University of Groningen

Hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis and autonomic nervous system reactivity in children prenatally exposed to maternal depression

Bleker, Laura S.; van Dammen, Lotte; Leeflang, Mariska M. G.; Limpens, Jacqueline; Roseboom, Tessa J.; de Rooij, Susanne R.

Published in:
Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews

DOI:
[10.1016/j.neubiorev.2018.05.033](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2018.05.033)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2020

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Bleker, L. S., van Dammen, L., Leeflang, M. M. G., Limpens, J., Roseboom, T. J., & de Rooij, S. R. (2020). Hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis and autonomic nervous system reactivity in children prenatally exposed to maternal depression: A systematic review of prospective studies. *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews*, 117, 243-252. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2018.05.033>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis and autonomic nervous system reactivity in children prenatally exposed to maternal depression: A systematic review of prospective studies

Laura S. Bleker^{a,b,*}, Lotte van Dammen^{c,d}, Mariska M.G. Leeflang^e, Jacqueline Limpens^f, Tessa J. Roseboom^{a,b}, Susanne R. de Rooij^b

^a Academic Medical Centre, Departments of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

^b Academic Medical Centre, Department of Clinical Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Bioinformatics, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

^c University of Groningen - University Medical Centre Groningen, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, 9713 GZ, Groningen, The Netherlands

^d University of Groningen - University Medical Centre Groningen, Department of Epidemiology, Hanzplein 1, 9713 GZ, Groningen, The Netherlands

^e Academic Medical Centre, Department of Clinical Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Bioinformatics, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

^f Academic Medical Centre, Department of Research Support - Medical Library, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Prenatal programming
DOHaD
Hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis
Autonomic nervous system
Depression
Pregnancy

ABSTRACT

Depression is a common condition affecting up to 20% of all pregnant women, and is associated with subsequent developmental and behavioral problems in children, such as conduct disorder and ADHD. One proposed mechanism underlying these associations is modification of the fetal hypothalamic pituitary adrenal (HPA)-axis and the autonomic nervous system (ANS), resulting in altered responses to stress. This review examined the evidence regarding altered HPA-axis and ANS reactivity in children prenatally exposed to high maternal depressive symptoms. A systematic search was conducted in the electronic databases MEDLINE, EMBASE and PsycINFO, for studies published till 25 July 2017. A total of 13 studies comprising 2271 mother-infant dyads were included. None of the studies were suitable for meta-analysis. Risk of bias assessment showed low risk for four studies. Only three studies described an independent association between exposure to high maternal prenatal depressive symptoms and altered stress reactivity in children. There is limited evidence of an independent association between prenatal exposure to maternal depression and altered HPA or ANS reactivity in children.

1. Introduction

Depression has been estimated to affect up to 20% of all pregnant women (Gotlib et al., 1989). Besides being a major burden for the pregnant woman herself, the unborn child might also be affected. Women who are depressed during pregnancy more often deliver prematurely and have babies with lower birth weights (Jarde et al., 2016). Their children more often develop depression in childhood, adolescence and adulthood themselves, and exhibit more behavioral problems (O'Donnell et al., 2014; Pawlby et al., 2009; Pearson et al., 2013; Plant et al., 2015). A large cohort study found that higher prenatal depression and anxiety were associated with more attention problems in children at age 3–4, and more emotional and behavioral problems at age 10–11, independent of postnatal maternal mood (Leis et al., 2014). A similar cohort replicated these findings in 3–4 year olds, however, their results were no longer significant after correcting for maternal symptoms after

giving birth (Van Batenburg-Eddes et al., 2013). A third prospective cohort study, comprising 2296 mother-child dyads, found associations between internalizing, externalizing and total behavioral problems in children with prenatal exposure to maternal depression throughout the entire pregnancy, which was also independent of, but partly mediated by, maternal depressive symptoms after pregnancy, in early childhood at the time of child ratings (Lahti et al., 2017). Waters et al. systematically reviewed studies that investigated associations between prenatal exposure to depression and children's neuropsychological developmental outcomes, and reported that prenatal exposure to depression increased the occurrence of conduct problems and antisocial behavior. Effects on cognition were less consistent (Waters et al., 2014). Studies that have emerged in the past decade, show increased methodological validity in comparison with prior studies, using larger sample sizes and more often controlling for relevant confounding factors. They add to the growing body of evidence showing increased adverse behavioral,

* Corresponding author at: Department of Clinical Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Bioinformatics, Academic Medical Centre, University of Amsterdam, Meibergdreef 9, 1105 AZ, Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

E-mail address: l.s.bleker@amc.uva.nl (L.S. Bleker).

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2018.05.033>

Received 10 October 2017; Received in revised form 25 May 2018; Accepted 29 May 2018

Available online 23 October 2018

0149-7634/ © 2018 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

emotional and psychopathological outcomes in children prenatally exposed to several indices of stress, depression among them (Van den Bergh et al., 2017).

The underlying biological mechanisms that mediate the associations between prenatal exposure to depression and behavioral, developmental and psychopathological outcomes in children remain to be fully elucidated. One hypothesis states that depression in pregnancy leads to dysregulated reactivity to stress in the pregnant woman, which in turn affects development of the stress system of the foetus. The hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis responds to psychological or physiological stress with the production of corticotrophin-releasing hormone (CRH) from the hypothalamus, stimulating the hypophysis to produce adrenocorticotrophic hormone (ACTH), resulting in higher production of cortisol from the adrenal glands, enabling body functions to meet physical demands in response to the stressor. It has been shown that depression in adults is associated with dysregulated reactivity to stress, as reflected by increased HPA axis activity (Burke et al., 2005; Parker et al., 2003). Chronic increased HPA axis activity in depressed pregnant women may lead to desensitization of the fetal glucocorticoid receptor (GR), potentially through increased methylation of *NR3C1*, the gene encoding for the GR. The association between prenatal depressive symptoms and increased *NR3C1* methylation has been the most consistent finding in the growing body of literature on epigenetic changes through environmental exposures, and has also been linked to exaggerated cortisol stress responses in the children (Braithwaite et al., 2015; Oberlander et al., 2008; Palma-Gudiel et al., 2015). The set-point of the developing fetal HPA axis has been shown to be influenced by external stimuli and may be altered in response to dysregulated cortisol exposure as a result of maternal depression (Kapoor et al., 2006), as reflected in studies in which maternal depressive symptomatology predicted baseline and diurnal levels of cortisol in children (Ashman et al., 2002; Lundy et al., 1999). However, the association between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and children's cortisol reactivity has been less often studied, with mixed results (Brennan et al., 2008; Glover et al., 2005; Yehuda et al., 2005). Cortisol reactivity has been shown to be a relevant predictor of later life health, contributing to pathology associated with advancing age such as neurodegeneration, immune and metabolic disorders (Aguilera, 2011).

Besides the HPA axis, the autonomic nervous system (ANS) also responds to stress by exerting more rapid effects through its innervating nerves in many organ systems. The ANS consists of a sympathetic (SNS) and a parasympathetic (PNS) division, acting in opposite directions, the former stimulating the body's "fight-or-flight-response" and the latter activating the body to "rest-and-digest". Heart rate variability (HRV) is one of the most used methods to measure ANS functioning, based on interactions between the parasympathetic and the sympathetic nervous system (Zygmunt and Stanczyk, 2010). Other proximal measures of ANS activity are changes in blood pressure (BP) and heart rate (HR), respiratory sinus arrhythmia (RSA), reflecting the neural regulation of HR as a result of PNS activation (Grossman and Taylor, 2007), and salivary alpha-amylase (sAA) as a proxy for neural adrenergic stimulation and release of plasma catecholamines as a result of SNS activation (Granger et al., 2006). The HPA axis and ANS are regarded as complementary systems (Ulrich-Lai and Herman, 2009). The ANS responds within seconds after a stressor, whereas the HPA axis is involved in a more prolonged response. Adults with higher levels of depressive symptoms showed greater decrease in the magnitude of parasympathetic cardiac control during stressors and greater changes in peak HR during mental stress (Hughes and Stoney, 2000; Sheffield et al., 1998). The few studies that have addressed the association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and ANS function in children report an absence of associations, but these studies focused on basal ANS function rather than its reactivity to an induced stressor (Dierckx et al., 2009; van Dijk et al., 2012). ANS reactivity reflects adaptive responding above resting ANS function, and studies suggest that altered ANS reactivity is associated with vulnerability to

psychopathology rather than ANS dysregulation during baseline conditions (Hughes and Stoney, 2000; Sheffield et al., 1998).

The aim of this paper was to systematically review the existing literature on the association between prenatal exposure to high levels of maternal depressive symptoms and hypothalamic pituitary adrenal (HPA) axis and autonomic nervous system (ANS) stress reactivity profiles in children.

2. Method

2.1. Eligibility criteria

This systematic review followed the PRISMA guidelines for conducting and reporting systematic reviews and the protocol was registered at the international Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO) (registration number CRD42016039064, last version 20 June 2016). We used the following inclusion criteria: (1) human studies, (2) studies addressing the association between a depressive disorder or symptoms of depression prospectively assessed during pregnancy and response of the stress system in children, in terms of the HPA axis or the ANS, to an induced stressor. Exclusion criteria were: (1) studies in which symptoms of depression were retrospectively assessed after childbirth, (2) studies in which no induced stressor was used to assess stress reactivity, and (3) studies that included solely cumulative measures of stress including depression among other psychosocial stressors or mood symptoms such as anxiety or parenting hassles in the statistical analysis.

2.2. Search strategy

An information specialist (JL) developed a comprehensive search in the electronic databases MEDLINE, Embase and PsycINFO from inception to 24/07/2017, using the OVID interface. The search included both free text and controlled terms (i.e. MeSH in MEDLINE). A search for pregnancy/prenatal AND child/offspring was combined with either 1. Depression and stress response or 2. Maternal stress and infant stress response. Part 2 was added to retrieve publications not explicitly mentioning depression in the abstract. The search was limited to English, German, French or Dutch language papers. The entire MEDLINE search strategy is shown in Appendix 1 in Supplementary material. On completion, citations identified in each database were imported into EndNote X7 and de-duplicated. The cited and citing references of the included studies were also screened for additional relevant publications.

2.3. Study selection

Two authors (LB and LvD) independently screened titles, abstracts and full texts of the articles, using Covidence, a web-based systematic review tool (www.covidence.org). Disagreements were resolved by consensus or a third reviewer (SdR).

2.4. Data extraction

One author extracted data (LB), of which 20% was checked by the second author (LvD). Data was extracted twice and collected separately from selected papers using Covidence. Extracted data included information on study author, year, country, study aim and design, number of participating pregnant women, gestational age when maternal depressive symptoms were assessed, maternal age, the scales used for assessing depressive symptoms, the number of participating children, children's age at baseline, the stressor used, main outcome(s) as reported in the study and covariates included in the analysis. Relevant outcomes were pre- and post-stressor indices of the HPA axis (cortisol) and the ANS (HR, SBP, DBP, RSA, and sAA).

2.5. Risk of bias

Risk of bias was assessed using the Newcastle Ottawa Scale (NOS) (Wells et al., 2009) which assesses the quality of nonrandomized cohort studies to be included in systematic reviews. Papers were scored on the domains ‘selection’, ‘comparability’ and ‘outcome’. The risk of bias was rated as ‘high risk’, ‘intermediate risk’ or ‘low risk’. The following criteria were deleted: ‘demonstration that outcome of interest was not present at the start of the study’ and ‘was follow-up long enough for outcomes to occur’, because both criteria were already taken into account in the study selection procedure and therefore did not apply to the study articles that were included in this review.

2.6. Data synthesis

Studies were assessed for homogeneity in terms of design and comparator to be included in a *meta-analysis*, and if not, qualitatively reviewed. In the qualitative synthesis, the relationships and findings both within and between the included studies were provided, in line with the guidance from the Centre for Reviews and Dissemination.

3. Results

Of the identified 1014 unique articles, 914 studies were excluded after screening of title and abstract and the full-text of 100 articles were assessed on relevance and eligibility criteria (see Fig. 1). The major reasons for exclusion were the absence of an induced stressor to measure stress reactivity and the absence of assessing antenatal depressive symptoms as an independent factor in relation to stress reactivity. After full-text assessment, 13 articles were included in the review, with a total of 2271 mother-child pairs that completed both the pre- and postnatal assessments, ranging from 58 to 272 dyads per study. Besides a broad age range in both women and children (16.9–32.8 years old in women, 1 month–15 years old in children), seven different scales were used to assess depression or depressive symptoms during pregnancy and eight different stress tests were used to induce a reaction to stress in children. Although many studies had similar outcomes, there was hardly any overlap in time-points when reactivity was measured. Because of the large heterogeneity between studies, a *meta-analysis* was

not feasible.

3.1. Characteristics of studies

A total of 13 articles were qualitatively reviewed. Characteristics of the included studies for which data were extracted, are presented in Table 1. The studies were performed between 2007 and 2017, and all were prospective cohort studies. Studies either divided women into a group with high depressive symptoms versus a group with low depressive symptoms during pregnancy and compared means of stress reactivity measures in children between both groups (Azar et al., 2007; Braithwaite et al., 2016; Easter et al., 2017; Fan et al., 2016; Laurent et al., 2011; Stroud et al., 2016; Waters et al., 2013), or used depression symptom score as a continuous measure to calculate bivariate correlations with stress reactivity measures in children (Fernandes et al., 2015; Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Sharp et al., 2012; Thomas et al., 2017; Vedhara et al., 2012). The assessments for depressive symptomatology were performed in various stages of pregnancy.

3.2. Stressors and outcomes

An overview of the outcomes is shown in Table 2. The stressors used to provoke a stress response differed greatly among the studies. Arm restraint was used in four studies, in which a research assistant gently restrained both of the child’s arms for two minutes to prevent the child from moving (Azar et al., 2007; Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Thomas et al., 2017). In three of these studies, the toy retraction task and the plastic barrier task were performed additionally, which respectively involved the child playing with a toy after which the toy was repeatedly moved outside the child’s reach and returned to the child and consecutively put behind a Plexiglas barrier, to elicit frustration (Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Thomas et al., 2017). Inoculation or immunization was used as a stressor in three studies (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Easter et al., 2017; Fernandes et al., 2015). The remaining six studies all used a different stress test, including a video stress test, which involved playing stressful video games (Fan et al., 2016), the still face procedure, in which the woman denied her baby attention for a short period of time (Sharp et al., 2012), the Neonatal Intensive Care Unit (NICU) Network Behavioral Scale, a neurobehavioral examination (Stroud et al., 2016), a CO₂

Fig. 1. PRISMA Flowchart of study selection.

Table 1
Study characteristics.

Author	Year	Country	Number of pregnant women	Maternal age	Method for identifying depression ^a	Assessments (Trimester)	Number of children	Age at stress procedure
Azar	2007	USA	212	16.9	NIMH-DIS	3	212	4 m
Braithwaite	2016	UK	88	31.0	EPDS	2 & 3	71	2 m
Easter	2017	UK	117	32.1	BDI	2 & 3	91	2 m
Fan	2015	China	231	NA	HRSD	1 or 2 or 3	216	7–9 y
Fernandes	2015	India	133	21.5	EPDS (> 12) & K10 (> 3)	3	58	2 m
Laurent	2011	USA	86	24.0	CES-D (> 16)	3	86	18 m
Rash	2015	Canada	301	31.8	EPDS	2 & 3	194	6 m
Rash	2016	Canada	254	31.7	EDS	2 & 3	254	6 m
Sharp	2012	UK	316	26.8	EPDS	3	271	7 m
Stroud	2016	USA	153	26	DSM-IV & the Inventory of Depressive Symptomatology	2 & 3	153	1 m
Thomas	2017	Canada	272	32.8	EDS	1, 2 & 3	272	6 m
Vedhara	2012	UK	139	29.0	EPDS	2 & 3	139	15 y
Waters	2013	UK	332	NA	SCAN	3	257	12.8 m

^a **Abbreviations:** NIMH-DIS = National Institute of Mental Health Diagnostic Interview Schedule, E(P)DS = Edinburgh (Postnatal) Depression Scale, BDI = Beck Depression Inventory, HRSD = Hamilton Rating Scale for Depression, K10 = Kessler Psychological Distress Scale, CES-D = Centre for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale, DSM-IV = Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders version IV, SCAN = Schedules for Clinical Assessment in Neuropsychiatry.

test, involving a single breath of 35% CO₂ (Vedhara et al., 2012), the strange situation procedure, in which the child was observed playing for 20 min while caregivers and strangers entered and left the room (Laurent et al., 2011), or a picnic scenario, an eight-minute setup during which two costumed characters entered the room and encouraged the child to share plastic picnic food and dance with them (Waters et al., 2013). Although all studies included one time-point pre-stressor (“baseline measure”), this varied from two to five minutes prior to the stressor. Some studies also added, or performed exclusively, continuous measurements of the stress parameters throughout the task and calculated means.

Table 2
Stress assessments.

Author	Stressor	T1	T2	T3	T4
Azar	Arm restraint	5 min pre-stressor	20–25 min post stressor		
Braithwaite	Inoculation	Baseline	Immediately post stressor	20 min post stressor	40 min post stressor
Easter	Immunization	Immediately pre-stressor	20 min post-stressor		
Fan	Video stress test	Baseline	2 min after onset stressor	5 min after onset stressor	5 min post stressor
		Baseline	2 min after onset stressor	5 min after onset stressor	5 min post stressor
		Baseline	2 min after onset stressor	5 min after onset stressor	5 min post stressor
Fernandes	Immunization	10 min pre-stressor	20 min post-stressor		
Laurent	Strange situation	15 min pre-stressor	15 min post-stressor	30 min post-stressor	
		15 min pre-stressor	5 min post-stressor	15 min post-stressor	
Rash 2015	Toy retraction task, toy barrier & arm restraint	3 min pre-stressor	Continuously during stressor		
Rash 2016	Toy retraction task, toy barrier & arm restraint	5 min pre-stressor	15 min post-stressor		
		5 min pre-stressor	15 min post-stressor		
		3 min pre-stressor	Continuously during stressor		
Sharp	Still face procedure	During non-frustrating tasks (average of continuous measure)	Continuously during stressor		
Stroud	NICU ^a network behavioral scale	Baseline	Immediately post-stressor	20 min post-stressor	40 min post-stressor
Thomas	Toy retraction task, toy barrier & arm restraint	Baseline	20 min post-stressor		
Vedhara	CO ₂ stress test	10 measurements every minute from 5 min pre-stressor to 5 min post-stressor			
		10 measurements every minute from 5 min pre-stressor to 5 min post-stressor			
		2 min pre-stressor	10 min post-stressor	20 min post-stressor	30 min post-stressor
Waters	Teddy bear's picnic scenario	Baseline	Immediately post-stressor	25 min post-stressor	

^a NICU = Neonatal Intensive Care Unit.

3.3. Confounding factors

Confounding factors per study are listed in Table 3. Confounding factors that were included in the analyses differed between studies. In most of the studies, various potential confounding factors were explored and included in the analysis if they were associated with the predictor and the outcome measure. One study included no covariates in the final analysis, because preliminary analyses of potential confounding variables indicated that none of them influenced cortisol levels in the child (Azar et al., 2007), and two studies did not include confounding variables because only bivariate correlations were

Table 3
Summary of the results.

Author	Outcomes ^c	Confounders	Moderating and mediating factors ^a	Stressor evoked significant stress response	Association ^b
Azar	Salivary cortisol	–	–	No	–
Braithwaite	Salivary cortisol	Postpartum depression, gestational age, infant age	No interaction effect of trimester (2 nd versus 3 rd) or gender on infant cortisol reactivity	Yes	–
Easter	Salivary cortisol	–	–	Unclear	–
Fan	HR and BP	Birth weight	–	Unclear	+
Fernandes	Salivary cortisol	Birth weight, postpartum depression, infant age, infant sex, infant weight standardized for age, infant health and maternal postnatal cortisol	An interaction effect of prenatal anxiety on infant recovery HR, SBP and DBP	Unclear	+
Laurent	Salivary cortisol and sAA	Medication, eating/drinking/teeth brushing before measures, illness, sleep time, BMI, age and arrival time	An interaction effect of postnatal depression on infant cortisol reactivity	Partly	–
Rash 2015	RSA	Gestational age, gender, birth weight, behavioral state of the infant, maternal age, maternal parity, SES, maternal postpartum depression	No interaction effect of early or late maternal cortisol during pregnancy on infant RSA reactivity	Yes	–
Rash 2016	RSA, sAA and salivary cortisol	Infant birth weight	–	Yes	–
Sharp	RSA	Maternal depressing postpartum and breastfeeding	An interaction effect of maternal stroking of the baby postnatally on infant vagal withdrawal	No	–
Stroud	Salivary cortisol	Maternal education, time since feeding	No interaction effect of breastfeeding on infant vagal withdrawal An interaction effect of gender and placental <i>SLC6A4</i> gene expression on infant cortisol reactivity	Unclear	–
Thomas	Salivary cortisol	Gestational age at measuring depression, income, marital status, maternal education, ethnicity and postpartum depression	No interaction effect of placental <i>HSD11B2</i> methylation on infant cortisol reactivity A mediation effect of social support on prenatal depression, of prenatal depression on maternal-infant interaction quality, and of maternal-infant interaction quality on infant cortisol reactivity	Yes	–
Vedhara	HR, SBP and salivary cortisol	Maternal age, alcohol, smoking, birth weight, gestational age, gender, postpartum mood	An interaction effect of gender on infant SBP reactivity	Unclear	+
Waters	Salivary cortisol	The family's overall degree of social risk and for the women's lifetime caseness for anxiety disorder	No interaction effect of gender on infant cortisol reactivity. Higher order interactions were not interpreted due to small sample sizes	Yes	–

^a Described as interacting (moderator) of mediating (mediator) effects on the association between prenatal depression and stress reactivity in children.

^b Indicates whether a significant independent association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and stress reaction in the children was found, + = significant, – = non-significant.

^c Abbreviations: HR = Heart Rate, SB = Systolic Blood Pressure, DBP = Diastolic Blood Pressure, SAA = Salivary Alpha amylase, RSA = Respiratory Sinus Arrhythmia.

calculated (Easter et al., 2017; Thomas et al., 2017). Covariates included in the analyses were postnatal depressive symptoms (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2015; Sharp et al., 2012; Vedhara et al., 2012), gestational age (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012), age of the child (Braithwaite et al., 2016), gender (Fernandes et al., 2015; Rash et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012), birth weight (Fan et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012), behavioral state of the child (Rash et al., 2015), maternal age (Rash et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012), parity (Rash et al., 2015), socioeconomic status (SES) (Rash et al., 2016; Stroud et al., 2016), alcohol and smoking behavior of the women during pregnancy and early postnatally (Vedhara et al., 2012), arrival time at the lab on the day of the stress procedure (Laurent et al., 2011), breast-feeding status (Sharp et al., 2012; Stroud et al., 2016), the women's "overall degree of social risk", a 5-item social risk index that was constructed to reflect women's social circumstances, and women's lifetime caseness of anxiety disorders (Waters et al., 2014).

3.4. Prenatal depression and stress reactivity

A summary of the results of the studies is listed in Table 3. Ten studies measured cortisol levels in saliva before and after the stressor (Azar et al., 2007; Braithwaite et al., 2016; Easter et al., 2017; Fernandes et al., 2015; Laurent et al., 2011; Rash et al., 2016; Stroud et al., 2016; Thomas et al., 2017; Vedhara et al., 2012; Waters et al., 2013). Of these studies, eight did not find an independent association or correlation between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and cortisol reactivity in children (Azar et al., 2007; Braithwaite et al., 2016; Easter et al., 2017; Laurent et al., 2011; Rash et al., 2016; Stroud et al., 2016; Thomas et al., 2017; Waters et al., 2013), whereas two studies did (Fernandes et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012). Fernandes et al. found that prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptomatology was associated with high cortisol reactivity to immunization in two-month-old children from rural South India. The association was U-shaped, showing the lowest levels of reactivity in the children prenatally exposed to modest maternal depressive symptoms, and the highest levels of reactivity in the children prenatally exposed to very low and very high levels of maternal depressive symptoms (Fernandes et al., 2015). Vedhara et al. reported that prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms at 32 weeks gestational age was associated with a blunted cortisol response in children. Five studies measured the ANS, in terms of Cardiac Vagal Control (CVC) (Rash et al., 2015), RSA (Rash et al., 2016; Sharp et al., 2012), HR (Fan et al., 2016; Vedhara et al., 2012), SBP (Fan et al., 2016; Vedhara et al., 2012), DBP (Fan et al., 2016), and sAA (Laurent et al., 2011; Rash et al., 2016). Three studies reported the absence of an association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and ANS reactivity in children (Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Sharp et al., 2012), whereas two studies did show an association. Fan et al. reported that children born to women who responded positively to a depression questionnaire during pregnancy showed higher SBP reactivity and slower DBP recovery as opposed to children born to women who responded negatively to the questionnaire (Fan et al., 2016). Vedhara et al. reported that prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms at 18 weeks gestational age was associated with greater SBP reactivity and slower SBP recovery in children (Vedhara et al., 2012).

3.5. Mediation and moderation

The majority of studies examined various potential mediating and moderating factors in the association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and cortisol reactivity in children (Table 3). One study reported that women with higher social support from partners during pregnancy experienced fewer depressive symptoms. Lower self-reported depression during pregnancy was associated with higher mother-child interaction quality, which on its turn was

associated with lower child cortisol reactivity (Thomas et al., 2017). Another study found that children from women with both prenatal anxiety and depression had delayed recovery in DBP and SBP compared to children from women reporting solely anxiety or depression (Fan et al., 2016). Laurent et al. reported that children from women who shifted from low depression during pregnancy to high depression postpartum, and vice versa, showed the largest effects on HPA axis reactivity, as well as an inverse coordination of cortisol with sAA, compared to children of women with consistently high or low depressive symptoms in the perinatal period (Laurent et al., 2011). Another study showed that prenatal depression was associated with decreased vagal withdrawal only in the children that were often stroked by their mothers, whereas in children from non-stroking mothers, the association was reversed (Sharp et al., 2012). Azar et al. showed that children of average to highly over-controlling women had a significant larger increase in cortisol levels after stress compared to children from low controlling women, however, there was no significant interaction between lifetime major depression and over control (Azar et al., 2007).

3.6. Gender differences

Vedhara et al. reported that prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms was associated with higher SBP reactivity and slower recovery, only in boys (Vedhara et al., 2012). Stroud et al. could not detect an independent association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and children's cortisol reactivity, but after sample stratification for gender, an association appeared, in females only. In contrast, placental serotonin transporter gene (*SLC6A4*) expression moderated the association between prenatal depressive symptoms and cortisol reactivity, for boys only (Stroud et al., 2016). Two other studies tested for, but could not detect an interaction between offspring gender and cortisol reactivity (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Waters et al., 2013).

3.7. Risk of bias

The risk of bias for each individual study is listed in Table 4. Four studies were judged to have low risk (Azar et al., 2007; Fan et al., 2016; Sharp et al., 2012; Stroud et al., 2016), seven studies to have intermediate risk (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Fernandes et al., 2015; Laurent et al., 2011; Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Thomas et al., 2017; Vedhara et al., 2012), and two studies to have high risk of bias (Easter et al., 2017; Waters et al., 2013). Risk of bias was induced mostly because the authors did not clearly state whether the assessor of the outcome measures in the children was blinded to the women's status of depressive symptom scores during pregnancy, and because many studies used self-

Table 4
Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) quality assessment scale.

Criterion scores				
	Cohort selection (max = ***)	Cohort comparability (max = **)	Validity of outcome measure (max = **)	Overall risk of bias
Azar	**	**	**	Low
Braithwaite	*	**	*	Intermediate
Easter	*	—	—	High
Fan	**	*	**	Low
Fernandes	**	**	—	Intermediate
Laurent	*	**	*	Intermediate
Rash	**	**	—	Intermediate
Rash	**	*	*	Intermediate
Sharp	***	*	*	Low
Stroud	**	**	**	Low
Thomas	**	*	*	Intermediate
Vedhara	**	**	—	Intermediate
Waters	**	—	*	High

reported measures for prenatal depressive symptoms. Some cohorts were not representative of the general pregnant population because investigators recruited their sample from a selected population of pregnant teens (Azar et al., 2007), women with a high risk for psychopathology (Laurent et al., 2011), women with a low SES with a high percentage of unplanned pregnancies (Stroud et al., 2016) or women with eating disorders (Easter et al., 2017). Also, bias was induced due to a lack of, or indistinctness about, adjusting for postnatal depressive symptoms or birth weight (Fan et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2016; Sharp et al., 2012; Waters et al., 2013), and because follow-up rates were less than 70% (Fan et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012). Of the studies that did show an association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children, two of them were assessed to have intermediate risk (Fernandes et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012) and one to have low risk (Fan et al., 2016) of bias.

4. Discussion

In this systematic review, little evidence for an association between prenatal exposure to high levels of maternal depressive symptoms and altered HPA axis and ANS reactivity to stress in children was found. Three out of 13 studies reported significant differences, showing higher cortisol reactivity to immunization in 2-month-old children prenatally exposed to either very high or very low levels of maternal depressive symptoms (Fernandes et al., 2015), blunted HPA axis response and higher SBP reactivity with slower recovery (Vedhara et al., 2012), and higher SBP reactivity, delayed SBP and DBP recovery, and a blunted HPA axis response in children prenatally exposed to high maternal depressive symptoms (Fan et al., 2016).

In 10 studies, no clear evidence was found to support the hypothesis, showing no independent association between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children in any of these studies. Based on these results, prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms appears to be un-, or weakly related to the physiological stress response in children. However, the studies included in our review were very heterogeneous and a *meta-analysis* could not be performed.

Although the majority of studies could not detect a clear independent association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and stress responses in children, a considerable amount of studies reported that, when taking into account certain moderating or mediating factors such as postnatal depressive symptoms (Laurent et al., 2011), maternal stroking of the baby postnatally (Sharp et al., 2012), or partner support in pregnancy (Thomas et al., 2017), prenatal exposure to high levels of maternal depressive symptoms did seem to be indirectly associated with stress reactivity in children. Rash et al. examined but could not detect an early or late pregnancy depressed mood by cortisol interaction on child stress reactivity. They showed that not maternal depressive symptomatology but maternal cortisol was associated with children's stress responses. They stressed the point that other, or a combination of multiple, psychological stressors might be responsible for the increase of cortisol levels rather than depressive symptoms alone (Rash et al., 2015). Accordingly, Easter et al. showed correlations between prenatal depression, stress, eating disorder and maternal cortisol decline, suggesting that a combination of these exposures may contribute to maternal cortisol patterns, which in turn may affect child cortisol patterns (Easter et al., 2017). This suggestion was again demonstrated by Fan et al., who reported a significant delay for all cardiovascular recovery measures in children from women with both prenatal anxiety and depression compared to those experiencing solely depression or anxiety symptoms during pregnancy (Fan et al., 2016). Stroud et al. examined the moderating role of placental DNA expression or methylation in *SLC6A4* and *HSD11B2* genes respectively. For cortisol reactivity, their results showed that male foetuses expressing low *SLC6A4* gene expression in the placenta are most susceptible for effects of maternal depression on cortisol stress reactivity at one month of age

(Stroud et al., 2016). The observations from these studies all imply that the stress systems of the developing foetus might not be affected by exposure to maternal depressive symptoms in utero per se, but through a complex combination of exposure to maternal depressive symptoms, physiological changes in the pregnant women caused by objective stress not (fully) captured by depressive questionnaires (alone), in both the pre- and postnatal environment, with potential mediating effects by prenatal social support, moderating effects of epigenetic variations, gender, and reversal effects by positive postnatal behavior such as stroking of the baby and maternal-child interaction quality. A recent longitudinal study on the association of maternal depressive symptoms with child behavior up to 5 years of age that included over 17,000 children reported that concurrent maternal depression mainly affected internalizing and externalizing disorders in the child, as the contribution of prenatal depression was attenuated after correcting for familial confounding through sibling comparisons (Gjerde et al., 2017). This is also supported by animal and human studies in which effects of maternal prenatal stress on brain development in the foetus can be compensated for by postnatal care-giving factors (Bergman et al., 2008; Lemaire et al., 2006).

Nevertheless, studies that examined stress reactivity in foetuses of depressed pregnant women directly have provided evidence for an independent prenatal causal component of maternal mood on development and function of the fetal autonomic system. Pregnant women with anxiety that completed the Stroop colour-word test exhibited greater fetal heart rate (fHR) increase during stress as well as greater fHR decrease in the recovery period compared to less anxious women (Monk et al., 2011, 2004, 2003, 2000). Studies with direct fetal stress exposure through a vibroacoustic stimulus reported an increase in fHR from baseline to stimulation in depressed compared to non-depressed women (Dieter et al., 2008), and a 3.5 fold delay in return to baseline fHR after the stressor (Allister et al., 2001). Long-term follow-up of these samples would be highly insightful to further quantify the contribution of prenatal depression and anxiety in the presence or absence of protective factors in the postpartum period.

The studies included in this review had several limitations, such as a wide range in severity of maternal depressive symptoms between studies. Most studies used a screening tool to assess depressive symptoms, using a cut-off value to identify women *at risk* for a depressive disorder. In other words, of all women that were categorized as experiencing high levels of depressive symptoms during pregnancy, not everyone will or would have developed a clinical depression, potentially overestimating the amount of prenatal exposure to depressive symptoms, and concurrently, exposure to high cortisol levels of the developing foetus in these groups. Although most studies used valid cut-off values to allocate the pregnant women to the low versus the high depressive symptom group, one study used a cut-off value of 10 points on the EPDS, whilst a score of 13 is more commonly used to indicate likelihood of being clinically depressed, resulting in a sample of women with relatively 'mild' depressive symptoms. Studies that divided pregnant women in groups of low versus high levels of depressive symptoms based on screening tool cut-off values, reported percentages ranging from 0.9% (Fan et al., 2016) to 29% (Easter et al., 2017) of the sample experiencing high depressive symptoms. Five studies used the EP(D)S as a screening tool, with mean scores varying from 5.08 (Rash et al., 2015) to 8.33 points (Sharp et al., 2012). One study that did detect a significant association between prenatal exposure to high maternal EP(D)S scores and high cortisol reactivity in children reported a relatively high EP(D)S mean score of 8.07 points (Fernandes et al., 2015). However, a study with similar means for depression, did not detect such an association (Sharp et al., 2012). Only Fan et al. identified and reported women in the severely depressed range, and the trend in this study suggested a dose-dependent effect of prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms. Mild depressive symptoms may induce only mild physiological effects in the woman, for example small increases in cortisol, which are not strong enough to exert altering effects on brain

and stress system development of the foetus. This is nicely reflected by Braithwaite et al., who did not detect an association between prenatal exposure to high levels of maternal depressive symptoms and cortisol reactivity in children, but also failed to confirm an association between high maternal depressive symptoms and hypercortisolism in a sample of relatively mildly depressed women, a finding that has been confirmed in many studies examining associations between depressive symptoms in pregnant women and concurrent cortisol values (Bleker et al., 2017; Salacz et al., 2012; Shelton et al., 2015). However, the three studies included in this review that used a clinically administered interview by a health professional, and were thus able to identify women with an actual diagnosis of depressive disorder, were also unable to detect an association between prenatal exposure to a maternal depressive disorder and increased or decreased stress reactivity in children. However, these studies did not investigate associations between maternal depression and concurrent cortisol values (Azar et al., 2007; Stroud et al., 2016; Waters et al., 2013).

Another explanation for the lack of associations between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children is that differences in HPA- or ANS function due to prenatal programming may become apparent only in later life. The only study in a Western population in which an association was found included participants with a mean age of 15 years (Vedhara et al., 2012). Possibly, prenatal exposure to an adverse intrauterine environment affects compensation mechanisms, resulting in earlier ‘exhaustion’ of buffers and altered stress-reactivity only later in life. An alternative explanation for the absence of an association between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children might be that most studies measured depressive symptoms in mid-to late pregnancy, whereas some studies suggests that early pregnancy, or even the preconception period, might be the most vulnerable time-window for programming effects of maternal stress on the developing fetal brain (Kim et al., 2015; Mueller and Bale, 2007). None of the studies included in this review measured depressive symptoms exclusively in early pregnancy. The studies that did report an association between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in the children measured depressive symptomatology across all pregnancy trimesters, without specifically examining separate effect sizes according to the trimester in which the depression occurred (Fan et al., 2016; Fernandes et al., 2015; Vedhara et al., 2012).

Also, there was inconsistency across studies in terms of whether the stressor evoked a relevant response at all. Three studies that reported no main association between prenatal exposure to maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children were also unsuccessful in detecting a significant stress response in general (Azar et al., 2007; Laurent et al., 2011; Sharp et al., 2012). However, prenatal exposure to maternal depression may affect the *shape* of the response trajectory rather than its magnitude, which in case of opposite directions might cancel each other out in the whole sample (Laurent et al., 2011; Sharp et al., 2012). Nonetheless, of all studies that did substantiate a significant stress response, not one reported an association between prenatal depression and stress reactivity in children (Braithwaite et al., 2016; Rash et al., 2016, 2015; Thomas et al., 2017; Waters et al., 2013). The three studies that did observe an association between prenatal depressive symptoms and child stress reactivity, did not clearly describe whether the stressor had exerted an overall significant response to the stressor. Key psychological elements that are related to the size of the HPA axis response have been analysed in a *meta-analysis*, and a combination of social-evaluative threat and uncontrollability appeared to have the greatest impact (Dickerson and Kemeny, 2004). The Trier Social Stress Test, which includes all of these features, is widely known and validated, but used in none of the studies included in this review, because of the young age of the children. Noise exposure, emotion or pain induction has shown to induce variable HPA axis responses or no response at all (Dickerson and Kemeny, 2004). Two out of three studies that reported an association between prenatal exposure to high

maternal depressive symptoms and stress reactivity in children either used a physiological stressor, namely inhaling a single breath of 35% O₂ (Vedhara et al., 2012), or immunization, which is both a psychological and a physiological stressor (Fernandes et al., 2015), whereas of the studies that reported negative findings, eight out of 10 studies used solely (a) psychological stressor(s). Timing of assessing stress reactivity indices is also of importance, considering that the ANS responds more rapidly to stress than the HPA axis. All of the studies measured indices of either the ANS or the HPA axis at appropriate times, so this is not likely to contribute to the fact that some of the studies yielded significant results, but most did not.

It is not yet clear which mood variable has the greatest impact on cortisol regulation, and it might be that the effect of depressive symptoms (alone) on maternal cortisol dysregulation is too small to affect fetal stress regulatory systems. Depression is often comorbid with anxiety, and evidence from the literature has shown that women suffering from both depression and anxiety exhibit higher cortisol levels than women experiencing anxiety or depression alone (Evans et al., 2008). One of the included studies in our review found that prenatal anxiety in combination with depression strengthened the sole effects of depression or anxiety during pregnancy on children’s stress reactivity (Fan et al., 2016). An earlier study demonstrated that antenatal anxiety above depression was strongly associated with children’s cognitive development (Ibanez et al., 2015). Because the current review focused on depressive symptomatology, studies in which depression or depressive symptomatology was not included as an independent factor were excluded. In fact, a substantial number of articles that were excluded in the screening phase used a different definition for the term ‘stress’. The need for studies that clearly define separate mood variables is evident to be able to distinguish the influence of prenatal exposure to maternal depressive and anxiety symptoms and other measures of stress on the development of stress regulatory systems in children.

Another point of interest is gender differences. Vedhara et al. observed that the association between prenatal exposure to high depressive symptoms and SBP reactivity and recovery was restricted to males only, whereas Stroud et al. observed that females drove the association between prenatal exposure to high depressive symptoms and altered offspring cortisol reactivity. Possibly, the susceptibility for programming effects on stress-regulatory mechanisms differs according to gender. Rodent studies have shown that prenatal stress exposure selectively affects the HPA axis in the female rat (García-Cáceres et al., 2010; Weinstock et al., 1992). A study in humans showed that prenatal maternal anxiety predicted lower vagal reactivity only in boys (Zohar et al., 2011). Differences in stress reactivity profiles have been proposed to be an important risk factor for health problems that are related to a specific gender (Kajantie and Phillips, 2006). These findings might have important implications for our understanding of gender-specific physiological development and function, and why certain disorders such as anxiety occur more often in women and why men are more sensitive to trauma (Goldstein et al., 2005).

4.1. Strengths & limitations

A strength of this review was the fact that studies were systematically reviewed and assessed. However, none of the studies were feasible for *meta-analysis*. This is, above all, a limiting factor, as the true effect of high maternal depressive symptomatology during pregnancy on developing fetal stress systems remains unclear, but it also emphasizes the lack of systematic approaches in study methodology in this specific area of research. In line with recent studies that show promising improvements in this field (Van den Bergh et al., 2017), future studies should measure maternal depression, anxiety and stress as separate factors throughout all the stages of pregnancy, prior to conception and postnatally. Stress reactivity in children should be assessed in childhood, adolescence and adulthood, by examiners blinded to prenatal maternal mood. Preferably, the Trier Social Stress Test should be used,

and indices of both the HPA axis and the ANS in response to the stressors should be included.

5. Conclusion

Prenatal exposure to high depressive symptoms as an independent factor does not seem to be consistently associated with HPA axis or ANS stress reactivity in children, but high heterogeneity among studies preclude robust conclusions. Study results imply that certain factors are likely to mediate and moderate associations between prenatal exposure to high maternal depressive symptoms and HPA axis and ANS reactivity in children, such as partner support, postnatal depression and caregiving behavior postnatally.

Conflict of interest

None reported.

Funding

LB has been funded by project DynaHealth: *Understanding the Dynamic determinants of glucose homeostasis and psychological capacity to promote healthy and active ageing* under Grant Agreement no 633595 (Horizon2020). SdR was funded by the Brain & Behaviour Organization NARSAD Young Investigator Grant (Grant ID: 22795). The funding source(s) had no involvement in study design; in the collection, analysis and interpretation of data; in the writing of the report; and in the decision to submit the article for publication.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary material related to this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2018.05.033>.

References

- Aguilera, G., 2011. HPA axis responsiveness to stress: implications for healthy aging. *Exp. Gerontol.* 46, 90–95. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.exger.2010.08.023>.
- Allister, L., Lester, B.M., Carr, S., Liu, J., 2001. The effects of maternal depression on fetal heart rate response to vibroacoustic stimulation. *Dev. Neuropsychol.* 20, 639–651. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1207/S15326942DN2003.6>.
- Ashman, S.B., Dawson, G., Panagiotides, H., Yamada, E., Wilkinson, C.W., 2002. Stress hormone levels of children of depressed mothers. *Dev. Psychopathol.* 14, 333–349.
- Azar, R., Paquette, D., Zoccolillo, M., Baltzer, F., Tremblay, R.E., 2007. The association of major depression, conduct disorder, and maternal overcontrol with a failure to show a cortisol buffered response in 4-month-old infants of teenage mothers. *Biol. Psychiatry* 62, 573–579. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biopsych.2006.11.009>.
- Bergman, K., Sarkar, P., Glover, V., O'Connor, T.G., 2008. Quality of child-parent attachment moderates the impact of antenatal stress on child fearfulness. *J. Child Psychol. Psychiatry* 49, 1089–1098. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7610.2008.01987.x>.
- Bleker, L.S., Roseboom, T.J., Vrijlkotte, T.G., Reynolds, R.M., de Rooij, S.R., 2017. Determinants of cortisol during pregnancy – the ABCD cohort. *Psychoneuroendocrinology*. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2017.05.026>.
- Braithwaite, E.C., Kundakovic, M., Ramchandani, P.G., Murphy, S.E., Champagne, F.A., 2015. Maternal prenatal depressive symptoms predict infant NR3C1 1F and BDNF IV DNA methylation. *Epigenetics* 10, 408–417.
- Braithwaite, E.C., Murphy, S.E., Ramchandani, P.G., 2016. Effects of prenatal depressive symptoms on maternal and infant cortisol reactivity. *Arch. Women's Ment. Health* 19, 581–590. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00737-016-0611-y>.
- Brennan, P.A., Pargars, R., Walker, E.F., Green, P., Jeffrey Newport, D., Stowe, Z., 2008. Maternal depression and infant cortisol: influences of timing, comorbidity and treatment. *J. Child Psychol. Psychiatry* 49, 1099–1107. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7610.2008.01914.x>.
- Burke, H.M., Davis, M.C., Otte, C., Mohr, D.C., 2005. Depression and cortisol responses to psychological stress: a meta-analysis. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 30, 846–856. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2005.02.010>.
- Dickerson, S.S., Kemeny, M.E., 2004. Acute stressors and cortisol responses: a theoretical integration and synthesis of laboratory research. *Psychol. Bull.* 130, 355–391. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.130.3.355>.
- Dierckx, B., Tulen, J.H.M., van den Berg, M.P., Tharner, A., Jaddoe, V.W., Moll, H.A., Hofman, A., Verhulst, F.C., Tiemeier, H., 2009. Maternal psychopathology influences infant heart rate variability: Generation R Study. *Psychosom. Med.* 71, 313–321. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/PSY.0b013e318198a82c>.
- Dieter, J.N.I., Emory, E.K., Johnson, K.C., Raynor, B.D., 2008. Maternal depression and anxiety effects on the human fetus: preliminary findings and clinical implications. *Infant Ment. Health J.* 29, 420–441. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/imhj.20192>.
- Easter, A., Taborrelli, E., Bye, A., Zunszain, P.A., Pariante, C.M., Treasure, J., Schmidt, U., Micali, N., 2017. Perinatal hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis regulation among women with eating disorders and their infants. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 76, 127–134. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2016.11.004>.
- Evans, L.M., Myers, M.M., Monk, C., 2008. Pregnant women's cortisol is elevated with anxiety and depression – but only when comorbid. *Arch. Women's Ment. Health* 11, 239–248. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00737-008-0019-4>.
- Fan, F., Zou, Y., Tian, H., Zhang, Y., Zhang, J., Ma, X., Meng, Y., Yue, Y., Liu, K., Dart, A.M., 2016. Effects of maternal anxiety and depression during pregnancy in Chinese women on children's heart rate and blood pressure response to stress. *J. Hum. Hypertens.* 30, 171–176. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/jhh.2015.64>.
- Fernandes, M., Stein, A., Srinivasan, K., Menezes, G., Ramchandani, P.G., 2015. Foetal exposure to maternal depression predicts cortisol responses in infants: findings from rural South India. *Child Care Health Dev.* 41, 677–686. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/cch.12186>.
- García-Cáceres, C., Lagunas, N., Calmarza-Font, I., Azcoitia, I., Diz-Chaves, Y., García-Segura, L.M., Baquedano, E., Frago, L.M., Argente, J., Chowen, J.A., 2010. Gender differences in the long-term effects of chronic prenatal stress on the HPA axis and hypothalamic structure in rats. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 35, 1525–1535. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2010.05.006>.
- Gjerde, L.C., Eilertsen, E.M., Reichborn-Kjennerud, T., McAdams, T.A., Zachrisson, H.D., Zambrana, I.M., Røysamb, E., Kendler, K.S., Ystrom, E., 2017. Maternal perinatal and concurrent depressive symptoms and child behavior problems: a sibling comparison study. *J. Child Psychol. Psychiatry* 58, 779–786. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/jcpp.12704>.
- Glover, V., Miles, R., Matta, S., Modi, N., Stevenson, J., 2005. Glucocorticoid exposure in preterm babies predicts saliva cortisol response to immunization at 4 months. *Pediatr. Res.* 58, 1233–1237. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1203/01.pdr.0000185132.38209.73>.
- Goldstein, J.M., Jerram, M., Poldrack, R., Ahern, T., Kennedy, D.N., Seidman, L.J., Makris, N., 2005. Hormonal cycle modulates arousal circuitry in women using functional magnetic resonance imaging. *J. Neurosci.* 25, 9309–9316. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.2239-05.2005>.
- Gotlib, I.H., Whiffen, V.E., Mount, J.H., Milne, K., Cordy, N.I., 1989. Prevalence rates and demographic characteristics associated with depression in pregnancy and the postpartum. *J. Consult. Clin. Psychol.* 57, 269–274.
- Granger, D.A., Kivlighan, K.T., Blair, C., El-Sheikh, M., Mize, J., Lisonbee, J.A., Buckhalt, J.A., Stroud, L.R., Handwerker, K., Schwartz, E.B., 2006. Integrating the measurement of salivary α -amylase into studies of child health, development, and social relationships. *J. Soc. Pers. Relat.* 23, 267–290. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0265407506062479>.
- Grossman, P., Taylor, E.W., 2007. Toward understanding respiratory sinus arrhythmia: relations to cardiac vagal tone, evolution and biobehavioral functions. *Biol. Psychol.* 74, 263–285. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biopsycho.2005.11.014>.
- Hughes, J.W., Stoney, C.M., 2000. Depressed mood is related to high-frequency heart rate variability during stressors. *Psychosom. Med.* 62, 796–803.
- Ibanez, G., Bernard, J.Y., Rondet, C., et al., 2015. Effects of antenatal maternal depression and anxiety on children's early cognitive development: a prospective cohort study. *Tsuchiya, K.J. (Ed.), PLoS One* 10 (8), e0135849. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0135849>.
- Jarde, A., Morais, M., Kingston, D., Giallo, R., MacQueen, G.M., Giglia, L., Beyene, J., Wang, Y., McDonald, S.D., 2016. Neonatal outcomes in women with untreated antenatal depression compared with women without depression. *JAMA Psychiatry* 73, 826. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jamapsychiatry.2016.0934>.
- Kajantie, E., Phillips, D., 2006. The effects of sex and hormonal status on the physiological response to acute psychosocial stress. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 31, 151–178. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2005.07.002>.
- Kapoor, A., Dunn, E., Kostaki, A., Andrews, M.H., Matthews, S.G., 2006. Fetal programming of hypothalamo-pituitary-adrenal function: prenatal stress and glucocorticoids. *J. Physiol.* 572, 31–44. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1113/jphysiol.2006.105254>.
- Kim, D.R., Bale, T.L., Epperson, C.N., 2015. Prenatal programming of mental illness: current understanding of relationship and mechanisms. *Curr. Psychiatry Rep.* 17, 5. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11920-014-0546-9>.
- Lahti, M., Savolainen, K., Tuovinen, S., Pesonen, A.-K., Lahti, J., Heinonen, K., Hämäläinen, E., Laijuori, H., Villa, P.M., Reynolds, R.M., Kajantie, E., Räikkönen, K., 2017. Maternal depressive symptoms during and after pregnancy and psychiatric problems in children. *J. Am. Acad. Child Adolesc. Psychiatry* 56, 30–39. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jaac.2016.10.007>.
- Laurent, H.K., Ablow, J.C., Measelle, J., 2011. Risky shifts: how the timing and course of mothers' depressive symptoms across the perinatal period shape their own and infant's stress response profiles. *Dev. Psychopathol.* 23, 521–538. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0954579411000083>.
- Leis, J.A., Heron, J., Stuart, E.A., Mendelson, T., 2014. Associations between maternal mental health and child emotional and behavioral problems: does prenatal mental health matter? *J. Abnorm. Child Psychol.* 42, 161–171. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10802-013-9766-4>.
- Lemaire, V., Lamarque, S., Le Moal, M., Piazza, P.-V., Abrous, D.N., 2006. Postnatal stimulation of the pups counteracts prenatal stress-induced deficits in hippocampal neurogenesis. *Biol. Psychiatry* 59, 786–792. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biopsych.2005.11.009>.
- Lundy, B.L., Jones, N.A., Field, T., Nearing, G., Davalos, M., Pietro, P.A., Schanberg, S., Kuhn, K., 1999. Prenatal depression effects on neonates. *Infant Behav. Dev.* 22,

- 119–129. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0163-6383\(99\)80009-5](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0163-6383(99)80009-5).
- Monk, C., Fifer, W.P., Myers, M.M., Sloan, R.P., Trien, L., Hurtado, A., 2000. Maternal stress responses and anxiety during pregnancy: effects on fetal heart rate. *Dev. Psychobiol.* 36, 67–77.
- Monk, C., Myers, M.M., Sloan, R.P., Ellman, L.M., Fifer, W.P., 2003. Effects of women's stress-elicited physiological activity and chronic anxiety on fetal heart rate. *J. Dev. Behav. Pediatr.* 24, 32–38.
- Monk, C., Sloan, R.P., Myers, M.M., Ellman, L., Werner, E., Jeon, J., Tager, F., Fifer, W.P., 2004. Fetal heart rate reactivity differs by women's psychiatric status: an early marker for developmental risk? *J. Am. Acad. Child Adolesc. Psychiatry* 43, 283–290. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/00004583-200403000-00009>.
- Monk, C., Fifer, W.P., Myers, M.M., Bagiella, E., Duong, J.K., Chen, I.S., Leotti, L., Altincatal, A., 2011. Effects of maternal breathing rate, psychiatric status, and cortisol on fetal heart rate. *Dev. Psychobiol.* 53, 221–233. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/dev.20513>.
- Mueller, B.R., Bale, T.L., 2007. Early prenatal stress impact on coping strategies and learning performance is sex dependent. *Physiol. Behav.* 91, 55–65. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.physbeh.2007.01.017>.
- O'Donnell, K.J., Glover, V., Barker, E.D., O'Connor, T.G., 2014. The persisting effect of maternal mood in pregnancy on childhood psychopathology. *Dev. Psychopathol.* 26, 393–403. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0954579414000029>.
- Oberlander, T.F., Weinberg, J., Papsdorf, M., Grunau, R., Misri, S., Devlin, A.M., 2008. Prenatal exposure to maternal depression, neonatal methylation of human glucocorticoid receptor gene (NR3C1) and infant cortisol stress responses. *Epigenetics* 3, 97–106.
- Palma-Gudiel, H., Córdova-Palamera, A., Eixarch, E., Deuschle, M., Fañanás, L., 2015. Maternal psychosocial stress during pregnancy alters the epigenetic signature of the glucocorticoid receptor gene promoter in their offspring: a meta-analysis. *Epigenetics* 10, 893–902. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/15592294.2015.1088630>.
- Parker, K.J., Schatzberg, A.F., Lyons, D.M., 2003. Neuroendocrine aspects of hypercortisolism in major depression. *Horm. Behav.* 43, 60–66.
- Pawlby, S., Hay, D.F., Sharp, D., Waters, C.S., O'Keane, V., 2009. Antenatal depression predicts depression in adolescent offspring: prospective longitudinal community-based study. *J. Affect. Disord.* 113, 236–243. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2008.05.018>.
- Pearson, R.M., Evans, J., Kounali, D., Lewis, G., Heron, J., Ramchandani, P.G., O'Connor, T.G., Stein, A., 2013. Maternal depression during pregnancy and the postnatal period. *JAMA Psychiatry* 70, 1312. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jamapsychiatry.2013.2163>.
- Plant, D.T., Pariente, C.M., Sharp, D., Pawlby, S., 2015. Maternal depression during pregnancy and offspring depression in adulthood: role of child maltreatment. *Br. J. Psychiatry* 207, 213–220. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1192/bjp.bp.114.156620>.
- Rash, J.A., Campbell, T.S., Letourneau, N., Giesbrecht, G.F., 2015. Maternal cortisol during pregnancy is related to infant cardiac vagal control. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 54, 78–89. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2015.01.024>.
- Rash, J.A., Thomas, J.C., Campbell, T.S., Letourneau, N., Granger, D.A., Giesbrecht, G.F., APron Study Team, 2016. Developmental origins of infant stress reactivity profiles: a multi-system approach. *Dev. Psychobiol.* 58, 578–599. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/dev.21403>.
- Salacz, P., Csukly, G., Haller, J., Valent, S., 2012. Association between subjective feelings of distress, plasma cortisol, anxiety, and depression in pregnant women. *Eur. J. Obstet. Gynecol. Reprod. Biol.* 165, 225–230. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ejogrb.2012.08.017>.
- Sharp, H., Pickles, A., Meaney, M., Marshall, K., Tibu, F., Hill, J., 2012. Frequency of infant stroking reported by mothers moderates the effect of prenatal depression on infant behavioural and physiological outcomes. *PLoS One* 7, e45446. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0045446>.
- Sheffield, D., Krittayaphong, R., Cascio, W.E., Light, K.C., Golden, R.N., Finkel, J.B., Glekas, G., Koch, G.G., Sheps, D.S., 1998. Heart rate variability at rest and during mental stress in patients with coronary artery disease: differences in patients with high and low depression scores. *Int. J. Behav. Med.* 5, 31–47. http://dx.doi.org/10.1207/s15327558ijbm0501_3.
- Shelton, M.M., Schminkey, D.L., Groer, M.W., 2015. Relationships among prenatal depression, plasma cortisol, and inflammatory cytokines. *Biol. Res. Nurs.* 17, 295–302. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1099800414543821>.
- Stroud, L.R., Papadonatos, G.D., Parade, S.H., Salisbury, A.L., Phipps, M.G., Lester, B.M., Padbury, J.F., Marsit, C.J., 2016. Prenatal major depressive disorder, placenta glucocorticoid and serotonergic signaling, and infant cortisol response. *Psychosom. Med.* 78, 979–990. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/PSY.0000000000000410>.
- Thomas, J.C., Letourneau, N., Bryce, C.I., Campbell, T.S., Giesbrecht, G.F., APron Study Team, 2017. Biological embedding of perinatal social relationships in infant stress reactivity. *Dev. Psychobiol.* 59, 425–435. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/dev.21505>.
- Ulrich-Lai, Y.M., Herman, J.P., 2009. Neural regulation of endocrine and autonomic stress responses. *Nat. Rev. Neurosci.* 10, 397–409. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nrn2647>.
- Van Batenburg-Eddes, T., Brion, M.J., Henrichs, J., Jaddoe, V.W.V., Hofman, A., Verhulst, F.C., Lawlor, D.A., Davey Smith, G., Tiemeier, H., 2013. Parental depressive and anxiety symptoms during pregnancy and attention problems in children: a cross-cohort consistency study. *J. Child Psychol. Psychiatry* 54, 591–600. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/jcpp.12023>.
- Van den Bergh, B.R.H., van den Heuvel, M.I., Lahti, M., Braeken, M., de Rooij, S.R., Entringer, S., Hoyer, D., Roseboom, T., Räikkönen, K., King, S., Schwab, M., 2017. Prenatal developmental origins of behavior and mental health: the influence of maternal stress in pregnancy. *Neurosci. Biobehav. Rev.* <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2017.07.003>.
- van Dijk, A.E., van Eijsden, M., Stronks, K., Gemke, R.J.B.J., Vrijkotte, T.G.M., 2012. Prenatal stress and balance of the child's cardiac autonomic nervous system at age 5–6 years. *PLoS One* 7, e30413. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0030413>.
- Vedhara, K., Metcalfe, C., Brant, H., Crown, A., Northstone, K., Dawe, K., Lightman, S., Smith, G.D., 2012. Maternal mood and neuroendocrine programming: effects of time of exposure and sex. *J. Neuroendocrinol.* 24, 999–1011. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2826.2012.02309.x>.
- Waters, C.S., van Goozen, S., Phillips, R., Swift, N., Hurst, S.-L., Mundy, L., Jones, R., Jones, I., Goodyer, I., Hay, D.F., 2013. Infants at familial risk for depression show a distinct pattern of cortisol response to experimental challenge. *J. Affect. Disord.* 150, 955–960. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2013.04.054>.
- Waters, C.S., Hay, D.F., Simmonds, J.R., van Goozen, S.H.M., 2014. Antenatal depression and children's developmental outcomes: potential mechanisms and treatment options. *Eur. Child Adolesc. Psychiatry* 23, 957–971. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00787-014-0582-3>.
- Weinstock, M., Matlina, E., Maor, G.I., Rosen, H., McEwen, B.S., 1992. Prenatal stress selectively alters the reactivity of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal system in the female rat. *Brain Res.* 595, 195–200.
- Wells, G., Shea, B., O'Connell, D., Peterson, J., Welch, V., Losos, M., Tugwell, P., 2009. The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for Assessing the Quality of Nonrandomised Studies in Meta-Analyses.
- Yehuda, R., Engel, S.M., Brand, S.R., Seckl, J., Marcus, S.M., Berkowitz, G.S., 2005. Transgenerational effects of posttraumatic stress disorder in babies of mothers exposed to the world trade center attacks during pregnancy. *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.* 90, 4115–4118. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1210/jc.2005-0550>.
- Zohar, I., Weinstock, M., Feldman, R., Olson, K.L., Lagae, L., Hill, J., Webb, R.T., 2011. Differential effect of prenatal stress on the expression of corticotrophin-releasing hormone and its receptors in the hypothalamus and amygdala in male and female rats. *J. Neuroendocrinol.* 23, 320–328. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2826.2011.02117.x>.
- Zygmunt, A., Stanczyk, J., 2010. Methods of evaluation of autonomic nervous system function. *Arch. Med. Sci.* 6, 11–18. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5114/aoms.2010.13500>.