University of Groningen

Essays on China's Economic History of the Late Qing Empire

Ma, Ye

DOI:
[10.33612/diss.146792235](https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.146792235)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2020

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Ma, Y. (2020). *Essays on China's Economic History of the Late Qing Empire: Historical GDP, Early Industrialisation and the Qing State's Role in Economic Development*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen, SOM research school. <https://doi.org/10.33612/diss.146792235>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Essays on China's Economic History of the Late Qing Empire

*Historical GDP, Early Industrialisation and the Qing
State's Role in Economic Development*

Ye Ma

Publisher: University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

Printer: Ipskamp Printing

©2020 Ye Ma

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system of any nature, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying or recording, without prior written permission of the publisher.

university of
 groningen

Essays on China's Economic History of the Late Qing Empire

Historical GDP, Early Industrialisation and the Qing State's Role
in Economic Development

PhD thesis

to obtain the degree of PhD at the
University of Groningen
on the authority of the
Rector Magnificus Prof. C. Wijmenga
and in accordance with
the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Thursday 10 December 2020 at 11.00 hours

by

Ye Ma

born on 28 April 1985
in Anhui, China

Supervisor

Prof. H.J. de Jong

Co-supervisor

Dr. J. Bolt

Assessment Committee

Prof. R.C. Inklaar

Prof. J.L. van Zanden

Prof. D. Ma

Contents

List of Tables	v
List of Figures.....	vii
List of Appendix Tables and Figures	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Pre-war China's economic dynamics	3
1.2 Pre-war China's economy in comparison	5
1.3 Pre-war China's institutional changes.....	7
1.4 Structure, summary and contributions of the dissertation.....	9
2 Unfolding the Turbulent Century: A Reconstruction of China's Historical National Accounts, 1840–1912	17
2.1 Introduction	17
2.2 China's growth in the literature.....	18
2.3 A new estimation of historical GDP	21
2.3.1 Agricultural production	23
2.3.2 Industrial production.....	27
2.3.3 The service sector	30
2.3.4 Real GDP and GDP per capita	32
2.4 Plausibility of the new results	33
2.5 Economic stagnation in the late Qing Empire.....	41
2.6 Conclusion.....	44
Appendix 1 Data and estimation procedures.....	46

3 Measuring China's Performance in the World Economy: A Benchmark	
Comparison between the Economies of China and the UK in the Early Twentieth Century	63
3.1 Introduction	63
3.1.1 China's path of industrialisation before the 1930s	65
3.2 The Chinese economy in the early twentieth century	66
3.2.1 GDP per capita and Economic structure.....	67
3.2.2 Manufacturing structure	69
3.2.3 Trade pattern.....	74
3.3 Calculating Purchasing Power Parities	76
3.4 Sources and data.....	78
3.4.1 The industrial census of China of the 1910s.....	79
3.4.2 Data matching and coverage.....	82
3.5 Analysing the new levels of prices, productivity and GDP	85
3.5.1 New manufacturing PPPs	85
3.5.2 Labour productivity	88
3.6 Conclusion.....	97
Appendix 1 Comparisons between the two economies ca. 1910	99
Appendix 2 Data and calculation procedures.....	102
 4 The Qing State's Influence on Early Manufacturing of the 1910s: New	
Measurements at the Provincial Level.....	107
4.1 Introduction	107
4.2 Literature and historical background.....	110
4.2.1 The Self-Strengthening Movement of 1861–95	110
4.2.2 The Qing state's investment and China's early industrialisation	113
4.3 New measurements for the Qing state's investment and factor analysis results	119
4.3.1 Data collection and indicator calculation	119
4.3.2 Factor analysis	123
4.3.3 Measuring state investment in the late Qing period: a new description....	127
4.4 The Qing state's influence on early manufacturing in the 1910s.....	134
4.4.1 Model specification	134
4.4.2 Estimation results	139

4.4.3 Robustness checks	150
4.5 Conclusion.....	156
Appendix 1 Data collection and calculation	158
1.1 New education and training.....	158
1.2 Military production and related state-owned factories	159
1.3 Telegraph and railways.....	160
Appendix 2 Summary of variables and data sources	169
Appendix 3 Regions and provinces within Qing China.....	174
 5 The State Civilian Granary System and Grain Prices in Eighteenth–Nineteenth Century China	175
5.1 Introduction	175
5.2 Price interventions and the Chinese state civilian granary system.....	176
5.2.1 An introduction to the historical background	176
5.2.2 Literature review.....	178
5.3 Data on the granary system and rice prices.....	180
5.4 Models and econometric methods.....	186
5.4.1 A conceptual framework	187
5.4.2 A regression model.....	189
5.5 Estimation results	191
5.6 Robustness checks.....	195
5.6.1 The granary system and price dispersion in a province.....	195
5.6.2 The granary system and the inland waterways.....	196
5.7 Conclusion.....	204
Appendix 1 Data and estimation procedures.....	205
 6 Conclusion and Discussion	215
6.1 Historical GDP and economic growth	215
6.2 Early industrialisation and structural change	216
6.3 The role of the Qing state in the economy	218
 References.....	221
 Nederlandse Samenvatting.....	239

List of Tables

2. 1 Historical GDP per capita estimates for China, 1800–1936	20
2. 2 Annual growth of real GDP per capita, various countries and regions, 1840–1910	40
3. 1 Economic levels and structure, China/UK, the early twentieth century	68
3. 2 Product matches and coverage ratios in comparing manufacturing industries, China/UK, 1912/1907	83
3. 3 PPPs in manufacturing, China/UK, 1912/1907	86
3. 4 Comparative labour productivity in manufacturing, China/UK, 1912/07, 1935 ..	89
3. 5 Comparative labour productivity in manufacturing, various countries, ca. 1910, 1935 (UK=100)	90
3. 6 Comparative labour productivity in manufacturing, regions of China /UK, ca. 1910	95
4. 1 The Qing state-invested programmes during the Self-Strengthening Movement	110
4. 2 Correlation matrix of the indicators for the Qing state's investment	124
4. 3 Rotated factor loading matrix and unique variance	126
4. 4 Correlations between indicators and factor scores	127
4. 5 Rankings of the top and bottom provinces in the Qing state's investment	133
4. 6 Baseline estimation results: the effects of the Qing state's investment	141
4. 7 Robustness: other indicators for industrial performance	147
4. 8 Robustness: the heavy and light industries	152
4. 9 Robustness: samples of specific industries	154
4. 10 Robustness: specific provinces excluded	155
5. 1 Baseline estimation results: the effect of granary storage and silver reserves	193
5. 2 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, the Canal/ non-Canal regions	199
5. 3 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, w.r.t. inland waterways, full sample	203

List of Figures

1. 1 Great Divergence, Little Divergence and GDP per capita estimation	7
2. 1 Estimations of per capita GDP in China, 1840–1940, in 1990 int. dollars.....	34
2. 2 The new estimation of Chinese GDP and GDP per capita, 1840–1912, constant prices, 1912=1	37
2. 3 Chinese GDP by sector, 1840–1912, current prices and prices of 1912.....	42
2. 4 Land productivity for food crops and the population/land ratio, 1840–1920, 1912=1	43
3. 1 Manufacturing structure, China, 1912, 1935, and the UK, 1907.....	71
3. 2 Manufacturing structure, regions within China, 1912, and the UK, 1907.....	72
3. 3 Export and import shares, China, 1912, 1935, and the UK, 1907	75
3. 4 Comparative labour productivity, Japan/UK, China/UK, the 1890s–1930s (UK=100).....	92
3. 5 Regions within China in ca. 1910: comparative labour productivity in manufacturing and GDP per capita.....	96
4. 1 Catell’s scree test	125
4. 2 Comparisons of factor scores: sample provinces and two periods, 1860–96 and 1860–1910.....	129
4. 3 Factor scores for the Qing state’s investment and changes in provinces, before and after 1896	130
4. 4 Regional differences in the Qing state’s investment, 1860–96 and 1860–1910.	132
4. 5 Baseline estimation results: the effects of the Qing state’s investment, before and after 1896	149
4. 6 Variations in the effects of the Qing state’s investment, before and after 1896.	150
4. 7 Robustness: the effects of the post-1896 military-related investment on the light and heavy industries.....	153
5. 1 Grain price fluctuations, rice and wheat, 1776–96, 1827–46, <i>fen</i>	183
5. 2 Rice price fluctuations and granary storage, 1776–96, 1827–46.....	184

5. 3 The correlations between rice price fluctuations and granary storage.....	186
5. 4 Understanding the relationship between the granary system and grain prices ...	187
5. 5 Baseline estimation results: the effect of granary storage on rice price fluctuation	194
5. 6 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on rice price dispersion w.r.t. distance to the Grand Canal	196
5. 7 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, the Canal/ non-Canal regions, 1786–88.....	200
5. 8 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, the non- Canal region and inland waterways, 1786–88	201

List of Appendix Tables and Figures

Tables

A 1 General overview of estimation procedures.....	48
A 2 Estimation of new mechanised production in the industrial sector in China, 1885–1920.....	56
A 3 A benchmark GDP estimation of China for 1912.....	58
A 4 Nominal and real GDP per capita in China, 1840–1912, <i>taels</i> and prices of 1912.....	60
A 5 Manufacturing structure, China, 1912, 1935 and the UK, 1907, %.....	99
A 6 Exports and imports, China, 1912, 1935, and the UK, 1907, current prices	100
A 7 Matched products and sub-industries, gross output, quantity and value, China/UK, 1912/1907	102
A 8 Gross output PPPs in manufacturing, China/UK, 1912/1907.....	104
A 9 Gross labour productivity in manufacturing, China/UK, 1912/1907.....	106
A 10 Educational institutions.....	162
A 11 Military production and related state-owned factories	163
A 12 Indicators for the Qing state's investment and calculation procedures	164
A 13 Data sources for the Qing state-invested programmes, late Qing period.....	165
A 14 New data and indicators for the Qing state's investment, ca. 1896, 1910	166
A 15 Descriptive statistics: new data and indicators	168
A 16 Factor scores estimated, representing the Qing state's investment.....	169
A 17 Descriptive statistics: variables in the regression analysis.....	170
A 18 Data sources of variables	172
A 19 Regions and provinces within Qing China	174
A 20 Descriptive statistics: grain prices and granary storage, 1776–96, 1827–46	205
A 21 Descriptive statistics: variables in the regression analysis.....	206
A 22 Baseline estimation results: rice price fluctuations and granary storage	207
A 23 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on rice price dispersion.....	208
A 24 Descriptive statistics, the sample for robustness check	209
A 25 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, the Canal/non-Canal regions	210

A 26 Robustness: the effect of granary storage on wheat price fluctuation, full sample	212
--	-----

Figures

A 1 Sectoral GDP of China, 1840–1912, output index, 1912=1	46
A 2 The new estimation of agriculture, industry, and services in China, output index, 1840–1912, 1912=1	47

Acknowledgements

This dissertation is a product of my own labour as well as of those who have supported me in years of work and study and in the challenging process of writing and revising this dissertation. Without all the help, I could not have completed this dissertation. I would like to use this opportunity to thank several people who in various ways have offered encouragement and assistance.

First of all, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors, Prof. Herman de Jong and Dr. Jutta Bolt. In the open and friendly environment created by them, I have always felt comfortable and confident to explore new research areas. I would like to thank Prof. Herman de Jong. Without his encouragement and guidance, the whole project would not have been possible. Especially, I would like to thank Dr. Jutta Bolt for helping me to go through the writing and revising process. Without her patience and support, I could not have completed the current version of this dissertation.

I would like to thank Prof. Jan Luiten van Zanden for inspiring my research in economic history from the very beginning and introducing me to the research teams at Utrecht University. I also would like to thank Prof. Robert Inklaar and Prof. Harry Wu for their comments at the early stage of my research. My gratitude particularly goes out to Dr. Bas van Leeuwen for his help on data collection. I would like to thank Prof. Debin Ma, Dr. Yi Xu, and Prof. Yuping Ni, for showing how intriguing the study of China's economic history can be. I would like to thank Prof. Kyoji Fukao, Prof. Chiaki Moriguchi and Prof. Osamu Saito for their hospitality during my visit to Hitotsubashi University.

In addition, I would like to gratefully acknowledge the financial support from the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO PhD Grants no. 022.002.003), the N.W. Posthumus Institute for Economic and Social History, and the Faculty of Economics and Business (FEB) at the University of Groningen (RuG). My gratitude also goes out to the Research School SOM for providing the administrative support and the academic setting necessary for my research and career development, and especially for helping me to complete the procedure towards my defence ceremony. A special word of thanks must go to the secretaries of SOM and FEB for

helping me, an international student, with various work-related documents at any time when I needed.

To my officemates, Javier, Ceci and Bert, and to our economic history group, especially, Ben, Daniel, Oisin, Rick and Joost: It was pleasant to work with you, to go for conferences and to travel together. I enjoyed every lunchtime and coffee break with you. I will always remember our office, Room 732.

To my roommates, Zhijun, Flo and Haoge, and to my friends at RuG and in Groningen, especially Wang Xin, Cai, Noni, Silvia, Auke and Minghui: Your company turned my days in a foreign land into one of the most treasured periods in my life.

Finally, I especially would like to thank my parents and my grandparents for their support and understanding. From now on, I hopefully have more time to spend with them.