

University of Groningen

## Unresolved Questions in the Freud/Jung Debate. On Psychosis, Sexual Identity and Religion

Vandermeersch, Patrick

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*  
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*  
1991

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*  
Vandermeersch, P. (1991). *Unresolved Questions in the Freud/Jung Debate. On Psychosis, Sexual Identity and Religion*. s.n.

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

## Chapter VII

# The Rupture (1911-1913)

### **The Kreuzlingen Gesture (September 1911 - May 1912)**

Following the Weimar Congress of September 1911, both Freud and Jung zealously continued their research into the subjects of mythology and religion. Apparently, everything proceeded very well. Freud indicated to Jung that he had come across a mythical motif which could possibly be traced back to a phylogenetic heredity, namely, the motif of the *doppelgänger* or the weaker twin brother. This motif might represent the placenta which was a temporary part of every individual's life just as a twin brother.<sup>1</sup> Jung replied that he was quite pleased with Freud's discovery and that he had found a parallel. Much of the water symbolism and many of the skin sensations of enwrapping and encircling might stem from the intrauterine life with its experience of the amnion and the umbilical cord. This confirmed Jung's suspicion that very early infantile memories related to foetal condition, birth and nursing were not individually acquired but were phylogenetically transmitted.<sup>2</sup>

That relations were rather strained between both men became clear in several letters from Jung's wife, Emma, addressed to Freud from October till November 1911.<sup>3</sup> Jung was initially not aware of the existence of these letters in which his wife expressed her fear of a growing distance between her husband and Freud. She particularly referred to Freud's visit to Zurich on the occasion of the congress. During that visit, the subject of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* had been almost intentionally avoided. Emma Jung also accused Freud of forcing her husband in the position of a rebellious son. In a third letter, she mentioned her personal difficulty with constantly living in her husband's shadow and she sought some sympathy with Freud. From this letter, it also becomes clear that Jung had discovered the correspondence in the meantime and that he did not care for it at all. There was no fourth letter.

---

1. 274F.

2. 275J.

3. The letters were included in *The Freud/Jung Letters* following 277J, 279J, 282J respectively. Freud's answers have been lost.

We do not know how Freud responded to Emma. In any case, he did write to Jung during this period stating that he had reread *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* and had found many things to be so well-expressed that they should be considered as definitive statements on the issue.<sup>4</sup> Yet at the same time, he also felt that Jung's Christian influence limited his horizon far too greatly.

Shortly thereafter, in a letter to Freud dated 17 November, Jung asserted his belief that it was necessary to expand the libido theory and that he had attempted to do this in connection with Freud's "Schreber". He supplemented the notion of the libido, as expressed in *Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality*, with a genetic model.<sup>5</sup> This alarmed Freud. He replied that he hoped there was no misunderstanding between them. He pointed out that, according to him, only the sexual drive could be called 'libido'.<sup>6</sup> To this, Jung responded that the problem of the 'destruction of the world' as found in Schreber's case had made him sharply aware of the fact that the loss of the reality function in cases of dementia praecox could not be explained exclusively as a consequence of the repression of a sexually perceived libido. Again, Jung stated that he intended to solve this problem by means of a genetic concept of the libido. Yet he found it difficult to extensively discuss his conclusion in a letter and proposed to wait until Freud had read the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*. In fact, Jung had just completed the chapter dealing with the topic of the libido.<sup>7</sup>

In their correspondence, little mention was made of Freud's research on the origin of religion. Freud frequently complained that the work progressed very slowly. He also expressed his surprise that Jung did not show more interest in his work. Yet Freud himself barely referred to the content of his research.<sup>8</sup> By mid-January 1912, Freud had completed the article *The Horror of Incest* which would later become the first part of *Totem and Taboo*.<sup>9</sup> Jung only read the text after its publication in March 1912.

---

4. "One of the nicest works I have read (again), is that of the well-known author on the "Transformations and Symbols of the Libido". In it many things are so well-expressed that they seem to have taken on definitive form and in this form impress themselves on the memory." 280F.

5. 282J.

6. 286F.

7. 287J.

8. 286F.

9. Under the more general title *Some Points of Agreement between the Mental Life of Savages and Neurotics*, he also announced the publication of two more articles: *Taboo and*

January 1912 was a particularly difficult month for Jung due to the press campaign against psychoanalysis which had been sparked by one of his own writings. In the yearbook of a local printer named Rascher, Jung had published an article in which he sketched a popular interpretation of psychoanalysis.<sup>10</sup> Not expecting the text to create such a scandal, he soon found himself obliged to publicly defend himself in the newspapers.<sup>11</sup>

After the storm had somewhat subsided, Jung continued writing the last chapter of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*. In his correspondence with Freud, he indicated that the work mainly dealt with the mother image and with incest and that he was experiencing great difficulty in drawing it to a conclusion.<sup>12</sup> Freud, in the meantime, was tackling the issue of taboo.<sup>13</sup> He stated that he had discovered that taboos stemmed from affective ambivalence and, by means of this, he believed he could establish the origin of conscience.<sup>14</sup>

Thus, their correspondence merely indicated the themes with which both men were then occupied. In fact their letters also became shorter and less frequent. Moreover, they no longer contained a true exchange of ideas. This irritated Freud and he reproached Jung for neglecting their correspondence.<sup>15</sup> Although Jung had to admit that he was a bad correspondent, he found it difficult to accept Freud's authoritarian tone. He announced that the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* would be his 'declaration of independence'.<sup>16</sup> In response to this Freud pointed out that he had never intellectually tyrannized Jung.<sup>17</sup> All this caused the father-son conflict to flare up again. One of the ways it was expressed was through certain lapses and errors in their letters, to

---

*Emotional Ambivalence and Animism, Magic and the Omnipotence of Thoughts*. These three essays were compiled in *Totem und Taboo* in 1913, together with an initially unforeseen fourth essay. See 293F.

10. C.G. JUNG, *New Paths in Psychology*. The first edition of the C.W. VII gives in § 407-436 the translation of an incomplete version of this text. See the G.W. VII, p. 268-291 (for obscure reasons, the German edition does not use paragraph numbering here).

11. C.G. JUNG, *Two Letters on Psychoanalysis*, C.W. XVIII, § 1034-1040 and *Concerning Psychoanalysis*, C.W. IV, § 197-202.

12. 300J.

13. 298F.

14. 306F.

15. 298F, 301F.

16. 303J, 311F.

17. 304F.

which both parties began to react in a rather short-tempered manner.<sup>18</sup>

During this same period, Jung agreed to deliver several lectures at Fordham University in New York in September of that year. This entailed that the date for the annual congress had to be moved.<sup>19</sup> Freud immediately concurred that Jung should accept the offer since it would enhance the propagation of psychoanalysis. He even suggested that the congress be cancelled for that year.<sup>20</sup>

On 10 March 1912, Jung wrote to Freud that he had completed the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*.<sup>21</sup> The following April, by the time Jung read Freud's *The Horror of Incest*, he had already sent the galleys of the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* back to the printer which meant that he could not add any corrections to his text.<sup>22</sup> Thus, while there is a parallel development between both texts, they originated separately.

However, reading Freud's text did become for Jung the occasion for reopening a theoretical discussion in their correspondence. Freud had begun his essay from the perspective that, in all primitive cultures, the incest prohibition was encountered as the most fundamental law. Along with this opinion, he had included the observation that the desire for incest was a feature which was constantly met in the analysis of his patients. This had led him to conclude that the desire for incest was one of the deepest drives of the human psyche.

Jung began his criticism with several arguments against Freud's interpretation of the ethnological data involved. He pointed out that an incestuous relationship was primarily forbidden between the son and the mother while the father-daughter relationship was often not taken into consideration. Further, Jung did not understand why the incest prohibition had to be part of a patriarchal society. While the son was still young, the father, by his physical power alone, could easily defend his exclusive right to the mother. By the time the son had become an adult, both the mother

---

18. Among other texts, 298F concerning the slackening of the correspondence: "I find no triumph in you" instead of "... in it"; 304F : "If a third party was to read this passage, he would ask me why (instead of when) I had tried to tyrannize you intellectually, and I should have to say: I don't know. I don't believe I ever did." One of Jung's errors later mentioned in their quarrel: "Even Adler's cronies do not regard me as one of yours" (instead of "theirs"). 335J.

19. 307J.

20. 308F. Jones offers a different presentation of matters.

21. 305J.

22. 312J.

and father had grown old and the mother was no longer attractive. Thus the incest prohibition was not particularly necessary as an institution within the patriarchal society. It might have been useful in a primitive, matriarchal society which was characterized by general promiscuity and thus by a real danger of incest. Yet the prohibition was never found in these instances, which led Jung to doubt that a universal prohibition was actually directed against a real danger of incest.<sup>23</sup>

Jung expressed his own theory in a very cautious and ambiguous manner. According to him, the incest prohibition was only secondary, relying on a more fundamental structure, namely, the special relationship between a child and its mother. The prohibition was then 'merely a formula or ceremony of atonement *in re vili*'.<sup>24</sup>

Freud was not aware of the direction which Jung had taken by these rather sibylline indications. Thus he responded to Jung's criticism by discussing the ideas of initial promiscuity, the rights of the mother and the role of the father in various cultures.<sup>25</sup> In response to this, Jung unequivocally stated what he had intended to demonstrate. The incest prohibition emerged only after the connection between the free-floating anxiety and infantile material had been established. The sexual desire to commit incest was not of central importance with regard to the prohibition. Rather, the key element was the special infantile bond with the mother which was recathected in a regressive movement. Jung cautioned Freud not fall into the trap of the trauma theory for a second time. The trauma which appeared to be so dominant in the lives of patients, had turned out to be a construction which gave infantile moments a new significance. In the same way, the incest prohibition did not imply the existence of a factual desire for incest as its origin.<sup>26</sup>

In his reply, Freud stated that he finally understood what Jung intended yet he still failed to comprehend why Jung found it necessary to make such a turn.<sup>27</sup> What else but an incestuous desire could be at the basis of the incest prohibition? He did admit that the mistake he had made

---

23. 313J.

24. "I therefore think that the incest prohibition (understood as primitive morality) was merely a formula or ceremony of atonement *in re vili*: what was valuable for the child - the mother - and is so worthless for the adult ... acquires an extraordinary value thanks to the incest prohibition, and is declared to be desirable and forbidden .... Evidently, the object of the prohibition is not to prevent incest but to consolidate the family ...." 313J.

25. 314F.

26. 315J.

27. 316F.

with regard to the trauma theory, which Jung had recalled, should have taught him to be more cautious. Nevertheless his concept of the pleasure principle forced him to strongly dislike Jung's view. He loathed the regressive explanation and could not help but see in it a reference to Adler's theories. In the same letter, Freud announced that he would visit Binswanger at Kreuzlingen during the Pentecost holidays but that his schedule would not allow him to travel on to Zurich.

Later Freud claimed that, by this, he was implicitly suggesting that Jung come to Kreuzlingen to see him.<sup>28</sup> Jung answered that he had not received the letter until after Pentecost and he believed that Freud had deliberately mailed the letter too late. Freud, on the other hand, was convinced that he had mailed the letter in enough time and he supposed Jung was ill-disposed. Further angry letters followed. Among other things, Jung announced that he would present his new theories in his lectures at Fordham University<sup>29</sup> and that he had well understood Freud's gesture at Kreuzlingen.<sup>30</sup> On 7 September 1912, Jung left for the United States. His series of lectures was later published in *The Theory of Psychoanalysis*.<sup>31</sup> During his absence, the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* was published. As she had been instructed, Emma Jung immediately sent a copy to Freud on 10 September 1912.

### **Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido**

#### *The Genetic Theory of the Libido*

Freud had concluded 'Schreber' with an open question as to whether a libidinous decathexis sufficiently explained the profound loss of the sense of reality experienced in instances of dementia praecox. This question became the point of departure for the second part of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*, the first chapter of which was devoted to expanding the concept of the libido.

Jung initially attempted to focus the problem by comparing dementia praecox to neurosis. According to Freud, a repression of the libido was involved in both cases. Yet Jung pointed out that a radical loss of the

---

28. The text of the letter went as follows: "I shall be closer to you geographically during the Whitsun weekend. On the evening of the 24th I shall be leaving for Constance to see Binswanger. I am planning to be back on the following Tuesday. The time is so short that I shall not be able to do more". 316F.

29. 321J.

30. 320J.

31. The German text appeared in the first volume of the 1913 *Jahrbuch*.

sense of reality was not encountered in either hysteria or in obsessional neurosis. In these cases, the non-sexual psychological adjustment to reality was maintained. However, in cases of dementia praecox, the degree of derealization was such that, along with sexuality, other instincts had to influence this collapse as well.<sup>32</sup>

Subsequently, this gave Jung an occasion to reflect upon the Freudian concepts of the libido and the ego drives. According to Jung, Freud's theory had been developed in conformance with the model of a theory of components. The core notion of *Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality* held that certain bodily functions or parts, initially not of a sexual nature, could be cathected by sexuality. In a secondary moment, the mouth for example could receive the erotic significance expressed by a kiss. Thus, Freud applied the hypothesis of bundled drives. According to this hypothesis, the human psyche consisted of a number of separate drives which could combine with each other in a secondary instance. Sexuality was originally only one of these partial drives. Along with it, there existed other partial drives which Freud barely mentioned.<sup>33</sup>

By means of this hypothesis, Freud wished to explain the fact that certain objects or functions could be given a sexual significance which, viewed in themselves, they did not possess. Even Jung could not deny that fact. This conceptual model did not pose any difficulties to the psychological analysis of neurosis. Yet with regard to psychosis, it did cause certain difficulties which led Jung to question the aspect of the components in Freud's libido theory. Without intending to deny the established facts, Jung attempted to find a solution by means of a genetic concept of the libido.<sup>34</sup>

Nevertheless, when surveying the history of evolution, the existence of separate, instinctual elements which combined themselves in a secondary instance seemed rather implausible. Even the popular distinction between the urge for self-preservation and the urge for the preservation of the species, on which Freud based himself, was originally not so clear. The first form of multiplication was division which was where growth and procreation were fused into one process.

In the further course of evolution, growth and procreation differentiated. The process of procreation, which was initially based on a surplus

---

32. C.G. JUNG, *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*, Engl. transl. (*Psychology of the Unconscious*) p. 79; in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 175.

33. *Ibid.*, p. 77; in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 172.

34. *Ibid.*, p. 79; in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 176.

of procreative material and a coincidental fertilization, gradually gave way to a new process by which fertilization and the care of the young were much more efficient. What we refer to as 'a sense of reality' for the most part found its origin in this 'ceremony', which included finding a partner, building a nest and taking care of the young as its most important aspects.<sup>35</sup>

Thus, according to Jung, Freud's affirmation that one's sense of reality was closely connected to sexuality, contained much truth. What was at stake, however, was where one situated the term 'sexuality'. In light of its evolution, it would be best to define the libido as a fundamental, vital drive which originally combined the processes of procreation and self-preservation. Due to the ensuing differentiation of this vital drive or primordial libido, the various, more specific drives - of which the sexual drive as it was later experienced was only one - came into being. In order to clearly posit this distinction, Jung spoke of the 'recent sexual aspect' as opposed to the vital drive or primordial libido which he equated with Schopenhauer's concept of the will.<sup>36</sup>

According to Jung, his genetic concept of the libido solved the problems encountered by Freud when he attempted to apply his theory of components to psychosis. The repercussions of the libido component on the other instinctual components, observable in cases of psychosis but not in cases of neurosis, no longer posed a problem. In neurosis, the 'recent sexual' aspect was lifted from the outside world while in psychosis, a greater part of what originated in the primordial libido was withdrawn.<sup>37</sup>

Thus, the core of Jung's theory stated that all human drives stemmed from one fundamental vital urge or primordial libido and that sexuality in the strict sense took up only a small portion of what developed from this primordial libido. This was also what he meant by the sometimes confusing term 'desexualized primordial libido' which pertained to those elements of the primordial libido which did not transform into the 'recent sexual'.

According to Jung, this view did not detract any significance from the facts observed by Freud. While Freud spoke of the libidinous cathexis of another instinct, the same phenomenon could be considered as a moment of differentiation within the primordial libido. The emergence psychic functions which split off from the primordial libido was a process

---

35. *Ibid.*, p. 82-83; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 180.

36. *Ibid.*, p. 81-82; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 178-180.

37. *Ibid.*, p. 83; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 181-182.

which constantly repeated itself in every individual. In the case of sublimation, this process occurred without any disadvantages to the individual involved. Otherwise, one spoke of repression.<sup>38</sup> The genetic theory was therefore also valid for neurosis. Unlike the theory of components, it could more efficiently explain that, in the case of an aggravated neurosis, psychotic episodes could occur.<sup>39</sup>

Within the context of his conceptual model, Jung found it necessary to revoke the terminological equation he had earlier posited between Freud's 'autoeroticism' and Bleuler's 'autism'. The term 'autoeroticism' was best reserved for neurotic processes where the actual repression of a differentiated recent sexuality was at stake. On the other hand, Bleuler's term 'autism' was more appropriate when dealing with psychotic processes which affected the broader fundament of instinctual life.<sup>40</sup>

Up until this point, Jung had merely attempted to demonstrate that this genetic model of the libido was better equipped to explain the psychoanalytical data than Freud's theory of components. However, he went beyond this when he interpreted the archaic characteristics of schizophrenic productions as a direct confirmation of his hypothesis. In cases of dementia praecox, one encountered fantasies which seemed to have originated directly from mythology. Exceptional instances left aside, such fantasies were not found in cases of hysteria. According to Jung, the reason for this was obvious. In hysteria, only one of the drives, namely recent sexuality, was repressed. The relationship to the outside world was thus maintained. Yet we notice how repressed sexuality began to express itself in an earlier form of transference. For example, it brought the parental images back into the experience in a regressive manner. In cases of dementia praecox however, the complete instinctual cathexis was removed from reality. Once again, regression occurred and the older mythical relationship to reality took form.<sup>41</sup>

Jung dealt with the characteristics of the mythical stage and its function within the history of evolution in other chapters of his work. In the meantime, his chapter on the genetic theory of the libido led him to adopt the following stance. The libido should be conceived of in terms of evolutionist differentiation and not in terms of composition.

---

38. *Ibid.*, p. 83; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 181.

39. *Ibid.*, p. 84; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 183.

40. *Ibid.*, p. 84; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 182.

41. *Ibid.*, p. 84-85; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 183-184.

*Symbol and Desexualization*

Following the chapter concerning the genetic concept of the libido, Jung wrote a chapter in which he intended to demonstrate, by means of an example, the importance of the formation of symbols in cultural history. This led Jung to determine that the formation of symbols was a 'fantastical formation of analogies' which took place as the consequence of an inner urge to find analogies and thus, to desexualize the libido.

What struck Jung about the manifold sexual symbols and rites which were encountered was not so much their sexual content but also the fact that they expressed sexuality symbolically and not directly. Viewed in itself, it seemed rather strange that, for example, primitive people could solemnly dance to a overly monotonous melody for a whole night. Even when sexual symbols were involved, it would seem that a direct sexual act would offer more satisfaction in relieving sexual tension. Some rites characterized by sexual symbolism had anything but a pleasant nature. This indicated that more than a quest for satisfaction was operative. A coercion which forced the libido to replace its original object with surrogates was also involved.<sup>42</sup>

"Under these circumstances, the question arises why the primitive man endeavours to represent the sexual act symbolically and with effort, or, if this wording appears to be too hypothetical, why does he exert energy to such a degree only to accomplish practically useless things, which apparently do not especially amuse him? It may be assumed that the sexual act is more desirable to primitive man than such an absurd and, moreover, fatiguing exercises. It is hardly possible but that a certain compulsion conducts the energy away from the original object and real purpose, inducing the production of surrogates."

Jung immediately defined this coercion as an internal force since, in his view, it was inconceivable that an external obstacle could prompt such a quest for surrogates. It is remarkable that Jung found this conclusion so obvious. He stated that "the psychological compulsion for the transformation of the libido is based on an original division of the will".<sup>43</sup>

This quest, which led people away from a direct sexual gratification, gave rise to myths, rites and ultimately to culture and the development of a world view. Jung attempted to prove this by several examples. The universal sexual symbolism of making fire could be related to the fact that

---

42. *Ibid.*, p. 94; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 198.

43. *Ibid.*, p. 94; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 199.

man had attempted to symbolically express coitus by piercing one wooden stick into another. He only accidentally discovered that this caused a fire.<sup>44</sup> The ritual coitus imagery regarding the farmland and the sexual symbolism of ploughing transferred the libidinous urge for the sexual act to the agricultural domain. It was along these lines that Jung spoke of the formation of symbols as a 'fantastical formation of analogies' which desexualized the libido and enlarged the world view.<sup>45</sup>

In order to explain the process of desexualization, Jung related it to regression. The resistance prohibiting the sexual act caused the libido to regress from its actual process of transference to an older process. This could possibly be the relationship toward one's parents, which would actually imply 'incest'. Yet such a possibility was barred by the incest prohibition. The libido thus had no choice but to return to presexual stages of development, when it was primarily an urge for food. This last process 'quasi-desexualized' the libido:<sup>46</sup>

"The resistance against sexuality aims, therefore, at preventing the sexual act. It also seeks to crowd the libido out of the sexual function. We see, for example, in hysteria, how the specific repression blocks the real path of transference. Therefore, the libido is obliged to take another path, an earlier one, namely the incestuous road which ultimately leads toward the parents. Then the situation changes insofar that no earlier way of transference is left except that of the presexual stage of development, where the libido was still partly in the function of nutrition. By a regression to the presexual stage, the libido becomes quasi-desexualised. But as the incest prohibition signifies only a temporary and conditional restriction of the sexuality, only that part of the libido which is best designated as the incestuous component is pushed back to the presexual stage. The repression, therefore, concerns only that part of the sexual libido which wishes to permanently fix itself upon the parents. Only the incestuous component is withdrawn from the sexual libido and pushed back to the presexual stage. If the operation is successful, this component is desexualized and its portion of libido is prepared for an asexual application. However, it is to be assumed that this operation is accomplished only with difficulty because the incestuous libido, so to speak, must be artificially separated from the sexual libido, with which it had been indistinguishably united for ages throughout the whole animal kingdom. The regression of the incestuous

---

44. *Ibid.*, p. 93; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 197.

45. *Ibid.*, p. 86; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 185-186.

46. *Ibid.*, p. 95 (We have corrected the English translation on some crucial points); in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 199-200.

component not only takes place with great difficulty but it also must carry a considerable sexual character with it into the presexual stage. The consequence of this is that the resulting phenomena, although stamped with the character of the sexual act, are, nevertheless, not really sexual acts *de facto*. They are derived from the presexual stage and are maintained by the repressed sexual libido. Therefore, they possess a double significance."

This explained why sexuality could clearly be recognized in the symbolism of making fire for instance, although the act as such no longer possessed a sexual nature. The erotic significance of the mouth, for example, originated in the same manner. This was not only expressed in the act of thumb-sucking but also in the development of the mouth as the instrument of the mating call and finally, of language.<sup>47</sup>

Jung further illustrated his exposition by means of several etymological elaborations and correlations between the myths and customs of various cultures. Yet ultimately, this did not help to clarify matters. His main hypothesis in any case was the following. The mere fact that sexual symbols existed implied that the human psyche harboured an inner resistance to an unmediated indulgence of sexuality. This inner discord of 'libido against libido' gave rise to a network of surrogates for sexual representation. Therefore, due to the desexualization of sexuality, culture could come about.

### *Regression and Incest*

Following these two theoretical chapters, Jung continued with his analysis of Miss Miller's fantasies. In this context, we can learn more about the relationship between desexualization and regression.

His analysis concerned now the fantasy story of 'Chiwantopel', which Miss Miller had described as a 'hypnagogic' tragedy. As she was dozing off to sleep, she suddenly saw before her an Aztec named Chiwantopel. In the background, she heard a mass of people and horses and the sounds of a battle. Then she saw the images of a dream city, a rare tree and a blue cove in the sea. Next, the scene moved to a forest. Chiwantopel appeared on horseback. Another Indian drew near and aimed his bow at Chiwantopel. Chiwantopel however, had spotted the Indian and defiantly bared his breast to him whereupon the Indian disappeared. Chiwantopel then gave a monologue stating that he had left his father's palace and had been travelling throughout the world for a hundred months in search of a woman who would understand him. Until then, he had not

---

47. *Ibid.*, p. 98-99; in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 203-205.

found her but he believed that sometime within ten thousand months, the woman who was destined for him would be born. Near the end of the monologue, Miss Miller saw a snake slither from under a thicket and bite both Chiwantopel and his horse, mortally wounding them with its venom. Chiwantopel said to the snake: "Thank you little sister, for putting an end to my wanderings." Miss Miller then saw a smoking volcano in the distance and while the earth began to quake, Chiwantopel died, uttering a last cry: "I have preserved my body untainted. She would understand that. You, Ja-ni-ma-wa, you understand me."<sup>48</sup>

For 250 pages, Jung attempted to further analyze this hypnagogic tragedy, employing the brief indications provided by Miss Miller. Time and again, he arrived at the observation that the various elements expressed a desire for the mother and could be described as incestuous. The wandering Chiwantopel, whom Miss Miller associated with the eternally wandering Jew Ahasverus<sup>49</sup>, who in turn was similar to the Islamic figure of Al Chadir, represented for Jung the image of the eternal nostalgia for the mother. The dream city<sup>50</sup>, the rare tree<sup>51</sup> and the blue cove seen by Miss Miller, were also maternal symbols. Miss Miller also connected Chiwantopel to Popocatepetl, the volcano whose name attracted every child's imagination, and to Ahamarama or Asurabama, 'the Assyrian who made clay tablets'.<sup>52</sup> This connection with the anal aspect once again proved to Jung that Chiwantopel indubitably represented Miss Miller's infantile personality. The fact that this infantile personality portrayed male characteristics was apparently not much of a problem for Jung. According to him, it was an evident consequence of the quest for a relationship with the mother.<sup>53</sup>

In order to further explain the significance of this quest, Jung sought out mythological parallels. The theme of incest which made it possible for one to conceive oneself again in the mother or, in other words, the theme of death and rebirth was of key importance in mythology. It would be unfeasible here to touch upon the vast amount of mythological themes which Jung related to this idea. The mythical image which expressed this central theme in a most general and pure form was that of the solar cycle.

---

48. *Ibid.*, p. 238; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 420.

49. *Ibid.*, p. 119ff; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 235ff.

50. *Ibid.*, p. 129; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 251.

51. *Ibid.*, p. 132-133; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 262.

52. *Ibid.*, p. 115-119; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 229-235.

53. *Ibid.*, p. 240; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 423.

The sun rose from the sea, approached its zenith and returned back to the sea only to rise again. Jung spontaneously related the theme of life and death to the strictly sexual symbolism of the image of the solar cycle:<sup>54</sup>

"The primitive symbol, which designates that portion of the Zodiac in which the Sun, with the Winter Solstice, again enters upon the yearly course, is the goat, fish sign, the aigokeros. The Sun mounts like a goat to the highest mountain, and later goes into the water as a fish. The fish is the symbol of the child, for the child before his birth lives in the water like a fish, and the Sun, because it plunges into the sea, becomes equally child and fish. The fish, however, is also a phallic symbol, also a symbol for the woman. Briefly stated, the fish is a libido symbol, and, indeed, as it seems predominately *for the renewal of the libido*."

With regard to the core theme of mythology, namely incest, Jung found it essential to distinguish the sexual moment from the regressive moment. The deepest layer of incestuous fantasies consisted in the desire to once again become a child and to lead the uncomplicated, impersonal existence of a child in its mother's womb. Into this nostalgia, a sexual moment was secondarily engraved. For the person who was no longer a child, such a return to the mother signified incest while rebirth became the notion of fertilizing the mother and thus giving existence to oneself:<sup>55</sup>

"I have to emphasize the point that is most especially the totality of the sun myth which proves us that the fundamental basis of the 'incestuous' desire does not aim at cohabitation, but at the special thought of becoming a child again, of turning back to the parent's protection, of coming into the mother once more in order to be born again. But incest stands in the path to this goal, that is to say, the necessity of in some way again gaining entrance into the mother's womb. One of the simplest ways would be to impregnate the mother, and to reproduce one's self identically. But here the incest prohibition interferes; therefore, the myths of the sun or of rebirth teem with all possible proposals as to how incest can be evaded."

The theme of virginal birth, which appeared in most of the heroic myths, conveyed the following significance for Jung. The hero was the one who had succeeded in conceiving himself in the mother.

As a counterbalance to the regressive tendency of the psyche, myths also expressed a progressive force which prompted man toward individuality and which led him to leave his parents. This progressive tendency expressed itself in the incest prohibition which should only sec-

---

54. *Ibid.*, p. 123; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 241-242.

55. *Ibid.*, p. 138; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 267.

ondarily be interpreted in its sexual significance. The incest prohibition intended to impede regression. In myths, it was depicted by means of images which highlighted the terrifying character of the mother, such as the sphinxes, bloodthirsty goddesses, dragons guarding the desired treasure and so on. In the same context, Jung also explained the father images as being projections caused by a fear of incest, thus a fear of regression.<sup>56</sup>

After expressing a struggle between progression and regression, many myths employed the theme of sacrifice. The hero was required to sacrifice an animal, to be sacrificed himself or to be castrated. Such a sacrifice usually entailed the emergence of new life. As examples of this, Jung primarily pointed to the sacrifice of a horse in the teachings of the Upanishads<sup>57</sup>, the sacrifice of the bull by Mithras<sup>58</sup>, the castration of Attis<sup>59</sup> and Christ's sacrifice on the cross.<sup>60</sup> This implied that the libido which was linked to the mother had to be sacrificed and that only subsequently could real life emerge. Yet, Jung's explanation of exactly how this occurred contained an ambiguity. In some texts, he stated that the sacrifice represented the sacrificing of the incestuous libido. Just as the mythical hero sacrificed his relationship with the mother, so must this occur in real life.<sup>61</sup> However, in other texts, he suggested that the sacrifice implied the surrender of oneself to the mother. By the act of offering a sacrifice to one's mother in fantasy or ritual and thus by symbolically depicting one's bondage, one actually detached oneself from her.

Jung re-encountered this soteriological theme in the fantasy involving Chiwantopel. By this fantasy, the unconscious expressed a wish for the demise of the infantile personality, which could not help but look for the mother image everywhere. The progressive tendency within the libido (represented here by the snake) tried to conquer the infantile image which, out of loyalty toward the mother, fled from every sexual contact (for example, the childish defiance of exposing the breast caused the Indian and his bow and arrow to disappear). Thus, just as myths, the hypnagogic tragedy offered the example of what should occur.<sup>62</sup>

---

56. *Ibid.*, p. 153-163; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 293-308.

57. *Ibid.*, p. 258-259; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 448-450.

58. *Ibid.*, p. 261-263; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 454-456.

59. *Ibid.*, p. 260-261; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 451-453.

60. *Ibid.*, p. 263; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 456.

61. *Ibid.*, p. 161-162; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 307.

62. *Ibid.*, p. 240; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 423.

Therefore, according to Jung, the crucial point in the theme of incest was not so much sexuality but rather the regressive tendency. He wrote:<sup>63</sup>

"Here I must recall that I give to the word 'incest' more significance than properly belongs to the term. Just as libido is the onward driving force, so incest is in some manner the backward urge into childhood. For the child, it cannot be spoken of as incest. Only for the adult who possesses a completely formed sexuality does the backwards urge become incest, because he is no longer a child but possesses a sexuality which cannot be permitted a regressive application."

Jung designated the regressive tendencies of the psyche as 'will for death' while he referred to the progressive processes as 'will for life'.<sup>64</sup> The aim of human life was 'individuation', the further differentiation of a child toward a personal life by which it could adopt a perspective with regard to the reality beyond it.<sup>65</sup> The regressive tendency, on the contrary, implied a relapse into that which was non-differentiated.

One could wonder what type of function this reciprocity between progression and regression exercised. It was here that Jung reintroduced the notion of sexuality. He contended that regression was directed to desexualizing a part of the libido and thus, giving rise to fantasy, world view and culture.

Contrary to what he had affirmed concerning the sense of reality, Jung accepted that human thinking originated in sexuality in the strict sense of the word. According to him, the development of mental capacities in a child coincided with the first manifestations of sexuality (around 3 or 4 years of age). Moreover, this occurred around the same time that a child gradually began to leave its mother and learned to direct itself to the outside world. The emerging sexuality and the process of regression collaborated in order for this transition to take place. Sexuality eroticized a child's love for its mother rendering it incestuous while a regressive moment transferred this love to a presexual stage where the libido could not find an adequate object. As a consequence, a number of secondary ob-

---

63. *Ibid.*, p. 307 (footnote 46 from p. 146); in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 279 (footnote).

64. "Incest prohibition can be understood, therefore, as a result of regression, and as the result of a libidinous anxiety, which regressively attacks the mother. Naturally, it is difficult or impossible to say from whence this anxiety may have come. I merely venture to suggest that it may have been a question of a primitive separation of the pairs of opposites which are hidden in the will of life: the will for life and for death." *Ibid.*, p. 257; in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 447.

65. *Ibid.*, p. 328 (footnote from p. 244); in: *Jahrbuch 4* (1912), p. 427-428 (footnote).

jects which represented the primordial object - the mother - became cathected. This gave rise to fantasy and to mental capacities as a 'desexualized usage' of an originally sexual libido.<sup>66</sup> The process can be thus summarized: when the libido became sexual and incestuous, it regressed and was subsequently desexualized. Thus, a child repeated the same process which was phylogenetically operative at the origin of myths and rites.<sup>67</sup>

"Thinking and a conception of the world arose from a shrinking back from stern reality, and it is only after man has regressively assured himself again of the protective parental power that he enters life wrapped in a dream of childhood shrouded in magic superstitions; that is to say, 'thinking', for he, timidly sacrificing his best and assuring himself of the favour of the invisible powers, step by step develops to greater power, in the degree that he frees himself from his retrospective longing and the original lack of harmony in his being."

Fantastical thinking thus formed a transitional stage. It signified the means by which the individual rose above the instinctual level where every person was equal. Here however, we touch upon the distinction between myths and the role which they played in the course of history, on the one hand, and fantasies such as Miss Miller's, on the other hand. Miss Miller desired to avoid the difficulties encountered in reality and therefore regressed into fantasy. This implied a flight from reality.<sup>68</sup> Yet when fantastical thinking was healthy and exercised a specific function, as in myths, it served to make the transition to reality possible.

### **Attempting a Theory of Psychoanalysis**

Jung's lectures delivered at Fordham University, which were later compiled in *The Theory of Psychoanalysis*, were written during the summer of 1912 after he had become aware that Freud could not accept his version of the concept of the libido. Compared to *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*, the lectures had the advantage of being a clear and well-composed exposition. Jung left the issues of mythology and psychosis aside in order to devote his attention to the central themes of Freudian thought and to offer his own reflections. The following topics were discussed: Freud's transition from the hypothesis of trauma to the

---

66. *Ibid.*, p. 255; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 444-445.

67. *Ibid.*, p. 257-258; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 447-448.

68. *Ibid.*, p. 107-108 and p. 255; in: Jahrbuch 4 (1912), p. 218-219 and p. 445.

hypothesis of repression, infantile sexuality, the concept of the libido, the Oedipus complex, the aetiology of neurosis and the therapeutic foundations of psychoanalysis. In his conclusion, he offered a brief presentation concerning the analysis of children. Time and again, Jung intended to demonstrate that the facts and the connections which Freud had established, indeed existed. Yet he also wanted to indicate that, within the framework of interpretation, a genetic and energetic concept of the libido and the centralizing of the concept of regression would significantly advance the research.

### *The Genetic and Energetic Concept of Libido*

In *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*, Jung had based himself on the psychotic's loss of reality in order to postulate the genetic concept of the libido which, in light of historical evolution, seemed to him more plausible than Freud's theory of components. Jung briefly repeated this line of reasoning in *The Theory of Psychoanalysis* but further in the same work his attention was primarily directed toward the application of the concept to infantile sexuality.

Freud had started from the fact that children unmistakably displayed a sense of lust when they were nursed and that, upon being satisfied, they manifested a condition of satisfaction similar to adults after orgasm. A second fact which had attracted his attention was that certain bad habits, such as thumb-sucking, which were often obstinately retained by children, frequently formed a bridge to other, clearly masturbatory actions. Freud therefore concluded that this primary experience of lust was, from the very start, sexually coloured. Thus, he arrived at the position that infantile sexuality was polymorphous-pervert; that it consisted of detached, erogenous zones which had not yet been organized.

Yet according to Jung, two unspoken presuppositions were influential in this conclusion which he intended to critically review: the identification of lust with sexuality and the already mentioned theory of components.

Freud had rather matter-of-factly moved from a child's experience of lust when sucking his mother's breast to the conclusion that sexual feelings were already involved at that stage. Jung, on the other hand, pointed out that this transition was only logically justifiable if lust and sexuality were seen as being the same phenomenon. As long as this fact was not established, one could not go beyond the observation that the experience of lust was related to every form of satisfaction of the urges, for an adult's sexuality as well as for a child's urge for food. According

to the same logic, Freud's terminology, which started from lust and moved to the sexual significance of nursing, should then also characterize coitus as a phenomenon of feeding.<sup>69</sup>

Freud's second observation concerning a continuous transition from an experience of lust caused by various feeding functions to later, manifestly sexual acts, in no way proved that this first awareness of lust was already sexually oriented. Yet within the presuppositions of the theory of components, Freud naturally had to make such a transition. Therefore, he posed that all drives as well as their potential for reunification were in essence present from birth. From the later, clearly sexual significance which the mouth might assume, Freud thus spontaneously concluded that the same reunification of the urge for food and sexuality had to be present in a child as well, although with less intensity. What was problematic, however, was precisely this theory of components. The interpretation of these same facts seemed more plausible, according to Jung, when one employed a genetic concept. Initially, the vital drive or libido was primarily directed toward the growth of the organism and was thus preoccupied with food. The satisfying of this urge produced a feeling of lust which was related to the function. Gradually, when the child was between three and five years old, the instincts further differentiated giving rise to sexuality as an autonomous function. This happened very slowly which implied that the previous sources of pleasure were neither abruptly nor completely abandoned. This explained the gradual transition of an undifferentiated feeling of pleasure caused by the satiation with food to the typically sexual feeling of lust.<sup>70</sup>

Jung now connected an energetic aspect to his genetic concept of the libido. According to him, Freud's theory of components did not offer any insight into the fact that certain libidinous components could apparently succeed one another in an individual's life. With regard to this fact, Jung gave the example of the alternation between homosexual and heterosexual stages in the life of one of his patients.<sup>71</sup>

The theory of components was challenged by the enigmatic relationship between these two stages. Why did the homosexual component disappear at the exact moment when the heterosexual component emerged and vice versa? The idea of isolated autonomous components did not render the issue more comprehensible. A dynamic theory, however, that

---

69. C.G. JUNG, *The Theory of Psychoanalysis*, C.W. IV, § 238-241.

70. *Ibid.*, § 262-263.

71. *Ibid.*, § 247-249.

viewed the libido as a quantum energy which could activate several expressions, would allow for an understanding of this interaction, according to Jung.

In passing, it should be noted that Jung used the most precarious element of Freud's theory of components as an example, namely, the existence of homosexual and heterosexual components. In principle, Freud's *Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality* had made a sharp distinction between the process uniting the separate erotic components (the erotogenic zone) into the 'sexual aim' and the process leading toward the choice of a 'sexual object'. Homosexuality belonged to the latter rather than the former process. In practice however, especially when dealing with paranoia, Freud had spoken of 'homosexual components' many times in his letters to Jung.

In any case, Jung wished to view the libido as psychic energy which could express itself in different forms.<sup>72</sup>

"I maintain that the libido with which we operate is not only not concrete or known, but is a complete X, a pure hypothesis, a model or counter, and is no more concretely conceivable than the energy known to the world of physics."

Moreover, Jung hoped that this concept of energy would be as fruitful for psychoanalysis as it had been for physics.

Within the framework of his genetic theory, he refused to give the Oedipus complex an initially sexual significance. He did not dispute the fact that children could reveal a feeling of very strong rivalry and envy with regard to possessing the mother. Yet he could not recognize a clear sexual significance in this fact. According to Jung, this envy was originally related to a still undifferentiated urge for food. In this sense, the mother represented the primary object of love for both male and female children. Only between the ages of three and five, when the sexual urge began to differentiate itself, did erotic elements gradually come into play.

It was at that time that a girl developed the specific attitude toward her father, known as the Electra complex. Only during puberty, and only then if one was still too strongly attached to one's parents, could the Oedipus (and the Electra) complex become manifestly incestuous and turn into a conflict.<sup>73</sup> Yet in most cases, matters did not develop that far because religion, which symbolically expressed the relationship with one's

---

72. *Ibid.*, § 282.

73. *Ibid.*, § 346-348.

parents, formed a symbolic bridge by which one left the limited family circle behind.<sup>74</sup> With regard to this problematic, Jung briefly referred to *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* when he pointed out that the symbolism of sacrifice was a core theme.

*Regression and the Reality of the Conflict*

After having presented his genetic and energetic concept of the libido, Jung introduced his hypothesis that the aetiology of neurosis was to be sought in the present and that infantile material, encountered in neurotic fantasies, should mainly be considered as the product of regression.

According to Jung, Freud was still captivated by the trauma theory when he was searching for the origin of neurosis in very early infantile fantasies. The return to the past, which was quite evident within the framework of the trauma theory, should have been called into question after the discovery of the phenomenon of regression. Especially the fact that Oedipal fantasies could be encountered in most people indicated that something other than the fantasies themselves should be posited as the factual origin of neurosis.

Consequently, Jung focused on the moment of the emergence of neurosis. He believed that it was here that the core conflict was to be found. Freud had paid some attention to that particular moment but he had considered the emergence of neurosis to be an auxiliary factor operating on the basis of a deeper, infantile conflict. Jung reversed the roles. The factual conflict was the most important element while, as a result, the libido became introverted and regressively formed the fantasies which Freud had mistakenly considered to be the origin of neurosis.<sup>75</sup> The withdrawal of the libido in the face of an actual obstacle caused the regression. The libido, which could no longer find relief in the outside world, was turned inward and fell back on a wealth of memories into which it breathed new life.<sup>76</sup> This was where the Oedipus complex, often extremely active in neurosis, drew its strength. In a situation of sexual maturity, the libido normally led the individual away from the narrow family ties. Here however, it recoiled from the new situation and regressed back to the old familiar paths of transference. Fierce incestuous fantasies emerged and within this setting, all childhood memories were remoulded.<sup>77</sup>

---

74. *Ibid.*, § 348-350.

75. *Ibid.*, § 354.

76. *Ibid.*, § 365-367.

77. *Ibid.*, § 377.

Jung connected this concept of regression with a number of Freudian notions. What Freud called polymorphous-pervert infantile sexuality was considered by Jung to be the preliminary stages of a sexuality which still had to further differentiate itself. The adult's perversion was a regression from a fully developed sexual libido to these infantile forms. As a consequence, Jung could not interpret such perversions as a mere relapse or fixation on the preliminary stages. The new element in an adult's perversion was indeed the introduction of a differentiated sexual libido into what was previously a very undifferentiated search for pleasure.<sup>78</sup> Infantile amnesia as well was a gradual emergence of the memory capacity rather than the consequence of an intentional repression of certain memories.<sup>79</sup> The concept of a latency period, which could be described as a flower that bloomed, then drew back to a bud only to blossom once again, should likewise be abandoned. That which Freud called the receding of infantile sexuality was nothing more than the gradual differentiation of sexuality following a stage in which sexuality as such did not yet exist.<sup>80</sup>

Thus, virtually all of the elements to which Freud had attributed a causal role were interpreted by Jung as the consequence of a neurotic regression. As a result, Jung found himself confronted with the question as to what was the actual conflict which supposedly lay at the origin of neurosis. He sought the answer in the individual's constitution. It seemed characteristic that neurosis emerged as soon as one's living conditions changed and one was forced to adjust to a new situation. Every adjustment was found burdensome by any given organism, as could be observed when training animals. Jung therefore searched for the ultimate ground of neurosis in an innate vulnerability, the capacity for reaction or the instability of the individual. Often, this became apparent in the anamnesis. Already as a child, the future neurotic was worrisome. This did not imply that neurosis originated here but only that the sickly constitution was perceivable at that point. Thus the unstable constitution led to a neurotic prehistory which in turn reinforced the constitutional deficiency.<sup>81</sup>

"The ultimate and deepest root of neurosis appears to be the innate sensitiveness, which causes difficulties even to the infant at the mother's breast, in the form of unnecessary excitement and resistance. The apparent aetiology of neurosis elicited by psychoanalysis is actually, in very many

---

78. *Ibid.*, § 368.

79. *Ibid.*, § 369.

80. *Ibid.*, § 370.

81. *Ibid.*, § 411.

cases, only an inventory of careful selected fantasies, reminiscences, etc., aiming in a definite direction and created by the patient out of the libido he did not use for biological adaptation. Those allegedly aetiological fantasies thus appear to be nothing but substitute formations, disguises, artificial explanations for the failure to adapt to reality."

For Jung, regressive fantasies did not only have a morbid value. Therefore, he did not modify the psychoanalytic technique but continued to analyze these fantasies. The patient had cathected them together with his libido, making it necessary to deal with them if the libido was to be freed.<sup>82</sup> Alongside their morbid character, the fantasies also yielded a teleological significance.<sup>83</sup> For the neurotic who dreaded leaving his family and who did not dare to lead an autonomous life, the sexual content of his incestuous fantasies constituted some sort of rehearsal which enabled him to grow accustomed to sexuality. In this context, Jung also noted that, as far as dreams were concerned, a prospective function as well should be recognized, as Maeder had already demonstrated. Dreams did not contain prophesies. Rather, subtle combinations of tendencies which were operative in the individual and which prepared the future could be encountered.<sup>84</sup> Jung did not delve into this but vaguely indicated this intuition.

During his trip to the United States, Jung briefly presented the two central themes of *The Theory of Psychoanalysis* - the genetic and energetic concept of the libido and regression - in a lecture at the New York Academy of Medicine on 8 October 1912.<sup>85</sup> Jung never discussed these issues theoretically with Freud. Jones writes that, after reading *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*, Freud claimed that he knew the exact page where Jung had derailed and that he had lost all interest for the rest of the work.<sup>86</sup> It was the page where Jung quoted a passage from Freud's analysis of Schreber and had concluded that the withdrawal of the sexual libido alone did not suffice as an explanation for the psychotic's loss of his sense of reality. Two years later, in early 1914, Freud wrote in *On the History of the Psycho-Analytic Movement*:<sup>87</sup>

---

82. *Ibid.*, § 420.

83. *Ibid.*, § 415.

84. *Ibid.*, § 452-454.

85. Cf. *On Psychoanalysis*, C.W. IV, § 557-575. The lecture indeed dates from 1912 and not from 1913 as is indicated in the C.W. See the note in *The Freud/Jung Letters*, after 356J.

86. E. JONES, *Sigmund Freud Life and Work*, II, p. 174.

87. S. FREUD, *On the History of the Psycho-Analytic Movement*, C.W. XIV, p. 60, G.W. X, p. 105.

"Jung's modification, on the other hand, loosens the connection of the phenomena with instinctual life; and further, as its critics (e.g. Abraham, Ferenczi and Jones) have pointed out, it is so obscure, unintelligible and confused as to make it difficult to take up any position upon it. Wherever one lays hold of anything, one must be prepared to hear that one has misunderstood it, and one cannot see how to arrive at a correct understanding of it."

According to Freud, Jung could not dismiss his disdain for the Oedipus complex. If he were able to overcome this dislike, he would have to acknowledge the presence of the complex in both religion and ethics.<sup>88</sup>

"The truth is that these people have picked out a few cultural overtones from the symphony of life and have once more failed to hear the mighty and primordial melody of the instincts."

### **The Rupture**

Upon his return from the United States, Jung wrote to Freud stating that his journey had contributed much to the dissemination of psychoanalysis and that his new presentation of the concept of the libido had eliminated many futile misunderstandings and much resistance.<sup>89</sup> Freud answered that he could hardly consider this as progress and that *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido* did not provide him with convincing proof of Jung's concepts. He would wait until he had read the text of Jung's lectures and then give his opinion. He expressed his hope, just as Jung had done, that their friendship would continue as well as the possibility for objective, business-like discussions concerning the theory.<sup>90</sup>

In the meantime, difficulties had arisen with regard to Stekel, the publisher of the *Zentralblatt* who, like Adler, had severed his relations with Freud. Since Stekel refused to hand over the control of the *Zentralblatt*, the International Association for Psychoanalysis considered what stance it should take. Jung convened the presidents of the local groups in November 1912 at Munich. On this occasion, the 'Kreuzlingen Gesture' was also discussed between Jung and Freud. Jung admitted that it simply involved a misunderstanding and they were quickly reconciled. During the luncheon which followed the conversation, they discussed the Egyptian Pharaoh Echnaton. Freud was convinced that Echnaton had introduced

---

88. *Ibid.*, C.W. XIV, p. 62, G.W. X, p. 108.

89. 323J.

90. 314F.

monotheism due to his relationship with his father. He found proof for this argumentation in the fact that Echnaton destroyed the name of his father Amon-hotep in all hieroglyphics. Jung challenged this explanation. According to him, the destruction could be sufficiently explained by the fact that the name Amon-hotep contained the name of Amon, a god from the previous pantheon, and that Echnaton wished to eliminate the names of all these previous gods in light of his new-found monotheism. At this moment in the discussion, Freud fainted and had to be carried outside by Jung.<sup>91</sup>

After the meeting in Munich, Jung wrote a letter to Freud in which he assured him that all the difficulties between them had now been cleared up. Moreover, he emphatically stressed his subservience to Freud.<sup>92</sup> In his response, Freud stated that he was slowly beginning to discover what position he would take with regard to *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*. By means of the work, Jung had solved the enigma of all mysticism by proving that it was based on the "symbolic utilization of complexes that have outlived their function."<sup>93</sup> At the same time, he also announced that Ferenczi would write a review of the work. This prompted Jung to compose an angry letter.<sup>94</sup> A few more emotional letters were exchanged between them until 3 January, when Freud proposed to end their personal correspondence.<sup>95</sup> After January 1913, their correspondence consisted only of a few business letters from Jung to Freud concerning practical issues.

From that point onward, both men went their separate ways. Freud continued writing the last essay of *Totem and Taboo*, concerning the infantile regression of totemism, which he finished in May 1913.<sup>96</sup> Among Jung's letters, there is also a part of his correspondence with R. Loy, running from January until March 1913, concerning various psychotherapeutic problems.<sup>97</sup> Loy, who was the director of the sanatorium of Montreux, had requested Jung for more detailed information on the psychoanalytic technique. In his responses, Jung stated that psychoanalytic

---

91. See C.G. JUNG, *Memories, dreams, Reflections*, p. 157 and E. JONES, *Sigmund Freud Life and Work*, I, p. 370 and II, p. 179.

92. 328J.

93. 329F.

94. 330J.

95. 342F.

96. See footnote at 334F.

97. *Some Crucial Points in Psychoanalysis: A Correspondence between Dr Jung and Dr Loy*, in C.G. JUNG, C.W. IV, § 576-669.

treatment did not intend to bring the patient to a condition of least resistance or least displeasure. Rather, it aimed at teaching a patient to accept that he had disposal of an innate social law which every person should obey by keeping a balance between pleasure and displeasure.<sup>98</sup> Jung emphatically pointed out that the demands of culture were innate in every person.<sup>99</sup>

In August 1913, Jung went to England to present two lectures. In the first lecture, *Psycho-Analysis*,<sup>100</sup> Jung presented Freud's reductive and sexual interpretation of psychic phenomena as being in need of a complement. In many cases, the sexual contents of the unconscious were not to be interpreted literally but rather symbolically and prospectively. The desires expressed in dreams and symbols were not only infantile material nor merely instinctual remnants. Rather, they were tendencies which were to be realized in the future but which, for the time being, could only express themselves in an archaic and symbolic manner. The second lecture repeated *On Psychoanalysis* which he had given the previous year in New York.

At the congress in Munich in September 1913, Jung was re-elected as the international president by a small majority of votes. He delivered a lecture which dealt with the problem of psychological types.<sup>101</sup> We will see further in which way Jung made the mechanism of compensation the focal point of the lecture.

Freud's last essay for *Totem and Taboo*, concerning the theme of the infantile regression of totemism, appeared in the last issue of *Imago* in 1913. We do not know what Jung thought of it however because their correspondence remained silent with regard to this issue.

A rupture in their relationship could no longer be avoided. On 27 October 1913, in a very brief letter, Jung resigned his post as editor of the *Jahrbuch*. As justification for this move, he explained that he had learned from Maeder that Freud doubted his loyalty.<sup>102</sup> On 20 April 1914, Jung resigned as the president of the International Association for Psychoanalysis.<sup>103</sup> Jones claims that he resigned as a consequence of the destructive criticisms of *Transformations and Symbolisms of the Libido*

---

98. *Ibid.*, § 641-642.

99. *Ibid.*, § 668.

100. Published with the title *General Aspects of Psychoanalysis*, C.W. IV, § 523-556.

101. C.G. JUNG, *A Contribution to the Study of Psychological Types*, C.W. VI, § 858-882.

102. 357J.

103. 358J.

which had appeared in the *Internationale Zeitschrift für ärztliche Psychoanalyse*.<sup>104</sup> Strangely enough, Jung also resigned as *Privatdozent* at the University of Zurich ten days later, on 30 April.

This marked the beginning of a period which Jung himself described as his confrontation with the unconscious. During this same period, Freud continued his analysis of the 'Wolfman'. We know that this young Russian man, who for the rest of his life was known as Freud's most famous patient, began analysis in January 1910.<sup>105</sup> After much wandering, he had come to Freud with a series of real difficulties. Since childhood, he had suffered from neurosis. The case study which Freud published, discussed only this infantile neurosis.<sup>106</sup> In his introduction, Freud explained that the analysis had been stalled for a long time until he imposed a deadline upon himself for finishing the analysis. Only in the very last months of the analysis did the infantile neurosis surface and was Freud able to analyze it. We know that the Wolfman ended his treatment during Freud's summer holiday in 1914. Freud's confrontation with Jung's revision of psychoanalysis therefore coincided with the moment when the Wolfman, pressured by Freud's time constraint, allowed his infantile neurosis to be analyzed.

It is not surprising that Freud directed his attention to this infantile neurosis and hoped to investigate whether or not the Wolfman's memories could be traced back to actual events. In order to please Freud, the Wolfman searched for the book that contained a picture of a wolf which his sister had earlier used to scare him when he was a child. Freud was visibly relieved when the book was found. He could now prove that the image of a scary wolf was not a mere introspective construction in the Wolfman's fantasy. Something real had taken place in the past. Freud proceeded to date the primordial scene as accurately as possible. Although ultimately, he considered it unlikely that such early perceptions existed, he intended to present as still plausible the fact that the Wolfman, as a child between the ages of one and one and a half, had witnessed his parents having sexual intercourse. According to Freud, the roots of neurosis had to lie in the past. While he was analyzing the Wolfman, Freud was also looking for proof that Jung was wrong and that neurotic fantasies about an erotic childhood were not the retrospective con-

---

104. E. JONES, *Sigmund Freud Life and Work*, II, p. 170.

105. See M. GARDINER (ED.), *The Wolf-Man and Sigmund Freud*, New York, 1971.

106. S. FREUD, *From the History of an Infantile Neurosis*, S.E. XVII, 1-122, G.W. XII, 27-157.

structions of an adult who had transformed his innocent memories in light of a present conflict.

The analysis of the Wolfman, however, did not lead Freud to discuss religion, although there were more than enough reasons to do so. There was a striking parallel between the Wolfman and Schreber. The latter had initially suffered from a paranoid persecution complex which had him convinced that his physician wanted to sexually abuse him. The complex developed into a religious mania which somewhat comforted Schreber. On the other hand, the Wolfman suffered terrible anxiety attacks as a child. Yet these attacks were partially resolved when he became fascinated by religion. Due to the fact that he could identify himself with Christ in his imagination, the frightening character of the father-son relationship softened. Nevertheless, religion did not offer a perfect solution since an obsessional neurosis eventually grew out of this situation. Yet it was precisely religion which made the resolution of infantile neurosis possible. The neurosis was resolved the moment when the Wolfman identified himself with his militaristic tutor whom he considered to be a 'real' man.

The father figure, the problematic of identification, religion.... All of the elements, frequently employed in the debate concerning religion were present here. Yet Freud did not pursue the debate. Apparently, his attention was primarily drawn to the effective impact of the past. We nevertheless re-encounter his interest in these matters in his later, important texts about religion. The crucial task for him continued to be the determination of whether or not actual facts were operative: in *Totem and Taboo*, the patricide and in *Moses and Monotheistic Religion*, the murder of Moses.

The problem of 'reality': Is this question perhaps more fundamental than those which emerge from the different 'uses' of religion? Moreover, the question seemed to be related to the question concerning the essence of the 'libido', since a belief in the existence of a primordial event had direct implications for the acceptance of infantile sexuality and of polymorphous-pervert eroticism as a human tendency and also for the manner in which culture arose. The coherence of this question was of great concern to Freud. However, Jung's criticism had affected him so deeply that he did not delve far into the immediately recognizable religious symbols such as the suffering image of Christ or the Trinity. Freud did analyze the way in which the Wolfman employed such symbols but only in the same way that he demonstrated how the tale of the seven goats became the carrier of the Wolfman's very personal wishes and fears.