dan Demokrasi</i> (Association for elections and democracy).	31/03/2018	Jakarta

Appendix C: Semi-structured interview guidelines

Chapter 2

I. Semi-structured interviews with the national government ministries and academic scholars

Key questions:

1. Despite the extra budget allocation to the province, why the educational development in Papua is still underperforming?
2. Which factors do you think as the major factors that hinder the educational development in Papua ?
3. What are the policy interventions that have been arranged? and what are the policy obstacles?
4. Have the role of educational foundations been recognized after the arrangement of decentralization?
5. What is your suggestion to improve the development of education sector in Papua?

II. Semi-structured interviews with the local government of Jayawijaya district and educational foundations

Key questions:

1. What are the main problems on the development of primary education in Jayawijaya?
2. Why did the problem of teacher absenteeism emerge? How monitoring mechanisms were conducted?
3. What incentives and/or disincentives that have been exercised? How those were conducted?
4. What is the role of the educational foundations in provisioning educational services?
5. How decentralization facilitated and/or hampered the role of educational foundations in delivering educational services in Jayawijaya?
6. In your opinion, what should be improved for the educational development in Jayawijaya?

Chapter 4

I. Semi-structured interviews with the national government ministries, BPPSPAM and PERPAMSI

Key questions:

1. What are the major challenges in the management of drinking water services in Indonesia? What are the dominant factors of those challenges, technical or non-technical factors?
2. Since water-related responsibilities are fragmented between different Ministries and between the central and local government, how coordination is conducted? What factors that hindered its effectivity and effectiveness?
3. How is the management of PDAMs after the establishment of decentralization? How the major role of local government leaders under decentralization could affect the management of PDAMs?
4. Since water is constitutionally perceived as a public good and thus its provision should be conducted primarily by the state, how PDAMs as the local government-owned utility could play their important role effectively, despite the fact that most PDAMs in Indonesia have a weak managerial performance?
5. What are the policy instruments that have been arranged? and what are the obstacles?

II. Semi-structured interview with the local government of Manokwari district and PDAM of Manokwari

Key questions:

1. What are the major challenges in delivering drinking water services in Manokwari district?
2. How water-related issues are coordinated between the central government, provincial government, district government and PDAM? What are the challenges?
3. How tariff was determined? Are there any local political conflicts and how the current tariff structure could meet the appropriate level of PDAM's cost recovery?

4. What are the incentives or compensations that have been provided by the district government to improve the managerial and financial performance of PDAM?
5. What are your suggestions to improve the development of drinking water services in Manokwari district?

Chapter 5

Semi-structured interviews with Ministry of Home Affairs, National Election Commission and National Election Supervisory Agency, Perludem and District Government of Jayawijaya.

Key questions:

1. What is the historical background of the *noken* system? And why this system has become more prominent after the establishment of decentralization?
2. If there are no regulations or standard procedures for the *noken* system, how this system is implemented? Particularly, how to monitor its arrangement? What are the difficulties need to overcome?
3. Were there any relations between the *noken* system and the electoral governance problems in Papua?
4. How the *noken* system might result in voters' disenfranchisement and could potentially trigger conflicts over the election results?
5. Were there any policy designs on how this system could be integrated in the national election system? What are the crucial problems could emerge and how to address the problems?

Appendix D: Codes used for analysis

The code used for qualitative data analysis is presented in this appendix. Policy documents and interview results were primarily coded in the deductive method with the assistance of Atlas.ti software. The code tree for the various chapters is structured as follows:

1. Family code
 - a. Sub-code

Chapter 2

1. Policy strategies
 - a. Central control
 - b. Local discretion
2. Incentives
 - a. Adaptability
 - b. Effectiveness
3. Governance mechanisms
 - a. Authority structures
 - b. Organizational structures
 - i. Territorial
 - ii. Sectoral
 - c. Accountability structures

Chapter 4

1. Macro-level
 - a. Policy instruments
 - b. Institutional changes
 - c. Distribution of responsibilities
2. Meso-level
 - a. Perceptions of coordination
 - i. Horizontal
 - ii. Vertical

3. Micro-level
 - a. Mandates
 - i. Contradictory
 - ii. Consistent
 - b. Principal-agent interactions
 - i. Command & control
 - ii. Autonomy

Chapter 5

1. Pre-election
 - a. Legal framework
 - b. Electoral governance
2. On election day
 - a. Voting methods
 - b. Incompatibility
3. Post-election
 - a. Conflicts' emergence

