

University of Groningen

## Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Efriandi, Tri

DOI:  
[10.33612/diss.155466640](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640)

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*  
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*  
2021

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*  
Efriandi, T. (2021). *Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia: Four case studies on public service provision and democratization in Papua and West Papua*. University of Groningen. <https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640>

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

# Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Four case studies on public service provision and democratization in Papua and West Papua



**Tri Efriandi**

Cover design: Sukutangan | [www.sukutangan.com](http://www.sukutangan.com)

Layout design: Tri Efriandi

English editorial work and advice: Charlie Robinson-Jones & Priya Visavadia | [www.thinkdippy.com](http://www.thinkdippy.com)

Dutch summary: Oscar Couwenberg

© Tri Efriandi, 2021

All rights are reserved. No parts of this thesis may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission of the author.



university of  
 groningen

# Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Four case studies on public service provision and  
 democratization in Papua and West Papua

**PhD thesis**

to obtain the degree of PhD at the  
 University of Groningen  
 on the authority of the  
 Rector Magnificus Prof. C. Wijmenga  
 and in accordance with  
 the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on  
 Thursday 28 January 2021 at 12.45 hours

by

**Tri Efriandi**

born on 11 April 1984  
 in Muara Enim, Indonesia

## **Supervisors**

Prof. R.L. Holzacker

Prof. O. Couwenberg

## **Assessment Committee**

Prof. E.J.M.M. Arts

Prof. J.H. de Wilde

Prof. B. Setiawan

*“An educated person must learn to act justly, beginning, first of all,  
with his thoughts, then later in his deeds.”*

Pramoedya Ananta Toer  
This Earth of Mankind (1980)



# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>List of tables and figures</b>   | <b>11</b> |
| <b>Chapter 1 Introduction</b>   | <b>13</b> |
| 1.1 Moving away from the center and the resurgence of local governments: an overview  | 15        |
| 1.2 Linking decentralization, governance, and geography   | 17        |
| 1.3 Understanding decentralization as a principal-agent relationship  | 22        |
| 1.4 Decentralization in Indonesia and the case study of Papua and West Papua  | 24        |
| 1.5 Research strategy and methodology   | 30        |
| 1.5.1 Research aims   | 30        |
| 1.5.2 Research question   | 31        |
| 1.5.3 Methodology   | 33        |
| 1.5.4 Case selection  | 34        |
| 1.5.5 Data collection   | 36        |
| 1.6 Thesis outline  | 37        |
| References  | 40        |
| <b>Chapter 2 Decentralization and public service provision: A case study of the education sector in Jayawijaya District, Papua, Indonesia</b> | <b>49</b> |
| Abstract  | 50        |
| 2.1 Introduction  | 51        |
| 2.2 Theoretical background  | 52        |
| 2.2.1 Decentralization: definition, concept and practice  | 52        |
| 2.2.2 Multi-level governance  | 55        |
| 2.2.3 Decentralization and agency problems  | 57        |
| 2.3 Research design   | 59        |
| 2.3.1 The case study of Jayawijaya district, Papua  | 59        |



|                  |  |            |
|------------------|--|------------|
| 2.3.2            | Methodology  | 62         |
| 2.3.3            | Social and scientific significance   | 64         |
| 2.4              | Analysis   | 65         |
| 2.4.1            | Uniformity of policy   | 65         |
| 2.4.2            | The problems with incentives   | 69         |
| 2.4.3            | Poor monitoring and the misalignment of territorial and functional structures  | 73         |
| 2.5              | Conclusion   | 75         |
|                  | References   | 77         |
| <b>Chapter 3</b> | <b>Spatial access to health care: A case study on community health centers in Asmat district, Papua, Indonesia</b>                                     | <b>81</b>  |
|                  | Abstract   | 82         |
| 3.1              | Introduction   | 83         |
| 3.1.1            | Defining access to health care   | 85         |
| 3.1.2            | Assessing potential spatial accessibility  | 85         |
| 3.2              | Methods  | 87         |
| 3.2.1            | The case study of Asmat district   | 87         |
| 3.2.2            | Data sources   | 90         |
| 3.2.3            | Applying the 2SFCA method  | 92         |
| 3.3              | Results  | 97         |
| 3.4              | Conclusion   | 106        |
|                  | References   | 110        |
| <b>Chapter 4</b> | <b>Decentralization and institutional design of water governance: The case of drinking water services in Manokwari district, West Papua, Indonesia</b> | <b>113</b> |
|                  | Abstract   | 114        |
| 4.1              | Introduction   | 115        |
| 4.2              | Theoretical background   | 118        |
| 4.2.1            | Institutions and governance  | 118        |
| 4.2.2            | Water governance and decentralization  | 119        |
| 4.2.3            | Framing governance into a principal-agent approach   | 122        |

|                  |  |            |
|------------------|--|------------|
| 4.2.4            | Institutional design as guidance for analysis: definition, distinction, and application  | 124        |
| 4.3              | Methodology  | 126        |
| 4.3.1            | A case study approach  | 126        |
| 4.3.2            | Data collection and analysis   | 128        |
| 4.4              | Drinking water governance in Indonesia   | 130        |
| 4.5              | Analysis   | 132        |
| 4.5.1            | Macro-level  | 132        |
| 4.5.2            | Meso-level   | 139        |
| 4.5.3            | Micro-level  | 145        |
| 4.6              | Conclusion   | 147        |
|                  | References   | 152        |
| <b>Chapter 5</b> | <b>Political decentralization and democratization at the periphery: An analysis of the <i>noken</i> system in Papua, Indonesia</b> | <b>159</b> |
|                  | Abstract   | 160        |
| 5.1              | Introduction   | 161        |
| 5.2              | The <i>noken</i> system: origins and practices   | 163        |
| 5.3              | Literature review  | 167        |
| 5.3.1            | Political decentralization and democratic accountability   | 167        |
| 5.3.2            | Free and fair elections: definitions and dimensions  | 169        |
| 5.4              | Methodology  | 170        |
| 5.5              | Analysis   | 171        |
| 5.5.1            | Pre-election: the electoral governance of the <i>noken</i> system  | 171        |
| 5.5.2            | On election day: voting process and liberal democratic principles  | 181        |
| 5.5.3            | Post-election: the <i>noken</i> system and electoral conflicts   | 182        |
| 5.6              | Discussion and conclusion  | 183        |
|                  | References   | 186        |
| <b>Chapter 6</b> | <b>Conclusions and Recommendations</b>   | <b>191</b> |
| 6.1              | Introduction   | 193        |
| 6.2              | Decentralization and the challenges of local governance  | 194        |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 6.3   | The effects of decentralization on basic public service delivery                                     | 196 |
| 6.3.1 | Multi-level governance and agency problems at the local level: the evidence from Jayawijaya district | 196 |
| 6.3.2 | Geography and accessibility to public service in Asmat district                                      | 198 |
| 6.3.3 | The design of institution and effective water governance: achieving balance when pendulum swings     | 199 |
| 6.4   | The effects of decentralization on democratic accountability   | 202 |
| 6.4.1 | Modern democracy and customary practice  | 202 |
| 6.5   | Synthesis of findings and reflections to the main research question                                  | 204 |
| 6.6   | Theoretical reflection   | 205 |
| 6.7   | Policy recommendations   | 206 |
| 6.8   | Suggestions for further research   | 210 |
|       | References   | 212 |

|                   |            |
|-------------------|------------|
| <b>Appendices</b> | <b>213</b> |
|-------------------|------------|

|                |            |
|----------------|------------|
| <b>Summary</b> | <b>229</b> |
|----------------|------------|

|         |     |
|---------|-----|
| English | 231 |
|---------|-----|

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Dutch | 239 |
|-------|-----|

|                  |     |
|------------------|-----|
| Bahasa Indonesia | 247 |
|------------------|-----|

|                         |            |
|-------------------------|------------|
| <b>Acknowledgements</b> | <b>255</b> |
|-------------------------|------------|

## List of tables and figures

### Tables

|           |  |
|-----------|--|
| Table 1.1 | The comparison of general autonomy and special autonomy              |
| Table 1.2 | Studies on Papua and West Papua                                      |
| Table 3.1 | An overview of the Asmat district                                    |
| Table 3.2 | Data sources for GIS analysis  |
| Table 3.3 | Spatial distribution of CHC within six distance thresholds ( $d_0$ ) |
| Table 3.4 | Mean and standard deviation of $A^F$ score of 180 villages           |
| Table 4.1 | Excludability and rivalry of water resources                         |
| Table 4.2 | The dispersion of water-related responsibilities                     |

### Figures

|             |   |
|-------------|---|
| Figure 1.1  | Map of Papua and West Papua provinces                                 |
| Figure 3.1  | Map of the Asmat district with CHC and village location               |
| Figure 3.2  | Operationalization of the 2SFCA method                                |
| Figure 3.2A | Spatial join of CHC   |
| Figure 3.2B | Step 1 (CHC per population)   |
| Figure 3.2C | Step 2 (accessibility score per village)                              |
| Figure 3.3  | CHC to population ratio ( $R$ ) in three CHCs ( $d_0 = 15$ km)        |
| Figure 3.4  | CHC to population ratio ( $R$ )                                       |
| Figure 3.5  | Accessibility Score ( $A^F$ ) of Komor village ( $d_0 = 15$ km)       |
| Figure 3.6  | Number of villages in each of the six categories of $A^F$ score       |
| Figure 3.7  | Percentage of population in each of the six categories of $A^F$ score |
| Figure 5.1  | The general practices of the <i>noken</i> system                      |

