University of Groningen

Educational Philosophy in the French Enlightenment

Parlevliet, Sanne

Published in:
Paedagogica Historica

DOI:
[10.1080/00309230.2012.752188](https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.752188)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2015

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Parlevliet, S. (2015). Educational Philosophy in the French Enlightenment: From Nature to Second Nature, by Natasha Gill & Child of the Enlightenment. Revolutionary Europe reflected in a childhood diary, by Arianne Baggerman and Rudolf Dekker. *Paedagogica Historica*, 51(3), 384-388.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.752188>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Educational philosophy in the French Enlightenment. From nature to second nature, by Natasha Gill, Ashgate, 2010

Sanne Parlevliet

To cite this article: Sanne Parlevliet (2015) Educational philosophy in the French Enlightenment. From nature to second nature, by Natasha Gill, Ashgate, 2010, Paedagogica Historica, 51:3, 384-388, DOI: [10.1080/00309230.2012.752188](https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.752188)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.752188>

Published online: 13 Dec 2012.

Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)

Article views: 70

View related articles [↗](#)

View Crossmark data [↗](#)

geführt wurden, erweitern den Kontext ebenso, wie die Ausführungen über die neologische Prägung der zeitgenössischen theologischen Diskussionen. Diese hätten sich gegenüber Orthodoxie und Pietismus bei den Landgeistlichen durchgesetzt. Schließlich erkennt die Autorin darin eine „Wechselwirkung zwischen Tendenzen einer Säkularisierung und Rechristianisierung“ (p. 419). Sie plädiert für die größere Differenzierung bei der Darstellung des Säkularisierungsprozesses, der bis ins letzte Viertel des 19. Jahrhunderts in Gang bleibt. Wohl gibt der zweite Teil wichtige Anregungen, die zur verdichteten Betrachtung des ersten Teils beitragen. Stellenweise ist aber die Kohärenz nicht deutlich genug ausgearbeitet. Es entsteht damit beim Leser der Eindruck, mehrere, voneinander losgelöste, Untersuchungen vor sich zu haben, die dennoch irgendwie zusammenhängen.

Zum Schluss bleibt die Frage danach, inwiefern Esther Berner ihre anfangs formulierten Ziele erfüllen konnte. Die Zürcher Landschulreform der 1770er Jahre wurde durchaus im Kontext lokaler Bedingungen und Motive dargestellt. Mehrheitlich wurden auch die überregionalen pädagogischen und sozialreformerischen Diskurse aufgegriffen und zusätzlich vertieft. Diese Vertiefungen, die Berner in Form diverser Kontextualisierungen vorgenommen hat, sind beeindruckend und zeugen von aufwändiger Recherchearbeit. Gerade in der Fülle der Informationen, die in Berners Buch über die 1770er Jahre aufzufinden sind, liegt aber auch ein Problem. Durch die zum Teil partikularistische Kontextualisierung verliert der Leser zuweilen die ohnehin sehr offen gehaltene Fragestellung aus den Augen. Der ausgesprochen dicht gehaltene Nominalstil, der manchmal über mehrere Teilsätze hinwegführt, kann besonders dann ermüdend wirken, wenn er auf thematische Wiederholungen trifft oder die Autorin zugleich reihenweise aus Quellen zitiert, respektive paraphrasiert. Wer sich von diesem Stil und der für eine bildungshistorische Arbeit eher störenden APA-Zitierweise nicht abschrecken lässt, findet in Esther Berners im Böhlau Verlag erschienenen Buch „Im Zeichen von Vernunft und Christentum“ ein äußerst reichhaltiges bildungshistorisches Kompendium über das vormoderne Zürcher Schulwesen, das sehr nahe am Quellentext geblieben ist.

Markus Fuchs

University of Berne

markus.fuchs@edu.unibe.ch

© 2012, Markus Fuchs

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.709658>

Educational philosophy in the French Enlightenment. From nature to second nature, by Natasha Gill, Surrey, Ashgate, 2010, 314 pp., £70.00, ISBN 978-0-7546-6289-1

Child of the Enlightenment. Revolutionary Europe reflected in a childhood diary, by Arianne Baggerman and Rudolf Dekker, Leiden, Brill, 2009, 556 pp., €107.00, ISBN 978-9-0041-7269-2

Enlightened educational ideas have long been considered direct mirrors of the progressive belief in the manipulability of man and society, faith in rationality,

freedom and progress. In *Educational Philosophy in the French Enlightenment* Natasha Gill dissects the oppositions underlying Enlightened thought in educational debate, such as the tensions between individuality and socialisation, nature and nurture, freedom and constraint. Thoroughly analysing the tracts and treatises of several educational theorists, Gill manages to shed light on the philosophical threads connecting Locke, Rousseau, Helvétius, Morelly and less well-known theorists of the eighteenth century, such as Fleury and Rollin. In doing so, she manages to nuance claims of Rousseau's originality and innovativeness by unfolding a rich landscape of philosophical crops sown by Locke and cultivated by several educational theorists preceding Rousseau, enabling him to harvest when his land was most fertile.

Although the work is confined to an analysis of the intellectual history and does not offer a social history of Enlightened educational ideas, Gill does not restrict herself to a narrow formalist approach. She relates every text very clearly to its author's conceptions in other work. Close reading and comparison with successive educational theory leads to a clear and nuanced clarification of educational ideas, sheds light on controversies that arose in later educational thought and enables her to refute selective readings.

Gill convincingly argues how recognition of the nature of the child and childhood as a distinct stage of life, and the striving for an education thus adapted to the needs of children so that they can experience it as pleasant, was not discovered (or rediscovered) by Rousseau – as has often been claimed – but was already manifest in the work of educational theorists from the early eighteenth century, as was the linking of childhood experiences to adult success and ideas about education as a means to improve mankind. Her fiery argument arouses an appetite for an inside view of the texts under study, which she satisfies by quoting illuminative parts of the works of Fleury, Rollin and De Crousaz which she shows to be representative of the late seventeenth and the early eighteenth century.

Particularly interesting are her enunciations of the shift manifested in these works towards a utilitarian education, culminating in the idea of social engineering through education and the interesting paradox of Enlightenment educational theory: the belief in its transformative power, both for individuals and society, as opposed to the fear of its power to undermine traditional hierarchies if the lower classes and women were educated to the same level as middle- and upper-class men.

Subsequently, Gill explores the ideas of mid-century educational thinkers – especially Morelly's, which she shows to be representative of the transition from education as an instrument for individual liberation to a tool for social improvement. Her connection of Morelly's ideas to Rousseau, clearly showing the numerous similarities, is particularly interesting.

Gill continues by dissecting the controversy between Helvétius and Rousseau, which pivots on their opposing views on the nature of mankind, leading to oppositional educational views: the positive versus negative education debate. Drawing on a pioneering interpretation of Rousseau's less well-known book *Emile and Sophie, ou les solitaires*, Gill not only nuances the latter's image as an educational Columbus, but also shows how he did not manage to reconcile his pedagogical goal of negative education with his social goal of designing a society in which people can live as free individuals.

Both Gill's enunciation of educational theory's influence on sensationism and social utilitarianism on reformers of the second half of the eighteenth century, leading to heavy criticism of the colleges of the Jesuits and eventually their expulsion,

and her illuminating concluding chapter on French Enlightened educational thought's influence on later thinkers and developments, clarify the tension between the conviction of education being a means of perfecting man in order to create a better society and the ideal of individualism in Enlightened educational thought.

Whereas Gill's *Educational Philosophy in the French Enlightenment* scrutinises the intellectual development of educational ideas, Baggerman's and Dekker's *Child of the Enlightenment* offers a social history of Enlightened educational ideas and ideals as reflected in the education of a boy who was carefully brought up along the lines of belief in rationality, progress and the perfectibility of mankind. This bottom-up history of Enlightened educational ideas was first published in the Netherlands in 2005. However, its sketching of the personal history of a Dutch boy against the broad panorama of European Enlightenment thought was soon recognised as deserving a wider audience, resulting in this careful translation into English by Diane Webb.

Otto van Eck (1780–1798) kept a diary from 1791 until 1797. This was not an independent diary, but part of a pedagogical project carried out by his parents. They wanted to mould their children into new citizens using new pedagogical insights and methods. Otto's diary constitutes the point of departure for an enunciation of the ideas, customs and social environment of the Dutch higher class in a tempestuous period of Dutch history which Baggerman and Dekker show to be quite internationally orientated. The educational lines along which Otto was brought up are cleverly placed within a panorama of Western European Enlightened ideas on mankind, religion and society.

Otto's diary provides an elaborate overview of the most important topics that preoccupied Enlightened thinkers. First and foremost, of course, Enlightened ideas on education are carefully worked out. Also, cultural developments reflected in cultural artifacts, such as the books that were read by Otto and his family, are discussed. Moreover, as this was a boy growing up in the elite environment of the regent class, Otto's social world is scrutinised. The regent class is presented through the people mentioned in Otto's diary, who form his expanding social horizon and represent the paradox of the elite which develops egalitarian ideas while keeping to an elitist milieu. Baggerman and Dekker offer a good balance between following the personal history of Otto's and his family's relations to the people occupying their social world and sketching a broader view of the perceptions and habits of the regent milieu.

The same strategy leads to an overview of Enlightened ideas on topics such as geography and time. Otto's lessons are connected to Rousseau's ideas on letting children explore the world, starting within their own home, and the elaboration of this by pedagogues, such as Martinet and the philanthropists. On the basis of a description of the inside and exterior of the family's country house, which included a prominently placed map of the environment, the state of cartographic science is set out, convincingly showing how maps became objects of cultural prestige. Baggerman and Dekker clarify how geography became a symbol for both economic success and the Enlightened aspiration to map the world in order to learn to understand it. Moreover, they manage to give not only an elaborate enunciation of ideas about the educational and Enlightened function of geography, but also an overview of the most important textbooks of the day, by investigating Otto's reading. The textbooks they have chosen to discuss show the discovery of the political potential of the new concept of the 'fatherland'.

This exemplifies Baggerman and Dekker's clever choice of entries into describing the life and ideology of the late eighteenth century. Another example is the watch Otto inherited from his great-grandfather, which serves as a useful symbol of the growing importance of time. It stands not only for technical progress, but also for the new ways of regulating life and trying to gain control over it. Moreover, Otto's growing awareness of the concepts of past, present and future, and the changing perception of time from cyclical to linear discussed in tandem, leads to an elaborate exposition of utopian and dystopian ideas expressed in contemporary novels and treatises. In addition, the growing interest in history as an object of study and the emergence of utopian ideas about the past is reviewed.

Great historical events, such as the Reign of Terror and the death of King Louis XVI in France, are presented through the eyes of young Otto. Belonging to a family with influential positions and contacts, Otto proves to be an interesting representative not only of a bottom-up history of Enlightenment thought, but also as the entrance to an enunciation of the political changes that the Netherlands underwent in the last decades of the eighteenth century. The trials and tribulations of Otto's family, especially his father Lambert van Eck and his uncle Pieter Paulus, enable Baggerman and Dekker to describe the turbulent period of the Batavian Revolution from an appealing personal perspective. They give a lively account of the revolution and put the ideas in the international context of Enlightenment thought. They keep track of their personal approach by repeatedly referring back to Otto's diary, although this was clearly not meant to discuss political affairs, but primarily to reflect on his own behaviour in order to become a better person. However, he did write about his father's political ideas and involvement in national politics. Thus, the battle over the right to vote, as well as debated subjects such as freedom of the press, national economics and criminal law, are discussed through accounts of Otto's father's ideas in relation to the new government regulation, and vice versa.

Some subjects are more easily connected to Otto's upbringing than others. The Enlightened perception of religion, for example, can be seen in Otto's diary, in which he writes about the sermons he listened to in church or in devotional gatherings within the family circle. His comments are an interesting combination of Christian traditional thought and Enlightened philosophy, representative of the Enlightened movement among the Reformed; this gives Baggerman and Dekker the opportunity to discuss the debate on the place of religion in society, showing how Christianity and the Enlightenment were made compatible.

However, although Baggerman and Dekker cleverly manage to connect Otto's upbringing to the broader intellectual and cultural context of Western European Enlightenment, the wide range of topics discussed sometimes suffer from somewhat superficial descriptions. Only well-known books and treatises are mentioned, with no space left for contradictory analyses of Enlightened thought. While Baggerman and Dekker often hint at a more nuanced interpretation of certain aspects, for example the 'dark side' of the Enlightened idea of the manufacturability of man and society, the panoramic approach lacks the space to elaborate on this in detail.

Consequently, *Child of the Enlightenment* is a good read and provides a richly personalised history of a Dutch Enlightened education representing Western European Enlightenment, but less so new insights into Enlightened thought. However, the original approach taken to providing a history of the Enlightenment – using the voice of a child – makes it come to life so vividly that the epilogue of the book, in which Otto's last months before he dies of tuberculosis at the age of 17 are

described through the eyes of his father, is very moving. Otto died symbolically at a time in which faith in the manipulability and improvement of man, mankind and society had started to dwindle, heralding a new era in pedagogical thought, which we may only hope to see represented in as lively a way as Baggerman and Dekker have presented the 1790s.

Sanne Parlevliet

University of Groningen, The Netherlands

s.parlevliet@rug.nl

© 2013, Sanne Parlevliet

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2012.752188>

Internationalism, National Identities, and Study Abroad. France and the United States, 1890-1970, by Walton, Whitney, Stanford, Stanford University Press, 2010, 258 pp., ISBN 9780804762533

Comment rattacher l'étude de l'internationalisme à celle des identités nationales ? Voici un ouvrage qui aborde cette question sous l'angle des échanges universitaires franco-américains. Parcourant une période de moins d'un siècle, soit de 1890 à 1970, l'auteure identifie plusieurs moments significatifs dans l'histoire de ces échanges. Selon les périodes, elle confronte entretiens téléphoniques et documents privés (lettres aux parents, journaux intimes, mémoires, rapports d'études) aux documents officiels et publications. Elle exploite également de nombreux sondages réalisés par des psychologues et des sociologues pour les institutions universitaires ou gouvernementales. Son travail comble une lacune dans l'historiographie des relations diplomatiques, notamment en réintroduisant le point de vue des « personnes ordinaires ».

Que nous apprennent les expériences des séjours d'études à l'étranger sur les relations diplomatiques entre les Etats et sur l'internationalisme ? Comment ces expériences ont-elles pu dévier des objectifs institutionnels, voire les modifier ? En réponse à ces questions, l'auteure restitue les observations des étudiants, des professeurs et des chercheurs à partir d'entretiens et d'un travail sur archives des deux côtés de l'Atlantique. En suivant les acteurs et le sens commun qu'ils emportent à l'étranger, elle étudie comment l'expérience du séjour les force à modifier leurs préconceptions.

Selon l'auteure, l'histoire des étudiants américains en Europe est inséparable de l'histoire des relations internationales entre les Etats-Unis, la France et l'Allemagne. Dans les deux dernières décennies du 19^e siècle, la France est en concurrence avec l'Allemagne pour attirer les étudiants américains, ce dont témoigne la création de nouveaux diplômes ou d'institutions, comme l'Alliance française (1883), lesquelles ont pour mission de promouvoir le système d'enseignement français et l'éducation des étrangers en France (chapitre 1). Après la Première guerre mondiale, l'Allemagne perd sa première place de pays d'accueil des universitaires et d'étudiants américains.

Cependant, la lecture des rapports des boursiers et boursières d'Autour du Monde (1898-1930) – une initiative philanthropique du banquier français Albert Kahn, précurseur peu connu des fondations philanthropiques américaines comme