University of Groningen

Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Efriandi, Tri

DOI:
[10.33612/diss.155466640](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2021

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Efriandi, T. (2021). *Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia: Four case studies on public service provision and democratization in Papua and West Papua*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen. <https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.155466640>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Four case studies on public service provision and democratization in Papua and West Papua

Tri Efriandi

Cover design: Sukutangan | www.sukutangan.com

Layout design: Tri Efriandi

English editorial work and advice: Charlie Robinson-Jones & Priya Visavadia | www.thinkdippy.com

Dutch summary: Oscar Couwenberg

© Tri Efriandi, 2021

All rights are reserved. No parts of this thesis may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission of the author.

university of
groningen

Decentralization and the challenges of local governance in Indonesia

Four case studies on public service provision and
democratization in Papua and West Papua

PhD thesis

to obtain the degree of PhD at the
University of Groningen
on the authority of the
Rector Magnificus Prof. C. Wijmenga
and in accordance with
the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Thursday 28 January 2021 at 12.45 hours

by

Tri Efriandi

born on 11 April 1984
in Muara Enim, Indonesia

Supervisors

Prof. R.L. Holzhacker

Prof. O. Couwenberg

Assessment Committee

Prof. E.J.M.M. Arts

Prof. J.H. de Wilde

Prof. B. Setiawan

*“An educated person must learn to act justly, beginning, first of all,
with his thoughts, then later in his deeds.”*

Pramoedya Ananta Toer
This Earth of Mankind (1980)

Contents

List of tables and figures	11
Chapter 1 Introduction	13
1.1 Moving away from the center and the resurgence of local governments: an overview	15
1.2 Linking decentralization, governance, and geography	17
1.3 Understanding decentralization as a principal-agent relationship	22
1.4 Decentralization in Indonesia and the case study of Papua and West Papua	24
1.5 Research strategy and methodology	30
1.5.1 Research aims	30
1.5.2 Research question	31
1.5.3 Methodology	33
1.5.4 Case selection	34
1.5.5 Data collection	36
1.6 Thesis outline	37
References	40
Chapter 2 Decentralization and public service provision: A case study of the education sector in Jayawijaya District, Papua, Indonesia	49
Abstract	50
2.1 Introduction	51
2.2 Theoretical background	52
2.2.1 Decentralization: definition, concept and practice	52
2.2.2 Multi-level governance	55
2.2.3 Decentralization and agency problems	57
2.3 Research design	59
2.3.1 The case study of Jayawijaya district, Papua	59

2.3.2	Methodology	62
2.3.3	Social and scientific significance	64
2.4	Analysis	65
2.4.1	Uniformity of policy	65
2.4.2	The problems with incentives	69
2.4.3	Poor monitoring and the misalignment of territorial and functional structures	73
2.5	Conclusion	75
	References	77
Chapter 3	Spatial access to health care: A case study on community health centers in Asmat district, Papua, Indonesia	81
	Abstract	82
3.1	Introduction	83
3.1.1	Defining access to health care	85
3.1.2	Assessing potential spatial accessibility	85
3.2	Methods	87
3.2.1	The case study of Asmat district	87
3.2.2	Data sources	90
3.2.3	Applying the 2SFCA method	92
3.3	Results	97
3.4	Conclusion	106
	References	110
Chapter 4	Decentralization and institutional design of water governance: The case of drinking water services in Manokwari district, West Papua, Indonesia	113
	Abstract	114
4.1	Introduction	115
4.2	Theoretical background	118
4.2.1	Institutions and governance	118
4.2.2	Water governance and decentralization	119
4.2.3	Framing governance into a principal-agent approach	122

4.2.4	Institutional design as guidance for analysis: definition, distinction, and application	124
4.3	Methodology	126
4.3.1	A case study approach	126
4.3.2	Data collection and analysis	128
4.4	Drinking water governance in Indonesia	130
4.5	Analysis	132
4.5.1	Macro-level	132
4.5.2	Meso-level	139
4.5.3	Micro-level	145
4.6	Conclusion	147
	References	152
Chapter 5	Political decentralization and democratization at the periphery: An analysis of the <i>noken</i> system in Papua, Indonesia	159
	Abstract	160
5.1	Introduction	161
5.2	The <i>noken</i> system: origins and practices	163
5.3	Literature review	167
5.3.1	Political decentralization and democratic accountability	167
5.3.2	Free and fair elections: definitions and dimensions	169
5.4	Methodology	170
5.5	Analysis	171
5.5.1	Pre-election: the electoral governance of the <i>noken</i> system	171
5.5.2	On election day: voting process and liberal democratic principles	181
5.5.3	Post-election: the <i>noken</i> system and electoral conflicts	182
5.6	Discussion and conclusion	183
	References	186
Chapter 6	Conclusions and Recommendations	191
6.1	Introduction	193
6.2	Decentralization and the challenges of local governance	194

6.3	The effects of decentralization on basic public service delivery	196
6.3.1	Multi-level governance and agency problems at the local level: the evidence from Jayawijaya district	196
6.3.2	Geography and accessibility to public service in Asmat district	198
6.3.3	The design of institution and effective water governance: achieving balance when pendulum swings	199
6.4	The effects of decentralization on democratic accountability	202
6.4.1	Modern democracy and customary practice	202
6.5	Synthesis of findings and reflections to the main research question	204
6.6	Theoretical reflection	205
6.7	Policy recommendations	206
6.8	Suggestions for further research	210
	References	212

Appendices **213**

Summary **229**

English 231

Dutch 239

Bahasa Indonesia 247

Acknowledgements **255**

List of tables and figures

Tables

Table 1.1	The comparison of general autonomy and special autonomy
Table 1.2	Studies on Papua and West Papua
Table 3.1	An overview of the Asmat district
Table 3.2	Data sources for GIS analysis
Table 3.3	Spatial distribution of CHC within six distance thresholds (d_o)
Table 3.4	Mean and standard deviation of A^F score of 180 villages
Table 4.1	Excludability and rivalry of water resources
Table 4.2	The dispersion of water-related responsibilities

Figures

Figure 1.1	Map of Papua and West Papua provinces
Figure 3.1	Map of the Asmat district with CHC and village location
Figure 3.2	Operationalization of the 2SFCA method
Figure 3.2A	Spatial join of CHC
Figure 3.2B	Step 1 (CHC per population)
Figure 3.2C	Step 2 (accessibility score per village)
Figure 3.3	CHC to population ratio (R) in three CHCs ($d_o = 15$ km)
Figure 3.4	CHC to population ratio (R)
Figure 3.5	Accessibility Score (A^F) of Komor village ($d_o = 15$ km)
Figure 3.6	Number of villages in each of the six categories of A^F score
Figure 3.7	Percentage of population in each of the six categories of A^F score
Figure 5.1	The general practices of the <i>noken</i> system