University of Groningen

**Mexican Exodus: Emigrants, Exiles, and Refugees of the Cristero War by Julia G. Young
(review)**

Martinez, Anne M.

Published in:
Catholic historical review

DOI:
[10.1353/cat.2019.0041](https://doi.org/10.1353/cat.2019.0041)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2019

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Martinez, A. M. (2019). Mexican Exodus: Emigrants, Exiles, and Refugees of the Cristero War by Julia G. Young (review). *Catholic historical review*, 105(1), 179-180. <https://doi.org/10.1353/cat.2019.0041>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

PROJECT MUSE®

*Mexican Exodus: Emigrants, Exiles, and Refugees of the
Cristero War* by Julia G. Young (review)

Anne M. Martínez

The Catholic Historical Review, Volume 105, Number 1, Winter 2019, pp.
179-180 (Review)

Published by The Catholic University of America Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/cat.2019.0041>

➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/731177>

Mexico's *consulado* (merchant guild). Boturini obtained his archive of codices while acting as representative of merchant-*corregidores* while the Nahua were struck by the *matlazáhuatl* epidemic in Tlaxcala. The epidemic forced many Tlaxcalans to part with family heirlooms, along with property and lands, to pay their debts.

Poole did not do his homework on the historiography on Boturini and dismisses as unreliable Georgio Antei's 2007 biography of Boturini. Antei maintained that Boturini was not a noble but a commoner born in a village in the Italian Alps without offering clear documentation. Poole argues that Antei's conclusions are speculative and untrustworthy. The problem is that Antei draws on Italian publications of Pío Rajna and Enrico Besta, dating back to the 1930s, both very solidly footnoted.

Finally, Poole dismisses my own reading of Boturini's *Idea* as the beginning of a historiographical conflict between a feuding "Aragonés" party at court and the supporters of the Italian scholar in Madrid. The debate, I argued in 2001, was over the perceived technical incompetence of the Italian regarding Mexican calendrics. It was also over the sonnets and epigrams that accompanied the *Idea*. The para-text dismissed all previous "Spanish" historians, such as Garcilaso Inca de la Vega and José de Acosta, as unreliable. The Italian, his supporters alleged, was the modern equivalent of Columbus and Vespucci, a discoverer of new worlds of knowledge. The "Aragones" clique (clustered around the royal librarian Blas Antonio Nasarre) laughed and presented Boturini as a plagiarist of Vico. Poole argues that this is unlikely because the Aragonese did not participate in the conquest and administration of the Indies. This is a striking statement. Not only did conquistadors come from every town in Aragon, Corsica, Sicily, Naples, Minorca, and Mallorca (among others) but there were literally dozens of *oidores* and even a few Aragonese and Catalan viceroys in America. Two of Boturini's most important supporters in Mexico City were themselves Aragonese: José and Joaquín Codallos.

University of Texas, Austin

JORGE CAÑIZARES-ESGUERRA

Mexican Exodus: Emigrants, Exiles, and Refugees of the Cristero War. By Julia G. Young. (Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2016. Pp. xii, 271. \$82.00. ISBN 978-0-19-020500-3.)

My nonagenarian father has vivid memories of going to a "bootleg" Catholic kindergarten in the early 1930s, trying to avoid soldiers in Pénjamo, Guanajuato on his way to the house of the week, where Catholic nuns offered elicit lessons on the faith to young Mexicans in the aftermath of the Cristero War. My American-born father, whose family fled to Chicago during the Mexican Revolution in the 1910s, grew up in his mother's hometown in the Catholic heartland of Mexico. His story, like those recounted in Julia Young's *Mexico Exodus*, reveals the transnational nature of Mexican communities, and the ways Catholicism permeated the journeys abroad and returns home for many Mexicans across multiple generations.

Dr. Young writes that her primary argument is that the Cristero War had a much wider geographic impact than previously understood. Indeed, this is her

intervention in Mexican historiography. For American Catholic historians, “the transnational forms of popular activism and resistance that occurred within the Mexican emigrant diaspora” (13) are much more significant. The book describes countless failed attempts by Cristeros in exile in the United States to overthrow their government. These failures do not reduce the impact of Cristero exiles; rather they illustrate the abiding commitment to the Cristero cause despite the overwhelming odds when two governments and many of their own emigrant countrymen were against them.

Chapter 1 details the long history of Church-State conflict in Mexico. Chapter 2 brings Cristero migrants—both lay and clerical—into focus, highlighting their journeys to cities across the U.S. Southwest and Midwest. Young centers the work among Cristeros in the United States to keep pressure on the Mexican government to repeal the Calles Law in the third chapter, creating tensions within local communities and building networks of Cristero exiles across the United States. In the fourth chapter, Young considers largely unsuccessful efforts to mobilize the U.S. Catholic hierarchy and lay communities in support of the Cristero resistance. Chapter 5 outlines the lasting influence of the Cristeros in the Catholic patriotism of Mexicans like my father in the decade following the 1929 settlement between Church and state. The final chapter features the lasting resonance of the Cristero era and its martyrs for Mexicans and Mexican Americans. In the epilogue, Young displays contemporary commemorations of the Cristero era by American Catholic groups and Mexican American Catholics.

The strength of *Mexican Exodus* is the unearthing of countless stories of Mexicans in exile rallying around their faith and against their government from the United States. Though occasional glimpses of Catholic practice among early twentieth-century Mexican American communities have been captured in previous texts, they rarely mention Cristeros or political dissension around issues of religion. Young describes the tensions the Cristero War brought to these communities in vivid detail and shows that Cristeros in the United States did not just bide their time until they could return to Mexico, or settle in to established Mexican communities in the United States. They continued the fight for their faith within local communities and kept their focus—emotional, political, and financial—on removing the Calles regime from power.

The book would benefit from a thorough copy edit. In addition to wording issues here and there, for example, Francis Kelley’s surname is misspelled twice in a paragraph in which it appears three times (48). These kinds of errors detract from the narrative and make the reader wonder what other oversights there might be.

Mexican Exodus is a significant contribution to the growing historical literature on Mexican American Catholicism. Julia Young’s vital history illustrates the lived religion of Cristeros and their descendants in the United States.