University of Groningen

Fiction and common ground

Semeijn, Merel

DOI:
[10.33612/diss.177806543](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.177806543)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2021

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):
Semeijn, M. (2021). *Fiction and common ground: a workspace account*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen. <https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.177806543>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Fiction and Common Ground

A Workspace Account

Merel Semeijn

Fiction and Common Ground
A Workspace Account
Merel Semeijn 2021

This publication is part of dr. Emar Maier's Vidi project *The Language of Fiction and Imagination* (276-80-004) which is financed by the Dutch Research Council (NWO).

Cover: Leandra du Pau
Printing: Ridderprint | www.ridderprint.nl

rijksuniversiteit
 groningen

Fiction and common ground

A workspace account

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de
Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
rector magnificus prof. dr. C. Wijmenga
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties.

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op

maandag 30 augustus 2021 om 9.00 uur

door

Merel Semeijn

geboren op 27 juni 1993
te Waddinxveen

Promotor

Prof. dr. J.W. Romeijn

Copromotor

Dr. E. Maier

Beoordelingscommissie

Prof. dr. L.C. Verbrugge

Prof. dr. F. Recanati

Prof. dr. L.B.W. Geurts

Dedicated to Aletta Henriëtte Jacobs

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	The goal	1
1.1.1	The puzzles	2
1.1.2	Theoretical ingredients	4
1.2	Overview of dissertation	5
1.2.1	Summary of each chapter	5
1.2.2	How to read this dissertation	8
1.3	Previous publications	8
2	Common ground: <i>In sensu composito</i> or <i>in sensu diviso</i>	11
2.1	Introduction	11
2.2	Common ground	13
2.2.1	Common ground and assertions	13
2.2.2	Traditional definitions of common ground	14
2.3	Real-life communication	17
2.3.1	Steps towards a functional notion of common ground	18
2.3.2	Communication without acquaintance	23
2.4	Redefining common ground	28
2.4.1	Generality <i>in sensu composito</i> and <i>in sensu diviso</i>	28
2.4.2	<i>In sensu composito</i> common ground	29
2.4.3	<i>In sensu diviso</i> common ground	32
2.5	Comparison	37
2.5.1	Felicity and counterfactual success	37
2.5.2	The shy acquaintance	39
2.6	Conclusions	41
3	Unofficial common grounds	43
3.1	Introduction	43
3.2	Unofficial common grounds	45
3.3	Formalisation	47
3.3.1	Sets of propositions	47

Contents

3.3.2	Discourse representation structures	49
3.4	Two conflicting intuitions	52
3.4.1	Permanent or temporary unofficial common grounds	53
3.4.2	Fictional and parafictional discourse	53
3.4.3	Parafictional updates on unofficial common grounds	57
3.5	Conclusions and next steps	60
4	The workspace account	61
4.1	Introduction	61
4.2	Theoretical ingredients	62
4.2.1	Matravers' two stage model	62
4.2.2	The Lewisian analysis of the 'In s'-operator	65
4.3	Workspaces	68
4.4	Formalisation	72
4.4.1	Sets of propositions	72
4.4.2	Discourse representation structures	74
4.4.3	Parafictional discourse	77
4.5	Fictive opening	79
4.5.1	Picking up where we left off	79
4.5.2	Genre conventions	83
4.6	Possible extensions	84
4.6.1	Fiction about non-fictional objects	84
4.6.2	Export of fictional truth as analogical reasoning	87
4.7	Conclusions	91
5	Lies, bald-faced lies and parafictional updates	93
5.1	Introduction	93
5.2	Common ground and lying	95
5.2.1	Acceptance-based common ground	96
5.2.2	The hearer's conception of common belief	97
5.2.3	Comparing the acceptance-based and psychologicistic strategies	98
5.3	Bald-faced lies	100
5.3.1	Bald-faced lies as lies	101
5.3.2	Bald-faced lies as fictional statements	104
5.4	Possible objections	106
5.4.1	Non-fictional parafictional updates	107
5.4.2	Commitments in bald-faced lie scenarios	108

5.4.3	Disagreement with a bald-faced liar	110
5.4.4	The point of fiction and bald-faced lies	112
5.4.5	Blameworthiness	113
5.5	Conclusions	114
6	The challenge of metafictional anaphora	117
6.1	Introduction	117
6.2	The desideratum posed by metafictional discourse	119
6.2.1	The problem of the wrong kind of object	119
6.2.2	Mixed discourse	120
6.3	Metafictional anaphora and accessibility	123
6.3.1	Metafictional anaphora in the workspace account	124
6.3.2	Metafictional anaphora in the unofficial common ground accounts	126
6.4	A comparison of different solutions	127
6.4.1	A descriptivist approach: A description of Frodo	127
6.4.2	Psychologistic DRT: Adjusting accessibility	129
6.4.3	Object theory: Frodo the abstract object	133
6.4.4	Dot-object theory: The different facets of Frodo	146
6.5	Conclusions and further research	152
7	The ‘In’ and ‘According to’ operators	157
7.1	Introduction	157
7.2	Semantic analysis of the ‘According to <i>s</i> ’-operator	159
7.3	The diverging behaviour of ‘In’ and ‘According to’	162
7.3.1	Fiction/non-fiction	163
7.3.2	Explicit/implicit content	166
7.3.3	Tense use	168
7.4	Outlook	172
7.4.1	Conclusions	172
7.4.2	Future research	173
8	Unreliable narration and imaginative resistance	179
8.1	Introduction	179
8.2	Workspace revision	181
8.2.1	Basic motivation	181
8.2.2	A psychologistic turn	183
8.2.3	Writers in fiction	185

Contents

8.3	Fiction updates and belief revision	186
8.3.1	Introducing belief revision	186
8.3.2	Belief revision in the DRT workspace	188
8.3.3	Cautious update	191
8.4	Interpreting fiction	194
8.4.1	Authorial Authority revisited: face value interpretation by shielding	194
8.4.2	Unreliable narrators	196
8.4.3	Imaginative resistance	199
8.5	Conclusion	204
9	Conclusions	205
10	Publieke samenvatting	207
	Bibliography	221
	Acknowledgements	223