

University of Groningen

Expressivity of Logics of Knowledge and Action

Kuijjer, Bouke

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

2014

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Kuijjer, B. (2014). *Expressivity of Logics of Knowledge and Action*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. [S.n.].

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Expressivity of Logics of Knowledge and Action

Expressivity of Logics of Knowledge and Action
L. B. Kuijer, 2014
ISBN (printed version): 978-90-367-7434-5
ISBN (electronic version): 978-90-367-7433-8



university of
 groningen

Expressivity of Logics of Knowledge and Action

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de de graad van doctor aan de
Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
rector magnificus prof. dr. E. Sterken
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties.

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op
donderdag 11 december 2014 om 11:00 uur

door

Louwe Bart Kuijer

geboren op 9 augustus 1985
te Heerenveen

Promotor

Prof. dr. B.P. Kooi

Copromotor

Dr. A.M. Tamminga

Beoordelingscommissie

Prof. dr. J.F.A.K. van Benthem

Prof. dr. L.C. Verbrugge

Prof. dr. T. Ågotnes

Contents

Acknowledgments	v
1 Introduction	1
1.1 An Introduction to Expressivity	1
1.2 Outline of this Thesis	4
1.3 Previous Work	5
I Expressivity Results	7
2 The Expressivity of Factual Change	9
2.1 Introduction	9
2.2 Language, models and semantics	11
2.3 Expressivity	13
2.4 Reduction	14
2.5 Expressivity over KD45 and S4	17
2.6 Expressivity over S5	20
2.7 Conclusion	22
3 The Expressivity of Update Logics	25
3.1 Introduction	25
3.2 Introducing the Operators	26
3.2.1 Dynamic and Static Operators	27
3.2.2 Public announcements and arrow updates	29
3.3 Definitions	30
3.4 The logics under consideration	33
3.4.1 Overview of previously known results	34
3.4.2 New expressivity results	34
3.5 U^* is more expressive than R	35
3.6 CU is as expressive as U^*	37
3.6.1 Notation	38
3.6.2 Variable use	39
3.6.3 The main strategy	40
3.6.4 Creating witnesses	41
3.6.5 The case distinction	43
3.6.6 Further Complications	46
3.6.7 Formulas Representing the Cases	46
3.6.8 $U^* \preceq CU$	47
3.7 Conclusion	48

II	Results Related to Expressivity	51
4	How Arbitrary Are Arbitrary Public Announcements?	53
4.1	Introduction	53
4.2	Definitions	55
4.3	APAL on Finite Models	56
4.4	APAL on Infinite Models	57
4.4.1	Validity of $\langle\psi\rangle\varphi \rightarrow \Diamond\varphi$ for \Diamond -free φ	58
4.4.2	Invalidity of $\langle\psi\rangle\varphi \rightarrow \Diamond\varphi$ on Infinitely Branching Models	59
4.4.3	Invalidity of $\langle\psi\rangle\varphi \rightarrow \Diamond\varphi$ on Finitely Branching Models	63
4.5	Conclusion and further research	66
5	Sanction Semantics and CTDOs	69
5.1	Introduction	69
5.2	The Gentle Murder Scenario	70
5.2.1	Problems with existing formalizations of CTD obligations	71
5.3	The Semantic Approach	71
5.4	Desiderata	73
5.5	Impossibility Result	76
5.6	Relaxing the Desiderata	80
5.7	Conclusion	82
6	Generalizing Expressivity	83
6.1	Goals and Motivation	83
6.2	Generalizing Expressivity	84
6.3	Related Concepts	86
6.4	Similar to Expressivity	87
6.5	The Triviality Problem	88
6.6	Desiderata for Expressivity _g	89
6.7	Existing Translations	92
6.7.1	Embedding Temporal Logic in Modal Logic	92
6.7.2	Embedding Classical Modal Logic in Normal Modal Logic	95
6.7.3	Embedding ATEL in ATL	97
6.7.4	Embedding CL in STIT	101
6.8	Conditions on Translations	104
6.9	Choosing the Right Conditions	110
6.10	Formally Defining Finitely Generated	111
6.11	A Non-trivial Preorder	115
6.12	Further Generalizations	117
6.13	Conclusion	118
7	Conclusion	121
7.1	Summary	121
7.2	Further Research	123
A	Appendix: Detailed proof that $U^* \preceq UC$	125
A.1	Constructing β_1, \dots, β_6	125
A.1.1	Constructing β_1	125

A.1.2	Constructing β_2	127
A.1.3	Constructing β_3	128
A.1.4	Constructing β_4	131
A.1.5	Constructing β_5 and β_6	131
A.2	Constructing $\alpha_6, \dots, \alpha_1$	132
A.2.1	Constructing α_6 and α_5	132
A.2.2	Constructing α_4	132
A.2.3	Constructing α_3	133
A.2.4	Constructing α_2	144
A.2.5	Constructing α_1	146
A.3	Proofs of auxiliary lemmas	148
Nederlandse Samenvatting		153
Bibliography		155

